Transformation: Evaluation of the role of the W&RSETA in the last 10 years and the way forward
Project 2015/12:
Transformation:
Evaluation of the role of the W&RSETA in the last 10 years and the way forward

Prepared by:
Lead researcher: Dr. Siphokazi Koyana
SIYAZITHANDA PROJECTS
Research team: Professor Roger B Mason

Wholesale and Retail Leadership Chair
Cape Peninsula University of Technology
Cape Town

“Collaboration opens the window to a world of opportunities”
Copyright, Cape Peninsula University of Technology. 2016.

Copyright for this report is held by Cape Peninsula University of Technology.

No part of this report may be published in part or in whole, reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, unless permission has been obtained from the Cape Peninsula University of Technology.

All reasonable care has been taken in collecting data and in the resultant interpretation of this data. Cape Peninsula University of Technology, the Wholesale & Retail Leadership Chair, and the author(s)/editor cannot accept liability for any direct or indirect loss that might result because of unintentional errors or omissions in the data and interpretation thereof.

The opinions and conclusions in this report are those of the author/s and the Wholesale & Retail Leadership Chair, and are not necessarily those of Cape Peninsula University of Technology.

ISBN : 978-0-9946970-0-4

This report is available online at: www.wrlc.org.za
TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ........................................................................................................... 9

CHAPTER 1 ................................................................................................................................. 11
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND ......................................................................................... 11

1.1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 11

1.2 BACKGROUND INFORMATION ......................................................................................... 11

1.2.1 LEGAL ENTITY ................................................................................................................ 12

1.3 RATIONALE FOR UNDERTAKING THE STUDY ................................................................. 13

1.3.1 RESEARCH QUESTIONS .................................................................................................. 14

1.4 W&R SECTOR PROFILE .................................................................................................... 15

1.4.1 SKILLS LEVELS IN THE W&R SECTOR ......................................................................... 15

1.4.2 OPERATIONAL MODALITY OF THE W&RSETA .......................................................... 16

1.4.3 THE W&RSETA’S NATIONAL OBLIGATIONS ................................................................. 18

1.5 METHODOLOGY ................................................................................................................ 18

1.6 THE STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT .................................................................................... 19

CHAPTER 2 ................................................................................................................................. 20
LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................................................... 20

2.1 TRANSFORMATION IN THE W&R SECTOR IN THE USA ................................................. 20

2.2 THE UK EXPERIENCE ....................................................................................................... 23

2.3 THE SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE ............................................................................. 24

2.3.1 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION ................................................................................................. 24

2.3.2 DRIVERS OF TRANSFORMATION ............................................................................... 25

2.3.3 BURSARY FUNDING .................................................................................................... 26

2.3.4 GRADUATE PLACEMENTS ............................................................................................ 27

2.3.5 DISABILITY: INTERNATIONAL REVIEW ...................................................................... 28

2.3.6 DISABILITY IN SOUTH AFRICA .................................................................................. 29

2.3.7 RURAL ENTREPRENEURSHIP IN GENERAL ............................................................... 31

2.3.8 RURAL ENTREPRENEURSHIP IN SOUTH AFRICA ..................................................... 34

2.4 CONCLUSION ...................................................................................................................... 35
CHAPTER 3 ................................................................................................................. 37
ANALYSIS OF SECONDARY DATA ON THE W&RSETA ............................................ 37
  3.1 COLLATION OF QUANTITATIVE DATA .............................................................. 37
  3.2 CHALLENGES ..................................................................................................... 38
  3.3 W&RSETA PROGRAMMES CONTRIBUTING TO TRANSFORMATION .......... 38
  3.4 ANALYSIS OF THE PERFORMANCE DATA ...................................................... 39
    3.4.1 ADULT BASIC EDUCATION TRAINING PROGRAMME ................................ 39
    3.4.2 TRAINING AND MENTORING OF YOUNG PEOPLE TO START SUSTAINABLE WHOLESALE/RETAIL VENTURES ........................................................ 42
    3.4.3 GENDER AFFIRMATIVE ACTION ............................................................... 42
    3.4.4 LEARNERSHIP PROGRAMME .................................................................... 43
    3.4.5 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION FOR THE DISABLED ............................................ 45
    3.4.6 OTHER TRANSFORMATION SUPPORTIVE ACTIVITIES ............................ 45
    3.4.7 BURSARIES AND PLACEMENT STATISTICS 2014/15 ............................ 46
    3.4.8 ANALYSIS OF SPONSORSHIP BY RACE IN SELECT PROVINCES .......... 47
    3.4.9 ANALYSIS OF SPONSORSHIP BY GENDER ............................................. 48
    3.4.10 BURSARY GRANTS BY AREAS OF RESIDENCE .................................... 49
CHAPTER 4 ..................................................................................................................... 51
METODOLOGY .............................................................................................................. 51
  4.1 SOURCES OF DATA ......................................................................................... 51
    4.1.1 PRIMARY DATA COLLECTION .................................................................... 51
    4.1.2 SECONDARY DATA COLLECTION ............................................................. 51
  4.2 DATA COLLECTION METHODOLOGY .............................................................. 52
    4.2.1 DOCUMENT REVIEWS ............................................................................. 52
    4.2.2 FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS (FGDs) ....................................................... 52
    4.2.3 IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS ........................................................................... 54
  4.3 RESPONDENT PROFILES ............................................................................... 55
  4.4 CHALLENGES ................................................................................................... 56
  4.5 DATA ANALYSIS .............................................................................................. 57
CHAPTER 5 ..................................................................................................................... 58
FINDINGS ....................................................................................................................... 58
5.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................. 58

5.2 OVERVIEW OF FINDINGS ......................................................................................... 58

5.2.1 THE BURSARY PROGRAMME .............................................................................. 59
5.2.2 THE GRADUATE PLACEMENT PROGRAMME ...................................................... - 65 -
5.2.3 THE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME ....................................................... - 66 -
5.2.4 THE DISABILITY PROGRAMME .......................................................................... 71

5.3 DETAILED FINDINGS ............................................................................................... 72

5.3.1 BURSARIES PROGRAMME (BENEFICIARIES) .................................................... 72
5.3.2 GRADUATE PLACEMENT PROGRAMME ............................................................. 77
5.3.3 THE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME ....................................................... 96
5.3.4 FINDINGS ON THE DISABILITIES PROGRAMME ............................................ 106

5.4 TRANSFORMATION IN OTHER INTERVENTIONS .............................................. 112

5.4.1 THE RETAIL MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME (RMDP) .... 112
5.4.2 THE INTERNATIONAL LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME (ILDP) 114
5.4.3 THE SOUTH AFRICAN DISABILITY DEVELOPMENT TRUST (SADDT) .... 115
5.4.4 CONCLUSION ...................................................................................................... 117

CHAPTER 6 ..................................................................................................................... 118

CONCLUSION .................................................................................................................. 118

6.1 THE BURSARY PROGRAMME .............................................................................. 120

6.1.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS: ............................................................................... 120
6.1.2 RECOMMENDATIONS: ...................................................................................... 121

6.2 THE GRADUATE PLACEMENT PROGRAMME ...................................................... 122

6.2.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS ............................................................................... 122
6.2.2 RECOMMENDATIONS: ...................................................................................... 122

6.3 THE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME ...................................................... 124

6.3.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS ............................................................................... 124
6.3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS: ...................................................................................... 125

6.4 THE DISABILITIES PROGRAMME ....................................................................... 127

6.4.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS ............................................................................... 127
6.4.2 RECOMMENDATIONS: ...................................................................................... 127

6.5 CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................... 128

BIBLIOGRAPHY ............................................................................................................. 132
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1: Trends in ABET performance 40
Figure 3.2: Skills Training Outputs by Occupation 41
Figure 3.3: Skills Training by occupation 41
Figure 3.4: Training and mentoring young people to form new business ventures 42
Figure 3.5: Employed persons in learnerships and Skills Development by gender 43
Figure 3.6: Number of workers registered for learnerships and skills development in 2012/13 44
Figure 3.7: Number of unemployed entering and completing learnership ans skills development programmes in 2012/2013 44
Figure 3.8: Disabled learners entering learnership & skills development programmes in 2012/13 45
Figure 3.9: Firms receiving grants from W&RSETA 46
Figure 3.10: Bursary recipients by employment status 47
Figure 3.11: Bursary recipients by race 48
Figure 3.12: Bursary recipients by gender 48
Figure 3.13 Bursary grants by area of residence (Rural/Urban) 49
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVE OF STUDY

The purpose of this study was to investigate the role of the W&RSETA in transformation over the past 10 years and to propose a way forward. The study focuses on four interventions that enable entry-level participation: The Bursaries Programme, the Graduate Placement Programme, the Rural Development Programme, and the Disabilities Programme. The study sought to find out what success has been achieved, i.e. the factors that led to it, and the constraints that hampered it. The study also sought to make recommendations on how the transformation process can be carried forward with more efficiency and effectiveness.

METHODOLOGY

A review of relevant international and local literature was conducted. Focus group discussions were held with bursary holders and graduate interns. Individual interviews were held with the programme managers at the head office, the human resources managers in the companies, as well as with some of the beneficiaries and skills providers. A discussion guide was administered on the various respondents for the collection of qualitative data. Quantitative data was collated from the SETA’s annual reports and from statistics provided by the programme administrators.

OVERVIEW OF FINDINGS

The findings are that these interventions play a remarkable role in transformation. They empower black, women, rural, and people with disabilities, all being individuals who were previously disadvantaged and therefore unable to participate meaningfully in the sector. All four programmes take people who would probably have remained unskilled and/or unemployed and give them structured opportunities to obtain qualifications, jobs, and business ventures in the Wholesale and Retail sector.

The Bursaries Programme creates a growing cohort of graduates who are qualified to work as professionals within the sector or elsewhere. Most beneficiaries admitted that they would not have been able to pursue a tertiary education had the SETA not funded them. However, the SETA and its relevant stakeholders need to investigate innovative mechanisms for optimising the effective implementation of this programme. The Graduate Placement Programme contributes to transformation by providing graduates beneficial work experience in the retail environment. All the graduates agreed that the opportunity to put theory into practice made them more employable within the sector and elsewhere. However, the programme could become more significant if more companies participated, mentoring was standardized, stipends were increased, and career planning was monitored. In both programmes the beneficiaries had no distinct awareness of the SETA’s role in transformation, even though they were grateful for the opportunities the SETA had provided them. Nevertheless, both programmes help establish an ever growing pool of qualified black professionals, whose presence will contribute even more to redressing historical imbalances over the next decade or so.
The learnerships of the Rural Development Programme provide unemployed rural people with no tertiary qualification an opportunity to obtain the basic yet critical skills needed to start a successful micro-enterprise. This contributes to transformation by creating skilled rural entrepreneurs, who can gradually develop thriving enterprises in their own communities. However, given the extensive poverty prevalent in most rural communities, the number of participants and stipends must be increased significantly. In addition, learners need mentoring (incubation) or exposure to more established businesses to put theory into practice and access to finance in order to grow sustainable and diverse businesses.

The Disabilities Programme contributed to transforming the sector while it was implemented. Learners obtained work experience and even permanent employment in the retail sector. This would have been almost impossible for many, as they often have to compete with able-bodied counterparts, who also tend to be generally more educated. Exposure to the retail environment gave ambitious, independent, and talented learners the desire and confidence to start their own businesses. In short, given the historical imbalances in South Africa, all four interventions are laying a solid foundation for a drastically transformed sector in the future. In good time, the rewards will be reaped when more black, women, People with Disabilities, and rural participants become influential decision makers and occupy the higher echelons of the industry. It will eventually become obsolete to claim that there are no qualified black candidates for lucrative positions in the sector. Nevertheless, in the meantime, the SETA needs to drastically increase the number of beneficiaries, raise stipends (except for bursaries), assist beneficiaries obtain higher qualifications, provide access to finance for qualifying potential entrepreneurs to become successful retailers, enhance mentorship, implement effective monitoring systems to ensure sustainability, create public awareness of and communicate its transformation agenda with all its stakeholders, and capacitate these programmes with more efficient implementation, monitoring, and evaluation systems.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 INTRODUCTION
This report focuses on four programmes to assess the role and performance of the Wholesale & Retail Sector Education and Training Authority (W&RSETA) in the transformation of the sector. Particular attention is paid to how the SETA has increased the skills levels of previously disadvantaged individuals and how it has developed their capacities to succeed in this sector of South Africa. The report responds to the need to monitor and evaluate the education and training interventions provided by the SETA for the purposes of strengthening the sector in future. It is hoped that the research study will highlight the progress that W&RSETA has made in transformation and that the evidence will be useful in future planning and decision making.

This report is submitted to the Research Unit of W&RSETA, which commissioned Siyazithanda Projects, a research consultancy based in Johannesburg.

1.2 BACKGROUND INFORMATION
The W&RSETA was established in 2000 in terms of the Skills Development Act (as amended). The public entity aims to facilitate the skills development needs of the W & R sector through the implementation of learning programmes, disbursement grants, and monitoring of education and training as outlined in the National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS). The SETA has therefore been supporting and sponsoring numerous development and capacity building programmes to increase skills levels in the sector.

The main stakeholders involved include the following:

a) Organized labour,
b) Organized employers,
c) Government departments,
d) Skills development and training providers (both public and private)
e) Professional bodies, bargaining councils, and other organizations stipulated in the ACT.
1.2.1 LEGAL ENTITY

The W&RSETA, similar to others, is a legal statutory body and an accounting authority governed by an Act of parliament. As such,

1.2.1.1 The Objectives of the W&RSETA in relation to employers

a) Assisting the employers to identifying skills needed to improve productivity and performance in the work-place;

(b) Providing employees with opportunities to acquire new skills through training or internship

(c) Utilizing work-places and facilities as training and active learning environments;

(d) Developing their capacity to manage and provide occupation-based learning;

(e) Facilitating new entrants to the labour market by providing them with opportunities to learn through exposure to work experiences during learnerships, internships, apprenticeships, and other programmes that provide learning in the work-place;

(f) Supporting occupation-based learning interventions, in line with the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (Act No. 55 of 1998);

(g) Developing appropriate partnerships with other public, private, and non-governmental organizations to promote skills development.

1.2.1.2 The Objectives of the W&RSETA in relation to employees

a) Creating an environment that encourages employees to participate in learnerships, apprenticeships, professional training, skills development, and other learning programmes;

(b) Identifying and providing learning opportunities for employees by utilizing the learning opportunities available to the sector.

(c) Providing inputs to and feedback on occupation-based learning programmes

1.2.1.3 The W&RSETA's objectives towards the government's development plans

a) To contribute towards the attainment of equitable opportunities for employment for all citizens, especially those who were excluded by the previous political system, through deliberate transformation processes
b) Contribute to the strengthening of worker performance by making South African wholesale and retail workers more competitive

c) Contributing to the identification and development of scarce skills in the industry

d) Contributing to updating the sector workers in new technologies in the industry

e) Contributing to the creation of opportunities for employment in the industry.

1.3 RATIONALE FOR UNDERTAKING THE STUDY

The rationale for undertaking the study is based on the W&RSETA’s desire to assess its performance and contribution to the transformation objective. The undertaking of the study is intended to assist the SETA to answer the question of how much transformation has been achieved in the sector and to determine whether this is enough to satisfy the political demand for strengthening the participation of the majority who were previously excluded from participation, ownership, and management in the industry. Increasing the participation of previously disadvantaged individuals (PDIs) in all industries is a major achievement demanded by the current political dispensation to create an inclusive economy. Since the liberation of the country in 1994, transformation in all sectors is a major part of the political economy of South Africa.

The skills development programmes that the SETA offers for its varied stakeholders are many. They include the following programmes, which are described on pages 51 to 63 of the SETA’s 2014/15 Annual Report:

- The International Leadership Development Programme (ILDP)
- The Retail Management Development Programme (RMDP)
- Workplace experience grants (not graduate placement internships)
- In-house skills training by companies
- The Retail Chair
- W&R Schools of Excellence
- The Informal Traders Upliftment Project
- The Capacity Building Project for Unions,
- Regional Projects (which address specific needs in various communities)
  - TVET College Retail Simulation Centres
  - Artisan Development
1.3.1 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The questions that this study intends to answer are:

• What is the level of achievement in the area of transformation within the W&R industry?
• What are the main factors that contributed to the achievements?
• What were the main constraints that hampered the achievements?
• How did the W&RSETA deal with the challenges and constraints in the attainment of set targets?
• What lessons have been learned from the process?
• How can this process be carried forward with more efficiency and effectiveness?

However, to answer the questions above, the study limits its scope to the following entry-level W&RSETA programmes, which are only a sample of those enabling the first contact with the SETA for people who have no previous retail work experience:

a) The Bursary Programme
b) The Graduate Placement Programme
c) The Rural Development Programme, and
d) The Disabilities Programme

In looking at the Theory of Change and the Intervention Logic for Transformation in the W&RSETA, the study examines the design of the four programmes to determine whether they were appropriately relevant to addressing the problem. Furthermore, going beyond the scope, the study also determines whether the implementation processes were effective and efficient, as these can amplify or diminish the SETA’s success in facilitating transformation.

In short, assuming that skills development and training are only a means to an end, to what extent was the end reached?

• What were the challenges?
• What were the factors contributing to success?
• What can be improved going forward?
Furthermore, we will limit our geographic areas to the three provinces accounting for the majority of the retail trade and employment: Gauteng, Western Cape, and KZN.

We are fully cognizant that whereas it might be easier to undertake process assessment, it is often difficult to determine outcomes of interventions due to inadequate baselines, documentation of processes, and the selection of incorrect indicators to collect data during implementation.

1.4 W&R SECTOR PROFILE

The W&RSETA oversees the skills and capacity development of a large and varied business sector covering all aspects of the wholesale and retail trade. The sector is a key player in the South African economy and contributed more than 12.5% of the Gross Domestic Product in 2014, making it the fourth largest contributing sector to the national economy (W&RSETA SSP 2013-2014 Update).

The W&R sector employs a large workforce estimated at 21% of the total workforce in the country. The 3.1 million workers are employed in different sized outlets all over the country comprising of 86% small, 9.5% medium, and 4.5% large enterprises. Among the 3.1 million employees in the industry only 67% are classified as formally employed, whereas 33% are informally employed. Gender employment ratios in the industry reflecting males at 51% and females at 49%, according to national statistics, are more or less consistent with the national demographic split (W&RSETA SSP 2013-2014 Update).

Available statistics indicate that 64% of senior management positions are occupied by white males and only 4.5% by black African males. Black African women constitute a mere 1% of senior management positions despite the fact that they form the majority at the lower echelons of employment. (W&RSETA SSP 2013 -2014 Update)

1.4.1 SKILLS LEVELS IN THE W&R SECTOR

It is estimated that a large section of the wholesale and retail sector’s workforce (50%) has no formal training, and more than 40% are semi-skilled. Only 6% are trained as professionals. The salaries in the sector are generally known to be low, partly explained by the low levels of formal education and professional qualifications. Average salaries in the sector range from median monthly average earnings of R2 750 to R15,000 per worker as compared to a national average for all industries of R3 000 to more than R20,000. There are workers in the industry who are paid a salary of R800 per month in the lower categories and more than R15 400 among the top 5% of workers. The wide disparity in salaries
between the lowest and the highest paid has been an obstacle to harmonious working relationships and carries a risk of labour disputes and unrest in the sector. (W&RSETA SSP 2013 -2014 Update)

White males consist of 64% of senior management positions and 27% of the skilled workforce in the sector, much higher than their demographic representation, where Black African, Coloured and Indians constitute about 7.5% of top management and only 43.4% of the skilled workforce (W&RSETA SSP 2013 -2014 Update).

The analysis of the workforce distribution by race and skills levels indicate a skewed distribution in favour of white males and significant minority for less privileged groups consisting of black Africans, Indians, Coloureds, and women in general, black women in particular, as well as the people with disabilities.

This study is therefore important because it assesses the extent to which the SETA has obtained successes in redressing the systematic imbalances. The study is necessary to determine how the four programmes identified are potentiating and increasing opportunities for the previously disadvantaged individuals to advance in the wholesale and retail industry through the skills development and learnership programmes.

The W&RSETA oversees, manages and executes skills development and preparation of workers and prospective workers for profitable employment in the sector. The W&RSETA programmes are expected to directly and indirectly contribute to the transformation of the sector to enable individuals from previously disadvantaged groups including women, people with disabilities (PWDs), and blacks to attain equal status in the wholesale and retail trades. Although the basic aims of the programmes are to create a skilled work force; nonetheless, the activities have implicit objectives of the transformation of the sector (W&RSETA Annual Report 2012/13).

1.4.2 OPERATIONAL MODALITY OF THE W&RSETA

The operational modality of the W&RSETA towards transformation is to provide skills development to workers and prospective workers by supporting efforts for capacity building, thus strengthening their productivity and the quality of their services.

The SETA is able to achieve capacity building of the sector through the following activities:

a) Raising of funds from stakeholders (through a skills development levy) for skills development and training in the industry;
b) Supporting and sponsoring training through the training and learnership programmes;
c) Overseeing and ensuring the quality and relevance of training programmes to respond to the identified skills, knowledge needs, and gaps in the sectors.

d) Undertaking research to identify the wholesale and retail industry gaps in skills capacity and provide evidence-based solutions to support improved performance and productivity in the work-places.

e) Establishing working relationships with training institutions, TVET colleges, and universities to provide training for skills development in the sector; and

f) Supporting and promoting prospects of employment for persons previously disadvantaged by, race, gender and physical disability by providing affirmative training opportunities to enable them to manage or own sustainable business ventures (W&SETA Annual Report 2012/13).

W&RSETA Interventions are directed at different levels of the industry and intended to create an enabling environment at the employer level to absorb as many of the trained in the skills development programmes and for those already employed to advance their skills for improved performance. In addition, the W&RSETA assists employers to identify the skills needs and gaps and to guide skills development by providing support for training. The support to skills development training is provided through SETA initiated programmes or from local EFT and university based professional and academic programmes. Where there are no local programmes the W&RSETA offers scholarships to training abroad (W&RSETA Updated Draft SSP 2011 – 2016).

Furthermore, the W&RSETA undertakes research to provide new information and knowledge, to assist organizations to identify skills needed to improve productivity and performance in the work-place; utilizes work-places and facilities as training and active learning environments and supports occupation-based learning interventions, in line with the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (Act No. 55 of 1998). This is achieved through a careful development of partnerships with various other public, private, and non-governmental organizations in promoting skills development in rural and urban areas (W&RSETA Updated Draft SSP 2011 – 2016).

The partnerships are necessary to allow the creation of an environment that enables learners and employees to participate in learnerships, apprenticeships, professional training, skills development and other learning programmes. Such partnerships allow for the Identification of learning opportunities for new entrants to the labour market and the provision of support to the learning process.
1.4.3 THE W&RSETA’S NATIONAL OBLIGATIONS

One of the main policy objectives is the expected contribution of the skills development interventions towards the equalization of opportunities for employment for all citizens, irrespective of race, gender and disability, so as to reverse the impact of the previous political dispensations. In implementing the government directive of transformation, W&RSETA faces significant challenges given that the majority of small to medium-sized enterprises are family owned and not easily amenable to translate government’s equitable employment policy in the employment of youths to reduce unemployment in the country. Other factors, such as, the shrinking economy, further contribute to the shrinking job market, despite the efforts to address the unemployment of the “not in education, employment, and training” (NEET) segment of the youth population through programmes at public TVET Colleges (W&RSETA Updated Draft SSP 2011 – 2016).

The W&RSETA’s role in the sector, therefore, is to catalyse the development of appropriate skills to potentiate employment creation within the framework of the NSDSIII, and to contribute to the creation of a “Decent Employment Agenda” for all workers in the sector where casual employment is common, thus effectively contributing to transformation.

1.5 METHODOLOGY

Our study design evaluates the Design, Implementation, and Impact of the four programmes, so as to determine the relevance, implementation efficiency, and impact of the W&RSETA’s interventions on transformation. The study consists of both qualitative and quantitative methodologies that enabled the collection of data for composite analysis. The study identified both primary and secondary data sources and developed appropriate data collection methodologies and instruments to collect data from various stakeholders in the four programmes.

Primary data collection consisted of identifying key respondents who were interviewed using in-depth questionnaires. Interviews were face-to-face or telephonic depending on the respondent’s availability. Focus group discussions were held, and direct observations were conducted during site visits. Quantitative information was also collated from statistics provided by the key informants in response to survey questions that were emailed.

Secondary data collection consisted of reviewing relevant documents on the W&RSETA’s programmes and conducting a review of international, mainly from the USA and the UK. In this regard we considered best practices in skills development to identify characteristics of
successful programmes as well as any unintended outcomes from such programmes. While we had hoped to get comparative readings from other developing countries, such literature was scarce, except regarding rural development.

1.6 THE STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT

Following this introductory chapter is a literature review (Chapter 2). That is followed by a collation and analysis of quantitative statistics from Annual Reports of the past 10 years (Chapter 3). A full description of the methodology is on Chapter 4. Our findings and recommendations are on Chapter 5, which is followed by the Conclusion.
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

The literature review undertaken was directed at finding out how transformation in general, and in the wholesale and retail sectors particularly, is being handled in other countries. In order to define the boundaries, we used the Business Dictionary.com’s definition of transformation (accessed on 20 August 2015). It defines transformation as “a process of radical change that orients an organisation in a new direction and takes it to an entirely new level of effectiveness. Unlike “turnaround” (which implies incremental progress on the same plane) transformation implies a basic change of character with little or no resemblance with the past configuration or structure.” Based on this definition we reviewed the literature both formal and grey to try to quantitate and qualify the role of W&RSETA in the transformation of the sector.

Furthermore, in order to expand our definition, we borrowed from experts, such as Aina (2010, 20) who refers to transformation as “an intentional social, political, and intellectual project of planned change aimed at addressing historical disadvantages, inequities, and serious structural dysfunctions”. Based on this statement, it appears that the need for transformation under this context is triggered by the need to bring about equity that will allow those individuals and groups excluded from participating in particular activities or development areas to do so, as is the case in South Africa.

We reviewed a number of articles from some literature on transformation in the wholesale and retail sectors in the UK and the USA. The two countries though different from South Africa, both have histories of racial and social segregation based on slavery and social class distinction, which during the period of social emancipation triggered the need for transformation to address historical inequalities. We hoped examples from these countries would give us lessons on how they have or are trying to overcome challenges of transformation in the wholesale and retail industry.

2.1 TRANSFORMATION IN THE W&R SECTOR IN THE USA

One of the major strategies adopted by the USA to advance transformation was the adoption of Affirmative Action (AA) programmes following intense pressure from the Civil Rights movement in the 1960s. AA mandated companies not only to promote social justice but also to train and promote people from historically disadvantaged groups (Greene and Kirton, 2009). However, the success of the programme was minimal due to a wide diversity of
interpretation of the laws and policies in different States in USA. In response, the Federal Government and several states passed additional anti-discrimination legislation in an attempt to overcome the entrenched systematic discrimination against black and other minority groups (e.g. Hispanics and Asian-Americans). This also proved not to be enough, according to Greene and Kirton (2009). Consequently, the Government had to establish the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOP) that enabled individuals to sue employers for non-compliance of equal employment. Companies were thus forced to implement measures to increase the representation of qualified individuals from minority groups and women. Thus a system was resorted to that gave preferential treatment on the basis of group membership, while simultaneously encouraging the setting of flexible goals that did not require companies to hire unqualified people or to hire when there were no vacancies (Greene and Kirton, 2009).

However, according to Greene and Kirton (2009), under the Reagan Administration in the 1980s, enforcement of the rule was weakened as the action was associated with the lowering of standards in the industry. These misconceptions and negative perceptions perpetuated the belief that AA was reverse racism and thus stigmatised beneficiaries and many of the gains that had been made in the 1970s were lost. Greene and Kirton (2009) note that it was in response to such hostility that EEO/AA practitioners then turned to the “business case.” While the measures were still the same as the previously advocated AA legislation, this new language about managing a diverse workforce was more business-friendly, even as the landmark Workforce 2000 report (Johnston and Packer, 1987) warned US companies that white males would not be the dominant demographic entering the workplace by 2000. This approaching “shortage” of white men served to encourage companies to recruit more Previously Disadvantaged Individuals (PDIs) in order to remain competitive.

Diversity Management practitioners thus tried to create a boundary between AA and diversity management by stressing that the later was a voluntary and internally driven company policy and not externally imposed by law. Moreover, diversity management policies seemed to focus on the individual employee and not on the entire historically under-represented group, thus making it seem more palatable to the opponents of transformation. The focus then changed from recruitment policies to issues such as pay gaps, undervaluation, flexible working patterns, and the work-life balance. Following this approach in the 1990s, diversity management then spread across the world to the UK, Australia, and other countries that had also had histories of racial, gender, and socio-economic inequality (Greene and Kirton, 2009).
Despite the socio-political challenging experiences, the USA has become an increasingly transformed nation although there are still major hurdles for many companies that still see transformation purely as a legal requirement rather than see it as a values issue—i.e. having companies that employees can be proud to work for (Whitelaw, 2015). As recently as August 2015, President Obama and lobbyists in the legal profession were putting pressure on IT companies in Silicon Valley to be more inclusive in their employment practices. Currently, whites and Asian males are by far the most represented groups in IT companies, largely due to American companies being not legally obliged to disclose the composition of their workforce; as such information is considered part of their trade secrets (Kang, 2015).

Nevertheless, some relevant lessons can be learnt from Xerox, a leading office automation company that has succeeded in making a concerted effort to hire minorities and women (Whitelaw, 2015). One of the key lessons from Xerox is that the principles of transformation and inclusion should be well-embedded in all of the business processes. The executives and senior managers must all agree that it is not only the right thing to do to balance past imbalances but that it is also good for the business. Xerox has put measures in place to regularly monitor its employees’ satisfaction index as well as review senior managers’ performance towards working with and engaging minority groups.

Another important lesson is that the promotion of affinity groups, for different minorities to meet, hold events, and discuss potential problems, helps them find strength in numbers and approach management with well-thought out strategies or solutions.

Yet another lesson from Xerox is that businesses need to put as much energy into managing diverse environments as they do into creating them, which means going beyond posters and glitzy websites to actually ensuring that the company does more than bringing a wide range of people into a homogenous corporate culture. Instead, the culture itself often has to change.

Over the decades, many of the Fortune 500 firms that try to move beyond the legally mandated minimum regarding affirmative action and anti-discrimination efforts have realised the necessity of effective transformation for their long-term prosperity. However, while gains have been made in increasing the number of white women, the promotion of people of colour, in particular, has been lagging behind. Evidently, transformation is a journey that takes commitment (Whitelaw, 2015). The lesson for South Africa from this example is that despite the need for transformation, the execution thereof is quite often a slow process, given the problem of prejudices that are internalized by the privileged groups.
2.2 THE UK EXPERIENCE

Highlighting the challenges faced by women in retail in particular, a UK study found that while many UK companies espouse both the business case (improved capacity to innovate and to respond to the requirements of a diverse client base) and the moral case (It is the right thing to do) for diversity and inclusion, many firms have nonetheless struggled to deliver on their commitment. Consequently, according to Ashley and Empson (2013) there remains a wide variation in female career progression. These researchers have identified a paradox where the needs of the industry may not be conducive or attractive to women. They argue that to attract and retain talented women, the sector would need actual structural changes, such as flexible working hours, which are in fact in direct conflict with the prevailing client service ethic. The strong client service ethic that drives most companies dictates responsiveness to client demands and expectations. In practise this is interpreted as being constantly available to the client; the ability to respond speedily to demands that are at times erratic and unpredictable; the effective and efficient turnaround of projects, often at short notice, and the provision of advice by an individual or team, that is known to, trusted by, and always available to the client. Ashley and Empson (2013) argue that the extent to which companies combine and utilise all three narratives (the business case, the moral case, and the paradox) can help to explain and predict their success in promoting gender diversity at senior levels.

These findings are supported by a UK study conducted by Broadbridge (1998), in which she concludes that whereas organizational and technological changes have altered the nature of retail management jobs, which in turn create new opportunities and barriers to career development, the reasons for a gender imbalance in retail management posts are grounded in gender and organizational analysis that upholds male values as the accepted cultural norms. Women still bear most of the burdens of family responsibilities at home, and unless the male values espoused in the workplace are challenged, it is unlikely that the current status of women in retailing will change. From a business perspective, companies need to retain and develop good quality managers and to accept change in the organizational culture by recognising that the talents of both male and female managers are required for the future success of businesses.

Broadbridge (1998) identified the centrality of providing meaningful mentoring relationships, the creation of developmental opportunities not bounded by a linear structure, and the re-examination of organisational cultural attitudes and practices as critical to transformation. Furthermore, her study also emphasised the importance of reconsidering the working
arrangements and the provision of flexible working arrangements at all levels of the management hierarchy.

2.3 THE SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE

In South Africa the transformation experience has been shaped by the legacy of apartheid, which enforced the exclusion of blacks and women from those opportunities enabling the advancement of white males. Consequently, South Africa is still suffering from a high shortage of well-qualified, competent, and experienced artisans and professionals in many sectors, including the mining sector. This explains the provision of attractive bonuses, spiralling salaries, and retention packages by mining companies to retain historically disadvantaged South Africans possessing these attributes (Engdahl and Hauki, 2001).

2.3.1 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION

Post-apartheid South Africa has, indeed, been grappling with the challenges of the inequalities that were the legacy of decades of apartheid and centuries of colonialism and patriarchy. Embedded and reflected in all spheres of social life, was the systemic exclusion of blacks and women. As a result, the implementation of transformation in all spheres continues to be the most pressing focus of the post-1994, democratic government. The vehicle that drives most of the current transformation activities in all South African industries is the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment (BBBEE) Act with its five pillars: Ownership, Management Control, Skills Development, Enterprise and Supplier Development, as well as Socio-Economic Development. The revised BBBEE Codes were gazetted by the Minister of Trade and Industry (DTI) on 11 October 2013 to be effective in Oct 2014, thereby replacing the existing BEE Codes of Good Practice.

Focusing on the mining industry in particular, a study by van Rensburg (2015) highlighted that the skills shortage will continue to be an issue as long as there is ineffective leadership for driving transformation, an inability by mining companies to identify and manage a talent pool, and a plethora of broad transformation legislation that makes it difficult to know what targets to set and report on exactly. Basing our review on the widely publicized studies on drivers of transformation in the mining industry where the pillars of transformation were found to be skills training and development support for employees, we assumed that a similar situation exists in the other industries, including the wholesale and retail sector.

In van Rensburg’s (2015) study, the entry of women in the mining industry was found to require improvements in strategies for staff retention (e.g. subsidized housing and financial
benefits for key personnel); and in challenging the patriarchal assumptions of African and older men in this historically male dominated industry. Furthermore, to qualify for suitable non-manual labour jobs in the mines, candidates need a sound knowledge of Maths and Science. Therefore, the development of basic services around the mining areas, including educational facilities, is a requirement needed to empower rural women to join in mining activities as employees. Compounding these challenges is the fact that senior personnel with the most experience in mining are white males, who often find it difficult to mentor the new entrants due to entrenched racial attitudes and the fear of losing their privileged positions. This means it takes even longer for the younger people to be promoted to those senior positions (van Rensburg, 2015).

Jansen van Rensburg argues that because the Policies, Acts, and Frameworks pertaining to mining are not properly aligned, it is difficult to know which one to apply to ensure that the mining companies are all addressing the same issues on transformation. In addition, the current talk about nationalising the mines causes uncertainty, mistrust, and suspicion between government and the mining community. The study then recommends that while initiatives undertaken to create transformation mostly focus on the recruitment, development, and retention of blacks and women; it is crucial to create a culture of inclusivity that focuses on the entire workforce, so as to establish a supportive and caring working environment that embraces diversity and change.

In contrast, in the W&R sector basic requirements for entry for women are low and do not require physical strength. Consequently, women have found it easy to join the sector despite the low salaries and long working hours. To improve these conditions, the W&R sector in South Africa offers skills development learning programmes to advance managerial and leadership levels; and skills development interventions targeting woman empowerment; as well as skills development targeting unemployed youth to enable their meaningful entry into the retail sector. Other interventions include small business supplier development programmes to facilitate business access and participation in the wholesale and retail economic value chain, support to cooperative services, and rural development skills development initiatives.

2.3.2 DRIVERS OF TRANSFORMATION

The National Skills Development Strategy III (NSDS 2011-2016) revealed that reforms in higher education institutions are often part of broader social transformation efforts. The White Paper on Higher Education (1997) identified various social purposes that higher education was intended to serve. These include the mobilisation of talent and potential through life-long learning, so as to create a knowledge-driven society with the requisite high-
level competencies for the growth and prosperity of a modern economy (DoE, 1997). In addition, the paper called for the increased participation of black, women, disabled and mature students, as well as “equity of access and fair chances of success to all…while eradicating all forms of unfair discrimination and advancing redress for past inequalities” (DoE, 1997:1.13, 1.14). All these goals could only be realised when an effective funding mechanism was developed and implemented (DoE, 1997).

Among other activities, such as curriculum changes or infrastructure development, the efforts to transform higher education institutions are often implemented by increasing the intake of students or staff members who were previously denied access to good education facilities. Analyses of post-apartheid gender and racial transformation found that numbers of graduating black doctors (Taskee, Khan and Naidoo, 2013), black dental graduates (MacMillan, Lalloo, et al., 2005), and black mining engineers (Cruise, 2011) have also increased significantly in the country, as a result of educational reforms that have been implemented over the past decade or so.

The NSDS III responds to a number of continuing challenges of education reforms to address the following: (i) the inadequate skills levels and poor work readiness of many young people leaving formal secondary and tertiary education and entering the labour market for the first time. (ii) the unemployed who lack basic numeracy and literacy, do not possess entry-level skills, and do not have the work experience and work-based training needed to enable them to seek and obtain work. (iii) the continuing skills shortages in the artisanal, technical and professional fields that are fundamental to the development and growth of the economy.

Consequently, the Strategy’s mission is to increase access to high quality and relevant education and training and skills development opportunities, including workplace learning and experience, to enable effective participation in the economy and society by all South Africans and reduce inequalities. This Strategy’s vision is the creation of a skilled and capable workforce that shares in, and contributes to, the benefits and opportunities of economic expansion and an inclusive growth path. Its purpose is to promote a skills development system that will effectively respond to labour and social needs by establishing closer links between employers, training institutions and SETAs including the W&RSETA.

2.3.3 BURSARY FUNDING

The provision of bursaries is a tool that has been used in many sectors towards meeting their transformation objectives. Information from the literature reviewed revealed that there is a direct correlation between financial assistance and tertiary completion rates. In the UK,
research evidence was examined regarding how costs, debt, and vacation work affect the participation of students from lower socio-economic backgrounds, within the context of higher education reforms. Financial issues were shown to constrain choice of institution for lower-income students, and financial problems were commonly cited as reasons for dropping out of higher education (Chester and Bekhradnia, 2008).

Locally, the review of the South African Government’s National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS) in 2010, found that the primary cause of the 48% dropout rate of students in universities was their inability to pay for accommodation, food, transport, and books. Moreover, the Rural Education Access Programme’s (REAP) 10-year Tracking Report (2010) offers more empirical evidence of the correlation between financial assistance and completion. In addition, the report reveals that the overwhelming majority of the NSFAS’ student loan beneficiaries were still highly indebted many years after completion of their studies. The affected graduates cited the indebtedness as the main reason for their inability to improve their financial status when they start working. Alston (2001) further notes that limited access to tertiary education in rural areas limits the opportunities for rural people to participate in the revitalization of their areas. Many rural young people are in danger of becoming socially excluded from global opportunities due to lack of access to the skills, resources and training needed to be competitive in a globalized economy.

Ross (2007) contends that key factors that contributed to students succeeding in their studies (a helper factor in transformation) is support to make it possible for students to complete their studies. The study concluded that despite educational challenges, even students from rural areas are able to succeed at tertiary institutions and will return to work in rural districts. Workforce skills are often the determinants of life opportunities.

In summary, where properly implemented holistic funding and relevant support interventions lead to improved completion rates among learners, which contribute to transformation.

2.3.4 GRADUATE PLACEMENTS

Graduate placements, internships, apprenticeships, and learnerships are strategies used by all the SETAs to provide experiential training for potential recruits in their industries. Graduate placements are intended to enable the transfer of learning and knowledge by providing participants with an opportunity to apply what they have learnt in the classroom to the “real world” and to work experiences that may prove useful in finding full-time employment thereafter. Callanan and Bensing (2004) observed that participating in a graduate placement programme has proven useful in the graduates’ success in their initial jobs, and employees with workplace experience earn more.
While the obvious benefits for graduates might be the enhancement of technical skills and career opportunities, the modern workplace also emphasises the importance of generic skills to communicate, analyse, solve problems, and work with others. The lack of generic work-attraction skills has been identified as one of the factors attributing to the high rate of unemployment among black graduates in South Africa.

Graduate placements have been reported to assist the host organizations screen prospective workers as they are being considered for employment. It provides them with an opportunity to achieve a better match between the skills of the graduate and the requirements of the workplace climate.

D’Abate’s (2009) study involved students who were enrolled in the Department of Management and Business in a college in the USA, and had taken an internship before completing their degrees. The results indicated that intern satisfaction was dependent on the following two factors: characteristics of the job (specifically skill variety, task significance, and feedback) and characteristics of the work environment (in particular, learning opportunities, supervisor support, and satisfaction with the organization).

There are only a few published studies evaluating internship programmes in South Africa. Examples of those that supply qualitative analysis instead of merely quantitative data are provided by Grayson (2012), Pop (2010), Suruila and Singh (2009), as well as Buhlungu and Metcalfe (2001). All these studies have a common finding that all forms of internships lead to a more accomplished worker with higher employability and retention potential. Suruila and Singh (2009) investigating the use of internship as a mechanism for the preparation of sports management personnel found that interns overall benefited both at a professional and personal level to potentiate their advancement in the chosen careers. Buhlungu and Metcalfe (2001), reflecting on internships in a Sociology of Work Unit (SWOP) at the University of the Witwatersrand, found that there was a need for black intellectuals to be supported through internships to emerge as professionals in their own right.

2.3.5 DISABILITY: INTERNATIONAL REVIEW

A literature review on disability from Canada (Pfeiffer and Yoshida, 1995) and the USA (Albrecht, Seelman, and Bury, 2001), was carried out. In a newly published collection edited by Grover and Piggott (2015), with contributions from the UK, Australia, Denmark, Poland, Canada, and the USA, researchers are challenging the notion of the promotion of paid work as an essential means of transforming the lives of people with disabilities (PWDs). While many countries have since the 1990s tried to increase the employment rates of PWDs (as espoused by supranational organisations, such as the OECD and the IMF), for them to
obtain self-determination and independence, this book shows how such policies have a negative effect on their subjects overall. Grover and Piggott (2015) submit that such approaches erode financial support for disabled people and increase the stigmatisation of those who are unable to work. Despite the fact that many disabled people value the opportunity to work, they tend to be relegated to low-skilled, part-time work much more than their able-bodied counterparts. This leaves them in a “low pay, no pay” cycle that is often exacerbated by poor health and makes it more difficult for them to reclaim the state welfare benefits they deserve. Moreover, those who attain full employment face challenges in retaining it, as they often have to compete with able-bodied people. The writers suggest that there should be assistance with job retention for the disabled by tackling health and debt issues, low levels of confidence, and working arrangements. Instead of wage work in the open market, in the case of Canada, the authors encourage social enterprises to offer flexible employment accommodations for the disabled. In the UK they propose volunteering and the creative arts as avenues for challenging dominant assumptions about the place of the disabled in society, since they maintain that wage work became a narrowly defined parameter for productive capacity as a result of industrialisation. Grover and Piggott (2015) therefore expostulate that, by its very nature, wage work in capitalist economies is exploitative and disabling.

This collection draws on sociology and philosophy to pose a powerful case for the rights of the disabled. Whilst going against the grain by questioning the wisdom of forcing disabled people to work, at the risk of impoverishment, Grover, Piggott, and the contributors are definitely not the first to do so. Activists and scholars who have been critiquing the policy developments and questioning the nature of wage work and its relationship to disabled people include Abberley (1996) and Barnes (2000) among others.

2.3.6 DISABILITY IN SOUTH AFRICA

Watermeyer’s (2006) collection on disability provides a rigorous investigation of a wide range of issue relating to PWDs under the new democratic dispensation in South Africa. These include representations of and theoretical approaches to disability, governmental and civil responses to disability, the provision of space, as well as social security for people with disabilities in various provinces in the country.

Soudien and Baxen (2006) in one of the chapters in Watermeyer’s collection, present nuanced definitions of disability by exploring the Medical, Social, and the Substantive Equality models, while also questioning the historical motives of the discourses constructing it. Moreover, it focuses on how the education system in particular has responded to learners with disabilities. Their study insists that the state’s success in
redressing educational inequalities for the disabled is a powerful measure of the transformation agenda and the extent to which equity goals have been met. They subsequently examine the progress made since the publication of Education White Paper 6 on special-needs education (DoE, 2001). They found that people with disability were grossly discriminated against, given the few educational opportunities in the over-crowded townships as compared to the high cost suburbs in the big cities.

Soudien and Baxen (2006) also interrogate a number of related policies and legislation meant to enable PWDs to participate meaningfully in the labour force. These include the White Paper on an Integrated National Disability Strategy (INDS), the Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act (2000), the National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS III) 2011-2015, and the Employment Equity Act (EEA), which provides guidelines for both employers and employees to promote equal opportunities. Nonetheless, Section 3.2 of the EEA leaves employers without liability in any proceedings if they do not employ a disabled person. Employers ultimately have a choice not to.

Barriers to employment for PWDs are many, according to a local study conducted by Maja, Mann, Singh, et al., (2011) in Durban. These barriers include discrimination or the negative attitudes of the employers and fellow employees, who because of ignorance, often think disabled people are inferior. However, Heaver et al, (2004) found that in the UK those companies that had a disabled employee demonstrated higher knowledge on disability than those that did not. There are other barriers to employment of PWDs. They include the lack of appropriate physical infrastructure, e.g., buildings, facilities, and public transport are inaccessible, or equipment and machinery are not customised. These tend to limit the possibility of PWDs to sufficient employment opportunities in engineering and manufacturing companies, due to the risks posed by the work environment. Moreover, Maja et al. (2011) observed that psychiatric disabilities are often more misunderstood than physical disabilities.

Often the exclusions are caused not by the physical inability but by limited educational attainments due to the lack of appropriate schooling. Maja et al. (2011) recommend that companies appointing PWDs in entry level positions must thereafter provide them with bursaries for further studies. The researchers also found that PWDs may have the relevant formal qualifications but may be restricted by the nature of their disability from performing well in the work they are deployed to do; on the other hand, the study revealed that employing PWDs led to higher consumer empathy and increased patronage of the participating businesses and products. The study also found that legislation on PWD was contributing to transformation by providing opportunities to those who would not have had
the chance had the government not established such legislation. The study concluded that the employer's attitude was critical in the employment of PWDs.

2.3.7 RURAL ENTREPRENEURSHIP IN GENERAL

Rural entrepreneurship is a well-established strategy that has been adopted by many countries to stimulate socio-economic development. There are several studies on the subject in the USA, where it has been used to stem the escalating rural poverty since the 1990s, when it was realised that such poverty levels were approaching those found in the inner cities due to economic globalisation and the decline of farm-based jobs over the past decades (Wortman, 1996). Case studies that include Lyons' (2002), which surveyed various models of incubating rural businesses in three counties, found there was a need to customise approaches to building rural social capital according to the specific needs of the entrepreneurs to be served.

In Europe economists assert that rural entrepreneurship is a specific kind of business activity with distinct social, physical, and economic traits. That school of thought views rurality as a dynamic resource for entrepreneurs, one that advocates for a rural development policy to take into account the peculiar circumstances of each locality (Stathopoulou, Psaltopoulos, and Skuras, 2004).

A number of articles on the topic look at the impact of the various models of business incubation, the impact of technology on rural economies, and the policies or other conditions necessary for the development of high-growth businesses, instead of small ventures. Henderson (2002) in his study investigating how the nonfarm rural economy can be a high-growth enterprise, defines successful rural entrepreneurs as "owner-managers who assume risk, manage the business's operations, reap the rewards of their success, and bear the consequences of their failure" (2002, 48). He notes that whether rural or urban, entrepreneurs reduce unemployment, increase incomes, create wealth, and generally improve the quality of life of citizens. Rural entrepreneurs, in particular, play an additional but critical role of helping rural communities operate in the global economy. This is why, in their desire to stimulate economic growth, rural policy makers in the USA have increased initiatives that enhance rural entrepreneurship.

Henderson (2002) accepts that there are basically two kinds of entrepreneurship: lifestyle and high-growth. Lifestyle (or small venture) entrepreneurs typically seek to provide a family income while holding on to their desired lifestyle, independence, and control of their time. Classic examples include the family-owned hardware store or the home-based professional
who owns a small consultancy. High-growth entrepreneurs, on the other hand, seek to establish much bigger, highly-visible companies that generate very high revenue. Nevertheless, Henderson also concedes that the categorisation of entrepreneurs is more complex when considering that there are two subcategories: opportunity entrepreneurs and necessity entrepreneurs. The former engage in activities to take advantage of unique opportunities in the market. The latter engage in entrepreneurship as the “best option available to employment, but not necessarily the preferred option” (2002, 66). Not surprisingly, the latter instance is a more common source for entrepreneurs in rural area, since job opportunities are often scarce in such communities.

His study highlights the following three major challenges in the development of rural entrepreneurs, especially high-growth businesses. Firstly, with the exception of tourist attractions, the smallness and remoteness of the rural area makes it difficult to develop critical mass and economies of scale, thus increasing the cost of goods. The further away from the metropolis the more acute the lack of transportation infrastructure and internet or high-speed broadband access, which are vital to e-commerce development. Secondly, rural entrepreneurs experience more difficulties than their metropolitan counterparts in accessing venture or equity capital, as many funders still consider the risks as much higher. Finally, rural entrepreneurs have few qualifications and therefore less technical or managerial expertise than their metropolitan peers.

To minimise the adverse effects of such challenges, Henderson observed the following antidotes. To combat the lack of qualifications and skills, many rural policy makers have introduced entrepreneurial development programmes focussed on improving the skills of the individual. Secondly, Henderson notes that the community’s access to resources and venture capital are critical to creating a community environment that enables the development of high-growth entrepreneurs. Moreover, building support networks is just as crucial to creating a community environment. As a result, informal or formal network groups create links to new funding sources, incubation opportunities, workers, partnerships, technology, and business services. Just as the benefits of a support group of peers cannot be underestimated, neither should programmes meant to overcome cultural attitudes that limit the appreciation of entrepreneurship in rural areas. To this effect, Henderson’s findings are that many states have small business or entrepreneur-of-the-year awards to promote and highlight the significance of such activities in rural economies. The conclusion of his study highlights the need to continuously identify and assess the costs and benefits of supporting high-growth entrepreneurs in rural America.
Studies have also been undertaken in developing countries to investigate both the regulation and application of policies on rural development, especially concerning women and the youths (Cho and Honorati, 2014). Studies on women entrepreneurs in developing economies include those from India (Das, 2000 and Mitra, 2002), Israel (Lerner, Brush, and Hisrich, 1997), Zimbabwe (Chitseke, 2000), Spain (Driga, Lafuente, and Vaillant, 2009), and China (Entwisle, Henderson, Short, et al., 1995).

Cho and Honorati’s (2014) reviews of various entrepreneurship programmes in developing countries, found a wide variation in their effectiveness depending on types of beneficiaries, outcomes, and country. Overall entrepreneurship programmes had a positive impact on the youth and increased business knowledge and practice. However, the achievements did not immediately translate into the setting up or expansion of businesses nor did they increase income. They found that promotional packages that combined training and financing were more effective for improving business activities, with financing more effective in improving business performance for women and business training more effective for existing entrepreneurs.

The Indian studies found that while Indian women experienced the same challenges as their western counterparts in accessing capital for starting up or continuing their business operations, they had lower levels of work-family conflicts (Das, 2000). This is because starting a business is often easier for Indian women than entering the formal employment sector, where there is high competition for the few jobs available. The relative exclusion of women from formal schooling and their cultural orientation towards marriage and motherhood means that entrepreneurship is thus less likely to lead to one giving up one’s home responsibilities in exchange for formal employment, i.e. as they can organise their business life around their family situations (Mitra, 2002).

On a different note, entrepreneurial studies are increasingly being offered by a number of business schools globally. Be that as it may, Higgins and Smith (2013), from the UK, posit that traditional pedagogical methods of learning may be inadequate to develop entrepreneurs who can master the complexities of running and creating innovative business opportunities. Traditional approaches that focus on theory rather than practise tend not to address the uncertainties and ambiguities imbedded in the entrepreneurial process. In addition, the historical individualist approach to entrepreneurship tends to marginalise the broader social context of the entrepreneur. As a result, Higgins and Smith (2013) propose that attention should be shifted towards “learning for” instead of “learning about” entrepreneurship. Consequently, they adopt a
social constructionist perspective that encourages the recognition of inter-subjective knowledge exchange as a method of developing entrepreneurial learning. While it is only one of many, this paradigm provides perspective on the way in which “we” experience the social world, thus exploring the social processes constituting entrepreneurial undertakings, as opposed to the traditional positivist approaches. In essence, this study reflects on the role of reflexivity in entrepreneurial education as a means of highlighting the diverse skills and new modes of behaviour required to critique what it means to be an entrepreneur.

On the other hand, a Nigerian study examining the links between entrepreneurial practice and formal education and skills development, propounds that colonial educational policy was designed to meet the needs of “education for paid employment” rather than self-employment and, therefore, the development of small enterprises was neglected. The author laments that while the government had since made efforts to empower small scale industries, as a strategy to reduce rural poverty and unemployment through the mobilization of domestic savings, these steps towards developing entrepreneurship have not been linked to the education policy (Aladekomo, 2004).

### 2.3.8 RURAL ENTREPRENEURSHIP IN SOUTH AFRICA

A study on the linkages of theory and practice in the Wholesale and Retail sector in South Africa was conducted by de Mink (2007). She examined experiences of learners who completed a Wholesale and Retail learnership, that combined the structured college-based learning, the practical work-based learning, as well as the integration of theory and practice. She found that South Africa’s multi-level National Qualifications Framework provides for academic as well as vocational training and promotes a ‘multi-pronged’ skills development strategy. This suggests that the learners had integrated theory and practice, which increased their competency. The study concluded that the structured college-based learning enabled the learners to implement in the workplace what they learnt at college.

David Korten’s (1980) study also observed that it may be appropriate to combine training approaches on rural entrepreneurship to address the internal and external factors, as well as theory and practice. In his study Korten found that the key to success was not the extensive preplanning that is typically undertaken by implementing organisations, rather it was the ability of such organisations to be flexible enough to view the task of rural development as a learning process for all stakeholders. The learning process approach presents a model that delineates three stages to building suitable programme strategies and organisational
competence. These are focussing on successively learning to improve effectiveness, learning to improve efficiency, and learning to improve expansion. In short, initiatives should not only be well-conceived but also ought to be flexibly implemented. Such a combination, the study concludes, can change the policy environment in favourable ways.

In summary, it seems the role of entrepreneurship, especially in rural transformation, cannot be overemphasized. As the global economy becomes more digitally advanced, the information technology and physical infrastructure in rural communities should keep up, or those inhabitants will fall further into poverty. It is also evident that the approach for developing and enhancing rural entrepreneurship must combine theoretical and practical elements in a manner that approaches the entire intervention as a learning process. The approach should, obviously, also take into account the specific needs and geography, while ensuring access to finance as a way of embedding sustainability.

2.4 CONCLUSION

An analysis of the articles from different parts of the world has indicated that successful transformation is a result of carefully designed and interconnected interventions at different levels. We have seen how policy legislation alone failed to overcome the entrenched racial boundaries and some achievements could only be realised in areas where the companies accepted and agreed to the objectives of transformation. Transformation works where a number of interventions are in place to create an enabling environment, potentiate the individual through education and raised self-esteem, and the creation of opportunities for the individual to succeed. Ultimately while an enabling environment is being created for the previously disadvantaged individuals, care should be taken to ensure that standards in the profession are not being lowered, and that the historically privileged who have potential are not excluded from the development process. Moreover, as Cruise has indicated regarding the targets for mining engineers, it would be unrealistic to expect them to represent the demographics at the top echelons, when it takes about 20 years to have a fully-fledged and experienced mining engineer, who can participate in the professional committees. Similarly, the W&RSETA should set realistic targets that do not limit the number of designated candidates who demonstrate potential. So, the targets set should reflect the minimum number of previously disadvantaged individuals required and no maximum.

Information from the literature review, therefore, indicates that while the provision of educational support may be useful in contributing to transformation, it is on its own not adequate to achieve transformation as there are other forces that need to be addressed. The
W&RSETA’s intervention of awarding bursaries to educate beneficiaries can partially contribute to increased levels of education, which may be transformative in itself (because it increases numbers and attempts to level the playing field), but it does not have much influence in terms of the job placements of these graduates. Evidence from other countries has shown that changes in the management culture of the organizations (e.g. Xerox) has a much more profound impact on transformation within the organization. Within the context of organizational change there were nuances of the positive role of mentoring relationships and culturing of the ‘I belong to the organization’ to combat the problematic attitudinal and racial mind-sets. Well-prepared mentors, committed to promoting and managing diversity, can be enablers in the acquisition of workplace skills and prepare candidates to higher levels of responsibility.

While Watter’s study points to the need to have a holistic approach when implementing rural interventions, she limits her emphasis to emotional and on-going support for development. Our study investigated this further by looking to see what other factors might enable the WRSETA participants’ rural micro-enterprises to grow in the context of an enabling economic environment.
CHAPTER 3
ANALYSIS OF SECONDARY DATA ON THE W&RSETA

This is a consolidated quantitative data analysis of the W&RSETA’s annual reports from 2005 to 2014/15. The analysis was undertaken as part of determining how the SETA has performed in the last ten years towards contributing to transformation in the sector.

The results of the analysis assisted us to clearly identify areas of focus for our assessment of the role of the SETA in transformation. In addition, the results further assisted the research team to modify the data collection methodologies and tools for the assessment study. This analysis of quantitative data on the W&RSETA is a first attempt to quantify the achievements of the SETA in the area of transformation in a situation where there are no direct indicators for transformation in the programme reports.

3.1 COLLATION OF QUANTITATIVE DATA

Quantitative data on the annual performance of the W&RSETA was collated from annual reports from 2005 to 2014/15. Although we realized that data from annual reports tended to dwell mostly on achievements, these were the most accessible sources of quantitative statistics describing the performance status of the W&RSETA skills development and job potentiation interventions. We were not able to access databases on the activities of W&RSETA, because the existing databases are not in an accessible information management system and would require cleaning up and extensive manipulation. As we had limited time for the study we opted to use annual reports where some performance information on activities and outputs was presented in quantitative tables. Because the reporting formats were not uniform across the annual reports, the differences in formats did provide major obstacles to collating data on performance indicators that could be used to determine the impact of the W&RSETA’s programmes on transformation.

Before we could analyze the data we needed to define transformation for us to interpret what and how much has been achieved by the W&RSETA programmes. The definition of transformation that we used was a combination of translations from different authorities but we coined the following working statement for our purposes: “A process in which individuals or groups that were previously excluded from certain achievements for a variety of reasons are deliberately potentiated for inclusion through affirmative actions.” The affirmative action could take the form of increasing opportunities for the particular group to equalize disparities.
that may have been caused by some discriminatory policies and processes or prejudices in the society. Transformation is also described as a mind-set change, the act of embracing diversity, equalizing rights, and creating equal opportunities for everyone.

In the case of the W&RSETA, transformation here implies the creation of opportunities, for those who were previously disadvantaged by racial, gender, or disability discriminations, to improve themselves to advance their careers to higher positions without prejudice. To this end W&RSETA has developed several programmes to provide opportunities for PDIs, including women and the peoples with disabilities (PWDs), to advance their careers to higher technical, professional, and management positions in the wholesale and retail sector. Although the programmes were not specifically designed to address the issues of transformation in the sector, the results of the interventions will significantly contribute to the latter through the development of individual skills to potentiate their upward growth in their careers. The data from the annual reports was not able to indicate the actual advancement, but we are able to confidently speculate that increased skills and education has provided opportunities for career growth for these individuals.

3.2 CHALLENGES
There were major challenges to accessing data on the activities of the W&RSETA, occasioned by the lack of standard data collection and presentation formats, which made it difficult to compare trends. Most of the data sets were incomplete and in some cases inconsistent and therefore unreliable.

We can therefore not guarantee the quality of data used in this document.

3.3 W&RSETA PROGRAMMES CONTRIBUTING TO TRANSFORMATION
In order to appreciate the SETA’s contribution, we examined the current skills development and learner placement programmes to enable us to assess how these programmes have impacted on transformation in the sector. We focused our analysis on the numbers of persons trained at various levels and where possible attempted to desegregate the numbers of trained persons into categories of race, gender, and disabled categories. This was not possible in most cases as the data presentations were not desegregated into those categories. In a few cases where this was done we noted that although the numbers of previously disadvantaged groups were increasing there was still a significant disproportionate representation at the high management and technical skills levels, of whites, males and abled persons.
The examined data tables in the annual reports (2005 to 2015) indicate that there has been a steady growth of capacity development especially at the lower levels. Although there were indications that the W&RSETA was deliberately providing opportunities for training and potentiating employment to those who, otherwise would not have the opportunity to be employed, these efforts were limited by the lack of focus on transformation as it was not the main objective of the interventions.

3.4 ANALYSIS OF THE PERFORMANCE DATA
We carried out the analysis of the quantitative data from annual reports based on our assessment that the following indicators would approximate contribution to transformation:

a) Adult Basic Education training (ABET)
b) Skills Development
c) Training and mentoring of young people to form sustainable ventures
d) Gender Affirmative Action Interventions
e) Racial Affirmative Action
f) Learnerships
g) Affirmative action for the disabled
h) Further education and technical training.

3.4.1 ADULT BASIC EDUCATION TRAINING PROGRAMME
Our analysis of the programme has indicated that it was one of the most popular programmes of the W&RSETA, where thousands of workers and aspiring workers hoped to join the programme to improve their level of literacy. However, the programme lost momentum and seemed to have been tailed down by 2011 as there was no reference to the program thereafter (See Figure 3.1 below).
ABET is in our opinion a critical programme for transformation, as it creates opportunities for individuals to have access to information to widen their knowledge base and opportunities to training. We view the scaling down of the programme as unfortunate as its contribution to transformation though basic is critical.

**SKILLS DEVELOPMENT**

Skills development is one of the key elements of transformation. It provides opportunities for the improvement of one’s work status and employability. The SETA’s skills development programmes have enabled several thousands of individuals to find employment and/or expect to advance in their careers. Although we are unable to demonstrate the impact of the skills development on career advancement, the high attendance of the skills development training courses indicates the high value that learners place on these courses to strengthen their skills base. Figure 3.2 demonstrates the need for skills training from a wide range of service areas in the sector.
The training requirements were found to be highest at the sales and service level (Figure 3.3). It was unfortunate that the data was not desegregated according to gender, race, and disability classifications.
3.4.2 TRAINING AND MENTORING OF YOUNG PEOPLE TO START SUSTAINABLE WHOLESALE/RETAIL VENTURES

Training and mentoring young people is an important part of the transformation process, as it provides the learners with the opportunity to be entrepreneurs and arrogate themselves with roles and responsibilities as planners and managers in the new businesses. The training of young people in entrepreneurial development directly contributes to transformation at both the individual and community levels. The successful establishment of sustainable ventures would lead to greater opportunities for growth and the provision of employment for other young people in the businesses. We are aware that the W&RSETA does not have transformation as the focus of its interventions and maybe that should together with the low level of returns on the investment explain why the training of young people to develop sustainable ventures is being approached with low levels of focus as indicated in Figure 3.4. It is not clear from the lack of reports on the programmes in subsequent years after 2010/11.

Figure 3.4: Training and Mentoring Young People to Form New Business Ventures

3.4.3 GENDER AFFIRMATIVE ACTION

The review of data in the annual reports of 2005 to date indicates very little gender-based affirmative action. There may be a number of explanations for the lack of “visible” gender affirmative action in the W&RSETA. Data from these reports indicates a higher level of participation of women than men, especially at the sales and service levels (found only in one report as other reports do not desegregate data according to gender). Reviews of literature indicate that the Sales and Service category in the W&R sector is widely dominated
by females and therefore that might have not necessitated the need for gender affirmative programmes.

**Figure 3.5: Employed Persons in Learnerships & Skills Dev. by Gender**

![Bar chart showing employed learners entering and completing learnerships and skills development by gender]

**3.4.4 LEARNERSHIP PROGRAMME**

The learnership programme provides opportunities to individuals without experience to learn on the job through hands-on training. It is perhaps one of the effective ways to train inexperienced workers to gain the necessary experience and confidence on the job. Learnerships and skills development programmes are the flagship programmes of the W&RSETA. The assessment of the extent to which these programmes are carried out will guide us in determining their impact on transformation in the sector. Learnerships provides opportunities for learners to learn and prove to themselves that they are have the necessary confidence to perform general and specific tasks, while gaining experience that will be useful in advancing their careers in the host organization or elsewhere. Figure 3.5 indicates that the W&RSETA has invested significant resources in these programmes, thus contributing to strengthening its role in transforming the sector.
Leanerships have also been used to provide opportunities for unemployed persons to learn on the job and in some cases become employed in the host. It stands to reason that a trained person is more likely to be employed in the long run than an untrained one. Therefore, increasing the potential and opportunity for employment is in itself transformative.
### 3.4.5 AFFIRMATIVE ACTION FOR THE DISABLED

An analysis of accessible data of how the SETA’s programmes are contributing to affirmative action for PWDs revealed that there are few programme activities addressing transformation requirements for this group. There are no reports or very little is reported on disability programmes with the exception of the 2012/13 annual report that provided information on the entry of PWDs into both the learnership and skills development programmes.

![Figure 3.8: Disabled Learners Entering Learnerships & Skills Development Programmes in 2012/13](image)

### 3.4.6 OTHER TRANSFORMATION SUPPORTIVE ACTIVITIES

In order for the W&RSETA to carry out its mandate it has to raise resources and manage skills development programmes. To do this the SETA provides grants to several organizations to participate in learnership placement programmes and provide staff development training for small and non-levy paying organizations. This programme to assist community-based organizations, small Black-owned firms, and cooperatives contributes towards capacity building for such small firms and is, therefore, a transformative activity.

The raising of resources for building the capacity of individuals contributes towards transforming the industry to embrace equity and allow PDIs to rise to higher levels of
management and technical competence in the sector. The provision of grants for skills development to firms is a complementary transformative activity as it allows these organizations to train their staff to higher levels of responsibility (See Figure 3.9).

### 3.4.7 BURSARIES AND PLACEMENT STATISTICS 2014/15

Bursaries and graduate placement internships are the main stay programme for the SETA, where financial support is provided to employed and unemployed learners through bursary grants and placement in relevant firms for on-the-job training at the completion of their studies. Through this process the W&RSETA enhances the chances of a learner being employed after completing the training. The histogram below indicates the numbers of learners that were granted bursaries from 2011/2012 through 2014/2015. The chart indicates that both employed and unemployed learners were beneficiaries of bursary grants to enable them to study at the TVET colleges and universities. The numbers of unemployed beneficiaries at the colleges and universities are much higher than those employed mainly because learners from high schools, directly after the completion of matric, are the main beneficiaries. These young people are just out of high school and have had no opportunity to be employed as yet.
The sponsorship of learners already in employment was found mainly at the universities, presumably for higher qualifications. As there was no information on what the university sponsorships were for, we can only speculate that they were for advanced training in the same area of work in which beneficiaries are employed.

### 3.4.8 ANALYSIS OF SPONSORSHIP BY RACE IN SELECT PROVINCES

We looked at the available data on bursary grants given to beneficiaries by race as the basis for determining whether criteria for transformation were applied. The data was selected from Gauteng, KZN, and Western Cape provinces as these are the main areas where the SETA has the most member organizations. The data covered the period 2012/13 to 2014/15. The results shown for all provinces below show that most of the bursary grants amounting to more than 90% were given to Black Africans. The exception is in the Western Cape, where up to 40% of beneficiaries were Coloureds in 2012/2013, but this dropped to less than 30% in subsequent years. There was a steady drop in the numbers of learners granted bursaries after the 2012/2013 period for reasons we are currently not able to explain. However, we are aware that there were some changes in the leadership of the bursaries programme during the period in question.
Gender is an important element in transformation, as females are often not accorded the same opportunities as men, because of the socio-cultural factors that pertain to traditional South African paternalistic practices. An analysis of bursaries granted to recipients will enable us to determine whether transformation criteria to provide better opportunities to women are applied in the bursaries programme. Data from the three populous provinces in the country was analysed and charted in the histogram below.

3.4.9 ANALYSIS OF SPONSORSHIP BY GENDER

Figure 3.11: Bursary Recipients by Race

![Graph showing bursary recipients by race across different provinces and years.]

Figure 3.12: Bursary Grants by Gender

![Graph showing bursary grants by gender across different provinces and years.]

48
The analysis of bursary grants by gender shows significant differences with more women given grants in year 2012/13 but reversed in year 2013/14. KZN and Gauteng particularly gave more grants to males in year 2013/14. The provision of grants to more males cannot be explained by the available data. We, however, note that the two provinces that provided data for 2014/15—KZN and WC—gave more scholarships to women although at a lower numbers of total beneficiaries.

3.4.10 BURSARY GRANTS BY AREAS OF RESIDENCE

We are aware that access to services and programmes of personal development are influenced by area of residence. Rural areas tend to have less access to services and opportunities than urban areas. The W&RSETA has indicated this in its development strategies and plans, hence its rural development programmes aimed at bringing its services to rural communities. The data on bursary grants by area of residence in Figure 3.13 indicates the situation from 2012/13 to 2014/15.

![Figure 3.13: Bursary Grants by Area of Residence (Rural /Urban)](chart)

The chart indicates a picture where a greater portion of bursaries in all the three provinces were given to urban residents except for KZN in 2013/13 where more than 325 rural beneficiaries were awarded bursaries compared to 200 urban dwelling recipients. It is obvious from the chart that overall more urban residents received scholarships than those in rural areas. However, since we have no baseline information on the comparative size of the resident population in each situation, we are not able determine whether the process deliberately gave more opportunities to urban applicants. It could be that there were not that many rural applicants to be awarded bursaries.
The analysis of the available quantitative data on the W&RSETA’s activities and programmes clearly indicate that the organization is involved in several learnership and skills development programmes. These programmes are to some extent contributing to improving the lives of many people including the youths, who would not have otherwise been able to afford education and training within the sector. The programmes have also provided opportunities for thousands of workers and unemployed individuals from previously disadvantaged backgrounds to join the skilled workforce in the industry, thus contributing to transformation in the sector.

However, the available data is not of sufficient quality to use in providing precise achievements towards transformation, as most of it is from annual reports and scattered event reports that are often not complete or accessible. Over the period we were writing this report, small batches of random databases were sent to us in bits and pieces, and they were often incomplete. It is obvious that the data management processes in the SETA need to be strengthened.
CHAPTER 4
 METHODOLOGY

Our methodology was been guided by the nature and type of information we need to collect on transformation in the W&RSETA. In order to manage the study within the allocated budget and time frame, and in accordance with the approved proposal, we have restricted our investigation to the following entry-level programmes in Gauteng, Western Cape, and KZN provinces.

- Bursaries
- Graduate Placements
- Disabilities, and
- Rural Development

The decision to focus on only these four was also influenced by the fact that some of the interventions have been running for such a short time (e.g. W&R Leadership Chair OR Schools of Excellence) that no significant effect on transformation could be expected in such a short time. Furthermore, a number of the interventions were at the time being subject to in-depth evaluations (e.g. ILDP and RMDP) and conducting another in-depth evaluation seemed excessive. The findings of these other investigations have been included in Section 5.4 to ensure a complete overview of all W&RSETA interventions are covered in this report.

4.1 SOURCES OF DATA

The design consisted of both qualitative and quantitative methodologies that enabled the collection of relevant data for composite analysis.

4.1.1 PRIMARY DATA COLLECTION

This consisted of the identification of key respondents who were interviewed using in-depth questionnaires, Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), and direct observations. These helped us collect both qualitative and quantitative information from the study respondents.

4.1.2 SECONDARY DATA COLLECTION

This consisted of reviewing relevant documents on the four programmes. The review of the documents enabled us to fully understand the issues from different perspectives.
4.2 DATA COLLECTION METHODOLOGY

The implementation process entailed the undertaking of the following activities:

4.2.1 DOCUMENT REVIEWS

We reviewed key documents, including the W&RSETA’S Sector Skills Plans, annual reports, and programme implementation and monitoring documents. These provided useful information that enabled us a better understanding how the W&RSETA has used its mandate to shape its role and responsibilities towards the process of transformation.

In addition, a number of legislative and policy documents were reviewed to further deepen our understanding of the W&RSETA’s operational environment, which enabled us to identify synergies and incompatibilities that may have impacted on the effectiveness of the transformation process within the sector.

A review of the literature on international practices and experiences of transformation through skills development was also been carried out (see the literature review section in the previous chapter). This activity helped us to gain a better appreciation of the nuances of transformation as it is experienced in developed economies, such as, the USA and the UK. Lessons from the literature review proved useful in guiding our data collection processes and in focusing our analysis, so we could make sound recommendations and propose a viable way forward.

4.2.2 FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS (FGDs)

We conducted FGDs with students and graduate interns in Gauteng and with rural learners in KwaNdebele. A total of three FGDs were planned for each of the three provinces selected. The determination of the final number of FGDs was guided not only by the difficulties of getting groups of people in one place but also by the challenges we faced from un-cooperative store managers and HR practitioners. Much of February and March 2016 was spent trying to get assistance from the companies, i.e. statistics on the numbers of graduate interns that have been placed and/or absorbed in the stores over the past few years. We also tried to set up FGDs as initially envisaged, but to no avail. While we eventually obtained some statistics from the Western Cape Province, after much coercion and a few reminders from the W&RSETA’s Regional Manager, in KZN and GP we had no luck at all in this regard. After the Back-to-School season in January, the company personnel were all very busy
preparing for the Easter Season, which is one of the biggest profit-making opportunities in the retail sector.

The FGD at UJ was conducted by the two co-investigators supported by two trained research assistants using instruments developed and field tested during the inception stages of the study. Before we embarked on the data collection process, data collectors were trained in administering the instruments developed for the purpose. Respondents were drawn from various disciplines funded by the W&RSETA Bursary Programme. They were a sample of those for whom it was convenient to attend the FGD at UJ at the appointed time. Experiences of these individuals on how they assess the effectiveness and efficiency of the bursary scheme towards transformation were noted. Moreover, in-depth interviews were later held with one employed and one unemployed bursary holder in Pretoria to better understand the impact of the bursary on these two kinds of beneficiaries.

Qualitative data collection questions were developed and used with different modifications as discussion guides for the FGD and the in-depth interviews.

The development of the instruments was guided by the evidence obtained from the situation analysis of the W&R SETA programmes and operant environment. The analysis framework formed the basis for the nature and content of the questions.

The selected respondents were contacted by telephone to get their acceptance and consent to participate in the interviews on set days for each institutional or geographical area. Arrangements were then made for the interviewing team to conduct the interviews using the prepared instruments.

For the FGDs the participants sat in a circle that included the moderator and rapporteur. On arriving at the appointed venue, the moderator explained to the participants the purpose of the discussion and requested those who made up their minds to participate in the discussion to sign a consent form to enable them to participate in the discussions. It was explained to them that the proceedings of the discussions will be treated as confidential and that the recordings will only be used for transcription purposes and that the individual contributions to the discussions will be treated as anonymous. The moderator initiated the discussion by appealing to all the discussants to freely participate in the discussion. Thereafter, using the FGD guiding questions, the moderator posed the questions and encouraged everyone to contribute to the answers. The moderator made sure not to show any position on any of
issues that were being discussed and remained as neutral as possible including body language so as not to influence the discussions.

The discussions were audio-recorded for later transcription and analysis.

4.2.3 IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS

In-depth interviews were held with the W&RSETA’s skills development and training beneficiaries (e.g., interns, graduates, etc.) regarding their opinions on the programmes, as well as with the “implementers,” (e.g., programme officers, supervisors, human resources managers, and training providers) to gauge their general assessment of their programmes’ effectiveness in the industry.

For both surveys we used carefully designed short questionnaires consisting mainly of open-ended question that sought to elicit participants’ recommendations on how the programme could be made more effective. While some of the interviews were face-to-face, others were telephonic.

The fieldwork team consisted of experienced research field assistants and operated in small groups of two, with each group led by a team leader who was responsible for first level quality control procedures (e.g. checking all completed questionnaires on a daily basis, providing feedback to his/her team, debriefing with the team and managing the fieldwork process on a continuous basis). The team leader also performed second level quality control processes (e.g. check backs, monitoring sample composition, etc.).

The data collected from the interviews was processed for quality and content. Transcription of the data was guided by the following thematic categories:

i. Knowledge of what transformation in the sector entails (Their demonstration of an understanding of what transformation at both personal and global sector levels would entail would result in our regarding their opinions as credible).

ii. Level of understanding of how skills development contributes to transformation at both personal and global sector levels.

iii. Personal or known experience in upward movement in career due to W&RSETA programmes

iv. Perceived efficiency and effectiveness of W&RSETA programmes towards creating conditions likely to contribute to transformation in the sector.
v. Observations and advice on what W&RSETA ought to do to ensure that its programmes effectively contribute to transformation at individual and global sector levels.

vi. Identified constraints to W&RSETA programmes’ effective contribution to transformation in the sector.

The above themes were decided upon to categorize the expected unstructured responses from the qualitative data collection.

4.3 RESPONDENT PROFILES
Below is an explanation of all the respondents that participated in the GFDs and individual, in-depth interviews.

- **W&RSETA Student Bursary Recipients**

The bursaries programme was identified as one of the critical programmes that enabled persons from previously disadvantaged groups to access higher or technical education, which is an important element of transformation. Subsequently, one focus group discussion (FGD) was conducted at UJ with a total of 17 black students (11 males; 6 females) from Wits and UJ in November 2015. While similar FGDs and in-depth interviews had been set up for Cape Town and Durban, they had to be cancelled due to the “#Fees Must Fall” nationwide student protests at the universities, and have subsequently not been conducted as the new academic year has started with much unrest.

- **W&RSETA Graduate Interns**

Two focus groups were held with graduate interns in Germiston and 11 individual interviews were also held with current and past graduate interns, four of whom have subsequently become managers. Those interviewees who had become managers were notably all males. These interactions helped to highlight the issues that had impacted on the effectiveness of the programme. Three Human Resources practitioners in charge of the interns in various stores were also interviewed to get their perspective.

- **W&RSETA Learners with Disability**

Whereas this programme stopped in 2010, we interviewed the incumbent who was previously the manager of the programme. She currently works on special projects in the CEO’s office. We also held telephone interviews with three PWD. Our attempts to have a FGD with learners with disabilities in Gauteng during March 2016 were also unsuccessful.
- **W&RSETA Rural Learners**
  Similarly, a focus group was conducted with 11 rural learners in KwaNdebele. The researchers asked questions on the administration and effectiveness of the programme in the transformation of rural communities to make them more economically active in the sector. The royal prince overseeing the implementation in the KwaNdebele traditional council was also interviewed.

- **W&RSETA Senior Personnel**
  The following head office personnel were interviewed individually: managers of (i) the Bursaries and Placement, (ii) the Rural Development, and (iii) the Disabilities programmes. The following senior officials were also interviewed: (i) the Chief Officer: Qualifications and Research, (ii) the Executive: Bursaries and Placements, and (iii) the Skills Manager for the purposes of understanding how they perceive the role of the SETA on transformation, as well as the successes and challenges in the implementation of the various programmes from their view at the top, so to speak. We also wanted to understand their perspectives on the issues affecting the effectiveness of the various programmes. These senior officials were identified as key sources of information on W&R SETA operational and policy environment.

### 4.4 CHALLENGES

The retail sector is a very busy industry. This was very evident in the challenges we encountered in trying to set up focus groups, one-on-one interviews, or to collate quantitative statistics from employers. The many peak periods during the past six months further delayed the data gathering process. From October to December 2015 the sector was preparing for the festive Christmas season. In January retailers were busy with “Back-to-School” sales. In February they were chasing Valentine’s Day profits. In March and April there were preoccupied with the Easter long weekend and Autumn school holidays, just before preparing for Mothers’ Day celebrations in May. In March and April the human resources units in the retailer stores we were trying to engage were also busy collating their internal reports for the end of the 2015/16 financial year. Relevant personnel were inundated with the work that goes into BEE reporting, pivotal reports, and Skills Development Plans. It seems throughout much of the study retailers were just too busy to talk to.

In addition, the #FeesMustFall protest campaign that started in September 2015 also made it difficult to hold focus groups with students holding SETA bursaries. Disruptions on some campuses continued even at the beginning of the first term in 2016 (February to March).
Thereafter, students were unavailable because they had fallen behind the syllabus and had to catch up with the work load.

4.5 DATA ANALYSIS
Notwithstanding, from what we could gather, our analysis of the qualitative and quantitative data provided points to the fact that, while there might still be many structural challenges at present, the SETA contributes strongly to the transformation of the sector. At the same time, it was apparent that the W&RSETA has not formally identified transformation as a strategic goal. Rather, it is fulfilling skills development needs as a strategic target.
CHAPTER 5
FINDINGS

5.1 INTRODUCTION
The findings of the analysis of data we collated indicate that W&RSETA activities contribute noticeably to transformation in the sector. This contribution, however, is mostly evident in the steadily increasing numbers of participants that participate in the SETA’s programmes. However, as the W&RSETA does not have follow-up records on most participants of its programmes. It was difficult to trace previous participants to determine where they are or what they are doing. There are also difficulties in following up participants at their places of work as most enterprises are sensitive to giving information concerning their promotional and career advancement activities relating to individual workers to outsiders.

Whereas, we can surmise that individuals who have been skilled or trained in specific expertise in the industry are likely to be employed at appropriate levels in the organization, without access to employment records it will be difficult to determine whether real transformation has occurred. At this point in our study, it is difficult to determine whether the individuals from previously disadvantaged groups have indeed made sufficient headway in being employed in positions of greater responsibilities in the sector dominated by white males. However, it is undeniable that by creating a cohort of appropriately qualified PDIs, the SETA is contributing to transformation in the sector as the participants have a better chance of competing with their white male counterparts than before. This ultimately means they have a better chance of improving their economic wellbeing while working within this sector than was the case before the programmes were implemented. This is very important as one of the main reasons given by most Employment Equity reports for the lack of transformation is the unavailability of suitably qualified candidates from the designated groups. So, the bursaries in particular will have a very positive impact on the employment of PDIs at all levels in the future, when the racial and gender profiles of middle and senior retail managers would have transformed. More comprehensive assessment will probably only be possible in the long term, but the role of the SETA in transformation even now is evident.

5.2 OVERVIEW OF FINDINGS
In this section available statistics and a brief overview of the findings for each programme are given. While the early part of the chapter provides quantitative measurements, the latter part provides more qualitative findings. Detailed discussions of the findings are presented late in section 5.3.
5.2.1 THE BURSARY PROGRAMME
The W&RSETA has identified as one of its strategic objectives, the need to support learners to further their studies at Public Higher Education Institutions in South Africa. This objective addresses Outcome 4.2.3 of the National Skills Development Strategy III (2011-2015), which is to ensure that high-level national Scarce Skills are being addressed by work-ready graduates from Higher Education Institutions. As a result, the W&RSETA offers bursaries to learners who have been accepted to study only at public Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in South Africa.

The bursary is currently restricted to academically strong, financially needy students who have been accepted and are registered for the following Degrees/Diplomas/ B. Tech or NATED / NCV Programmes related to the Wholesale and Retail Sector Scarce Skills priorities as indicated by Table 5.1 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5.1: Degrees and Diplomas Qualifying for W&amp;RSETA Bursary Funding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| HETI PROGRAMMES NATED PROGRAMMES – N4 TO N6 | • Retail Business Management  
• Purchasing Management  
• Supply Chain Management  
• Logistics Management  
• Sales and Marketing Management  
• Retail Marketing  
• Accounting  
• Financial Management  
• Retail Pharmacy  
• Training and Development Management  
• Human Resource Management  
• Information Technology / Computer Science |
| NATED PROGRAMMES – N4 TO N6 | • Financial Management  
• Marketing Management  
• Human Resource Management  
• Management Assistant |
| NCV PROGRAMMES – LEVEL 2 TO LEVEL 4 | • Finance, Economics & Accounting  
• Marketing  
• Information Technology & Computer Science  
• Office Administration  
• Transport and Logistics |

Source: 2015 online advert for W&RSETA Bursaries

The full bursary covers tuition, books, accommodation (accredited/ leased by the Institutions and University/TVET residences), and meals where applicable. Amounts provided differ according to the fees payable to each institution. It is for full-time or part-time (employed students). Funding is not provided for longer than the stipulated duration of the qualification or studies, and students are also not funded for subjects/modules they have failed.
The W&RSETA bursaries are administered by the SETA’s Manager for Bursaries and Placements, who has one assistant and reports to the Executive for Bursaries and Placements. All three administrators are at the SETA’s head office in Centurion. The head office personnel are assisted by NSFAS bursary officers in each institution where the beneficiaries are located. They are also assisted by Careerwise Empowerment Ventures, an independent bursary disbursement agent. Careerwise, on behalf of the W&RSETA, conducts bi-annual visits (once in the 1st semester and once in the 2nd semester) to track the progress and reports on its contracted students. The SETA officials also try to make at least one visit per year to the various campuses to verify the numbers of students and to motivate them. The bursary scheme began in 2011 and had managed to sponsor 1000 students across the country by the end of 2012. Demographic details of bursary holders from 2013 to 2015 are given in Tables 5.2, 5.3 and 5.4.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROVINCE</th>
<th>RESIDENTIAL AREA</th>
<th>GENDER</th>
<th>RACE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RURAL</td>
<td>URBAN</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAUTENG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GP TOTAL</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KWAZULU-NATAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td>71</td>
<td></td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KZN TOTAL</td>
<td>332</td>
<td>211</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WESTERN CAPE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WC TOTAL</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>3 632</td>
<td>605</td>
<td>654</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Collated from spreadsheets submitted by the W&RSETA Head Office in October 2015
Table 5.3: Depicting 2014 bursary students in Gauteng, KZN, and W Cape

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROVINCE</th>
<th>RESIDENTIAL AREA</th>
<th>GENDER</th>
<th>RACE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RURAL</td>
<td>URBAN</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gauteng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GP TOTAL</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KwaZulu Natal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KZN TOTAL</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WC TOTAL</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>1742</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Collated from spread sheets submitted by the W&RSETA Head Office in October 2015
Table 5.4: Depicting 2015 bursary students in Gauteng, KZN, and W Cape provinces

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROVINCE</th>
<th>RESIDENTIAL AREA</th>
<th>GENDER</th>
<th>RACE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RURAL</td>
<td>URBAN</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAUTENG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GP TOTAL</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KWAZULU NATAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KZN TOTAL</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WESTERN CAPE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET COLLEGES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREER WISE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WC TOTAL</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>590</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Collated from spread sheets submitted by the W&RSETA Head Office in October 2015
The tables above show the numbers of W&RSETA bursary holders in Gauteng, KZN, and Western Cape provinces over the past three years. KZN, which according to Statistics South Africa’s mid-year 2015 estimates, has the country’s second largest population (20%) has actually had the largest number of student beneficiaries in the past three years (1116). Gauteng province, which has the country’s largest population (24%) has had 856 students funded. The Western Cape Province had a total of 739. By far the largest number of participants in all three provinces has been Africans (2 526). Only nine Indians have been funded in the past three years. Eight of them were in KZN and only one was in Gauteng, which may be expected as KZN has the highest population of Indians in South Africa. A total of 170 Coloured students were funded in the same period. The largest cohort (165) is in the Western Cape, which is to be expected since that province has the largest representation of Coloureds. Only three Coloureds were funded in Gauteng and two in KZN.

There are also more women (1625) than men (1059) that were funded in the past three years. Of these women 610 were from KZN, 517 from Gauteng, and 498 from the Western Cape. Similarly, the highest number of men were from KZN (439), compared to Gauteng (367) and the Western Cape (253). The highest number of women students might reflect their assumption that there are fewer barriers to entry into the W & R sector for them. By far the largest number of front line employees in the clothing and groceries stores, which women frequent, is females.

The tables also show that the number of rural students dropped from 605 in 2013 to 162 in 2015. The programme’s reliance solely on the website for advertising could be a factor. Please note that rural and urban refers to the beneficiaries’ municipalities of origin according to the government’s demarcations.
5.2.2 THE GRADUATE PLACEMENT PROGRAMME
The W&RSETA invites companies within the W&R sector to participate in the Graduate Placement programme for HET and FET graduates. Companies can source graduates with a wholesale and retail related qualification from ANY of the Public Further Education and Training institutions (FET Colleges) and Public Higher Education and Training institutes (HET). The SETA provides participating graduates with a stipend of R3500 per month for a graduate with a degree or HET Diploma for a period of 12 months. The stipend is R3000 per month for a N6 Qualified graduate.

The qualification should address the absolute and relative Scarce Skills as per the SSP published on the SETA’s website (www.wrseta.org.za), which includes the following:

- Retail Business Management
- Food Technology
- Supply Chain Management
- Logistics Management
- Financial Accounting
- Financial Management
- Operations Management

The Graduate Placement Programme is therefore a structured work-based programme, aimed at affording unemployed graduates with work experience in their field of study. Whilst the programme focuses on providing practical work experience, employers are allowed to provide further training if they find it necessary.

a) Objectives of the Graduate Workplace Experience Programme
- To enable companies to address the shortage of scarce and critical skills in the Wholesale and Retail Sector;
- To create a pool of skilled workers with formal tertiary qualifications;
- To promote Wholesale and Retail as a career of choice;
- To assist in meeting the particular strategic staffing needs of companies in the W&R Sector by providing practical and accelerated work experience programmes that expose graduates to specific W&R occupations;
- To provide unemployed graduates with valuable work experience and skills commensurate with the graduates’ specific qualifications to enhance their employability;
• To provide students that have N6 certificates with the necessary workplace experience that they need to enable them to obtain their Diplomas.

**NOTE:** The Graduate Placement Programme is not a Learnership. It does not lead to a formal qualification. It is a work-based experience programme and culminates in a testimonial letter indicating the work areas to which the graduate was exposed.

**b) Employer's Capacity to Implement the Graduate Workplace Experience Programme**

• The Graduates should not be recruited to replace permanent, temping or contracted employees.

• Graduate Placement Programmes should be developed and managed to address the particular needs of the company and/or department.

• Employers must have capacity to host graduates at the workplace for Graduate Workplace Experience programme for a minimum period of a year;

• Employers should conduct an induction programme;

• The organisation and/or departments must make reasonable attempts to accommodate and integrate graduates into their culture and treat them like any employee in the organisation;

• There must be assessment processes, which may include Performance Reviews, to support the Graduate Placement Programme.

5.2.3 **THE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME**

The National Rural Development Strategy (NRDS) of 1995 sets out the mechanisms by which rural people and their elected representatives on rural district councils and municipalities can take charge of the development process in their own areas. Some of the goals of the NRDS are that by 2020 South Africa’s rural people will have dignity, security, and freedom from poverty; full and productive employment; greater integration between towns and rural areas, especially on market days; accessible and democratic local government structures; and a healthy and productive environment.

Page 7 of the National Development Strategy III (NSDS III) provides a clear distinction between the training of rural people and skills for rural development. The former has tended to train rural people only in order to migrate to the urban areas, whilst the latter will aim to train rural people for the development of the rural areas themselves. It is within this policy
framework that the mission of the W&RSETA's Comprehensive Rural Development Strategy is to contribute to the social and economic growth of the country by enabling education and training of the highest quality in the W&R Sector, to the benefit of people in rural areas. Beneficiaries of the SETA’s programmes are school leavers, youth, and unemployed people with a desire to develop their entrepreneurial skills. Learners must be either actively involved in the process of starting up a small retail business or currently self-employed in an informal business in the SMME environment.

a) Individual Entrepreneurs

For the W&RSETA's National Certificate: “Informal Small Business Practice” NQF Level 3 Qualification, the minimum requirement for entry is Grade 8. It enables participants 12 months’ theoretical and practical training. The relevance of the intervention is that the certificate (120 credits) forms part of a learning pathway in the W&R Sector that stretches from NQF Level 2 – 5 and the qualification focuses on the SMME sector. The learners thus become retail managers, thereby addressing a scarce skill in the W&R sector.

**Competencies Addressed**

- Understanding of Retail Operational Requirements
- Effective handling of financial transactions
- Handling of basic merchandising
- Handling of stock
- Maintaining of safety and security in the business environment, and
- Customer service

Some of the Outcomes are that at the end of their training participants should have registered their businesses with the CIPC, SARS, and the W&RSETA, where they can participate as non-levy paying organisation that can host unemployed youths. The goal is to create new business owners instead of job seekers.

The SETA pays a stipend of R24 000 per participant per annum. The SETA pays an additional fee for accommodation, breakfast and dinner for Rharhabe learners and R500 per person for transportation for Jalamba and Kwandebele learners. The four SETA-accredited training providers ensure to promote rural gainful activities and skills development for self-reliance. Their responsibilities include the following:

- The pre-assessment and selection of prospective learners
- Adding If learners on the SETA System
• Enter into agreement with learners
• Submit compliant learnership agreements to the SETA for registration
• The coaching and mentoring of the learners
• The assessment of learners
• Internal moderations
• Uploading of learner achievements
• Monthly submission of learner progress reports and proof of learner stipend payment and Close-out reports at the end of the programme

In 2015 Learnerships for unemployed learners were conducted in the following rural areas

• Rharhabe Royal Kingdom trading as King Sandile Development Foundation (Eastern Cape)
• The Batlokoa Traditional Council in QwaQwa,
• Kwandebale Royal Mgibe II,
• Jalamba Traditional Council (Eastern Cape), and
• Mhlontlo Local Municipality (Eastern Cape)
Table 5.5: Rural Development Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Year</th>
<th>Project Name</th>
<th>BAM</th>
<th>BAF</th>
<th>BCM</th>
<th>BCF</th>
<th>BIM</th>
<th>BIF</th>
<th>WM</th>
<th>WF</th>
<th>ACI</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>ACTUAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>DG11/12, LP11/12 UYAP 11/12</td>
<td>470</td>
<td>772</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1281</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1297</td>
<td>1039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>DG12/13</td>
<td>651</td>
<td>845</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1578</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1594</td>
<td>995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>Various Rural Development Projects</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>Various Rural Development Projects</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>903</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1571</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>1483</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Statistics provided by the W&RSETA Head Office in October 2015

BAM/F = Black African Male/Female; BCM= Black Coloured Male/Female; BIM/F = Black Indian Male/Female; WM/F= White Male/Female; ACI= Total Africans, Coloureds, and Indians; D = people with disabilities. DG = Discretionary Grants; LP = Learning Programmes; UYP = Unemployed Youth Programme.

Table 5.5 above shows that there have been many more women participants (2 691) than males (1 768), and Africans (4 211) benefit much more than other racial groups combined (2 480). The number of PWDs increased from 1 in 2013/14 to 67 in 2014/15.
b) Registered Co-operatives project

Secondly, as part of its mandate to educate co-operatives, the W&RSETA has implemented a rural co-operatives programme in order to encourage and support community-based training initiatives. The ultimate aim of the project is to maintain a well-trained workforce and sustainable jobs. Furthermore, the project aims to support the co-operatives with the successful running of a business through the assistance and expertise provided by SETA-accredited training providers.

In 2015 (20 March 2015 to 30 June 2016) there were 15 registered co-operatives with a total of 206 participants drawn from Dihlabeng Local Municipality in the Free State Province.

Training was provided in the following skills programmes:

i. Store Person A: 27/833402,
ii. Store Person B: 27/833402
iii. Sales Assistant General B: 27/522301

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Year</th>
<th>Project Name</th>
<th>No. of organizations</th>
<th>BAM</th>
<th>BAF</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>ACTUAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>ECape BEE Co-operatives</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>DG1213 Co-operatives</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>341</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>Mhlontlo Co-operatives</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>Dihlabeng Local Municipality Registered Co-operatives</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Statistics provided by the W&RSETA Head Office in October 2015

Table 5.6 above shows that 240 African males were trained in the Co-operatives Projects compared to 669 African females between 2011 and 2015.
Table 5.7 Financial Investment in Rural Development Programme in FY 2014/15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Project Name</th>
<th>Financial Year</th>
<th>Sponsor amount</th>
<th>Number of learners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural Development</td>
<td>Traditional Councils Project</td>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>R9 702 000.00</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Development</td>
<td>Rural Areas Project</td>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>R11 475 000.00</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Development</td>
<td>Mhiontlo Local Municipality Project</td>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>R1 897 888.00</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: W&RSETA Head Office in February 2016

5.2.4 THE DISABILITY PROGRAMME
The W&R SETA successfully implemented a programme for People with Disabilities (PWDs) from 2008 to 2010. The SETA used to advertise for eligible learners with matric, i.e. PWDs who could not get access to jobs because they have no skills and were, therefore, often sidelined when competing with able-bodied people. The SETA placed them in a 12-month long learnership, which included a 30% theoretical component in class and a 70% practical component on areas such as merchandising, packaging, etc., at the workplace. Companies were also encouraged to provide additional industry-specific training where necessary. The SETA provided a two-week long orientation/work-readiness programme every January. In addition, the SETA provided a monthly stipend of R3 000 per learner for transport, food, and subsistence. Additional support, such as, prosthetic limbs (One leg can cost R20 000), hearing aids, and wheelchairs, was provided as required before classes began, so as not to further inconvenience the PWDs.

Table 5.8: Number of learners who participated in learnership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RACIAL GROUPING</th>
<th>2008-2009 Gauteng Province</th>
<th>2010-National Roll Out</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African Blacks</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indians</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloureds</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whites</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: South African Disabilities Development Trust (SADDT), 2010

From Table 5.8 it is obvious that by far the largest number of disabled learners were Africans both in Gauteng (99) and nationally (362). While there were slightly more females than males
nationally (184 and 178 respectively), there were slightly more males (51) than females (48) in Gauteng.

Table 5.9 Some of the disabilities of the learners in the Disabilities Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Disability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visual impairment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amputee – left hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-Polio Paralysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>System lupus erythematosi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congenital deformity - arm or foot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hard of hearing, speech and/or language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congenital deformity - feet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraplegic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albinism &amp; visual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muscular dystrophy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schizophrenia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cerebral Palsy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hemiplegic - right side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilepsy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amputee - left leg below knee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Sclerosis of both hands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Severe degenerative arthritis both lips</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.3 DETAILED FINDINGS

This section will highlight the “before” and “after” the intervention scenarios to show how each programme actually transformed the lives of the participants. The findings for each intervention programme are presented in more detail. So are the specific challenges experienced by the programmes’ beneficiaries. Recommendations are then presented for the W&RSETA to better implement the intervention programmes in order to improve efficiency going forward. Where applicable more detail according to different stakeholders is also provided. “Successes” in this section therefore identifies, describes, and justifies the factors that have influenced and led to successful transformation for each of the interventions. On the other hand, “Challenges” identifies, describes, and justifies factors that have hindered each intervention and have prevented or limited successful transformation. “Recommendations” for each intervention in this chapter suggest ways for the W&RSETA to have a greater impact on transformation over the next 10 years.

5.3.1 BURSARIES PROGRAMME (BENEFICIARIES)

- The students found the application process quick and user-friendly, thus enabling the deserving candidates to apply for funding without feeling excluded or
intimidated by the task. The application process is therefore inclusive in that regard.

- Most of the students were certain that they would not have been able to attend the universities had they not had the SETA bursaries, because they come from disadvantaged backgrounds. The statistics presented in Tables 5.2 to 5.4 also support this finding, as the number of black students who apply for the bursaries is overwhelming more than other racial groups, where banks, family members and relatives are often better able to assist with fees for tertiary studies in all three provinces. This shows that in this instance the SETA is contributing greatly to transformation, as over the long run demographics in the retail sector will be corrected.

- Overall, they felt the bursary amount was sufficient for meeting their basic needs as students (tuition, accommodation, and food). Many felt the bursary had made money one less thing to worry about, so they could focus on studying and doing well.

- Even the employed student who participated in the in-depth interview welcomed the financial relief provided by the bursary. He had worked full-time in order to pay for his first degree in a different field, and was therefore grateful for the bursary he was receiving from the SETA for his current W&R relevant studies. In short, he would have been able to pay for his own studies again, but not having to do so freed him to focus more and perform better in his current studies, e.g. he had subsequently bought himself a laptop, which enabled him to conduct research and to save money and time, as he did not have to travel to and from the campus solely for the purposes of using the computer centre.

- While many bursary students defined transformation as any programme that enables them to better their lives in a way that they would not have been able to before (for example, providing them with opportunities to further their education so they can find jobs easily upon completing their studies), they had not thought about whether there is any transformation in the Wholesale and Retail sector in general or not. They claimed to have no opinion or to be unsure because they are still students. In short, while they were certain that getting bursaries from the SETA was transforming their lives in an academic and/or personal capacity, they were unable to articulate a view as to whether or how the SETA played a role in transforming the industry outside the confines of their campuses.

- An overwhelming majority did not know of any other SETA interventions besides the bursary programme. Surprisingly, therefore, while the Bursary and Placement
programmes are linked at head office, because they are managed by the same officers, less than 20% of the students knew about the graduate placement programme. This limitation hinders the students from benefitting optimally from the SETA.

- The students—both males and females—did, however, believe that their qualifications would enable them to advance in the workplace. The only challenge they foresaw was that of having supervisors or managers who would probably have no qualifications but would hold them back because of their race.
- Only two of the 17 students in the focus group were working part-time or had held a holiday job.
- While the majority of students felt that they could own their own businesses, many did not know what kinds of businesses they would want to own exactly. They also feared that they would be held back by the lack of funding and the lack of knowledge about the businesses they would want to own, i.e., they felt they would need further training.

5.3.1.1 Challenges Expressed by the Beneficiaries

- All the students were very unhappy that they only received their bursary payments in July and August. Students studying Information Technology in particular felt that the SETA would do well to provide them with computers, as these expensive items were requisite equipment for them. It was often very inconvenient to use the shared computer centre, which closes at a set time, whereas students might need to work throughout the night on their assignments.

- Many students who did not do well in the mid-year exams (June 2015) blamed the SETA, as they did not have the requisite books, stationery, or accommodation close to the school. Some had to study in and commute from their overcrowded homes in the townships daily, share apartments with friends who did not necessarily share similar interests, or even co-habit with boyfriends. Those who could borrow money from relatives did so in order to make ends meet until they received their bursary payments. One student had still not received his bursary money in November. The students did not know why the funds were paid late.

- Some students did not receive their results because of non-payments from the SETA. As a result, they were not sure what subject areas to improve on until
August when their funds finally came, which is quite late in the academic calendar.

- The policies governing the continued support of students when they fail to attain full passes in all the subjects are not contributing to transformation, as stoppage of payments to such students without validating the reasons for poor performance is relegating them to lost opportunity for self-improvement.
- Most were unsure of how to get refunds, since they had had to pay for their own registration fees.
- They all felt the institution’s appointed bursary administrator was very rude and unwilling to help.

5.3.1.2 Recommendations for the Bursaries Programme

- The SETA should consider using radio instead of relying only on the internet and newspapers to recruit. The SETA also needs to raise more awareness about its bursary programme, so more matriculants can know about the opportunity it provides to for them to further their education and participate more meaningfully in the economy, especially in light of the current demands for free education.
- There should be an orientation at the beginning of the school year to ensure that the students know exactly whom to communicate with and what to expect or why the money is late (While the SETA claims to conduct orientation/information workshops as part of the implementation and roll-out activities, it was obvious that this is not the case for our sample).
- The SETA should find a way of articulating what “Transformation in the W&R sector” means and its contribution thereto in a manner that will educate its student beneficiaries to help meet the SETA’s broader objectives going forward. The orientation could be one of the platforms used to facilitate this process. Furthermore, the curriculum developed by the participating HEIs should be revised and updated in a manner that also enables it to assist in this regard.
- In addition, as the SETA already has a “captive audience” of beneficiaries, it should capitalise on that to educate them about its transformative initiatives and to create a network of informed, engaged, and motivated young stakeholders across the country—linking students quite early on to employers, industry conferences, international opportunities, and other relevant opportunities. This should be easy to co-ordinate, as many of the participants have cell/smart
phones and local or campus radio stations reach almost all the corners of the country.

- The SETA should encourage the students to expose themselves to work opportunities in the sector very early on, e.g. to find holiday jobs during their first or second year of studies in order to start accumulating the relevant work experience soonest and to apply the theory they learn in class. This would not only be in line with long established international trends but would also reduce the numbers of unemployed graduates and place them in a better position to engage meaningfully in the “real world” or broader W&R environment about what transformation in the sector ought to entail.

- The SETA should pay the bursary funds when the school year begins, so as not to incur blame for the poor performance of funded students. This is very important as the SETA does not pay for students to repeat courses they have failed.

- The W&RSETA website should have FAQs to share information that all participants should know.

- The SETA should appoint its institutional ambassadors with great care to ensure that they have the appropriate customer service skills and have the interests of the beneficiaries at heart.

- It is obvious that the system changes that were implemented in 2015 (e.g. moving away from relying on Careerwise and NSFAS as the fund disbursement service providers towards centralising this function at the head office), made for many of the delays and inconveniences experienced by all involved. The disbursement of funds in previous years had not been so awkwardly late. We recommend that in future proper project planning and change management should occur with sufficient human resources to make such momentous transitions as smooth as possible.

- As part of the monitoring and evaluation process, students should be able to provide the SETA with feedback anonymously for the purposes of improving the delivery of services meant to empower them and transform them economically. The administrators should take such feedback into account to improve the implementation of the programme.

- The SETA’s bursary office should keep very accurate data and statistics on its beneficiaries, in order to be able to provide more efficient services, to report effectively, to provide qualitative analyses of its statistics, to account for the career progress of its beneficiaries, and to conduct significant tracer studies.
about how this programme truly contributes to the transformation of the sector at large. This data capturing function should be available in-house. Currently the statistics are collated by Deloitte, are very hard for the bursary administrators to mine, and are too corrupted and inaccurate to be of much use to anyone. This is a challenge that the administrators at the head office expressed with great lament, and it has been difficult for them to give us statistics showing the participation rates over the past five years.

- As it is currently difficult for it to respond to all the queries (telephonic and emails) from all the students across the country timeously, it is advisable for the SETA’s head office to delegate the Higher Education Institutions to administer the bursary funds themselves and only provide the SETA with the relevant reports. The SETA could also investigate further what would be the most efficient mechanism to contribute towards the cost of studies, instead of micro-managing the minute details of how the bursaries are spent. More attention should be paid to facilitating better partnerships for the benefit of the students instead. That would lead not only to their faster absorption into full employment but also into their accelerated career advancement and economic upward mobility once employed.

- As one of the SETA’s objectives is to create a pool of young people who are entrepreneurial, i.e. who own their own retail businesses instead of being employed and who can also help reduce unemployment by creating jobs for others, it is important that rigorous entrepreneurial education and training becomes an integral part of the curricula in this sector. This would include information about accessing incubator programmes and new venture funding.

5.3.2 GRADUATE PLACEMENT PROGRAMME
The following discussion is based on interviews and focus group discussions we held in Gauteng province and on our review of the policy documents and implementation tools. We also conducted a survey requesting statistical data on how many interns had been absorbed or promoted among the current hosts in Gauteng, KZN, and WC provinces, but received a poor response. The findings of the statistical survey are discussed at the end of the graduate placement section.

The sources of data for this section are therefore as follows:

- 1 face-to-face interview with the graduate internship programme manager at the W&RSETA’s head office,
1 face-to-face interview with the senior executive who oversees the programme at the W&RSETA’s head office.

Survey results from 12 host employers

2 focus group discussions with interns in Gauteng—here used as case studies

Telephonic interviews held with three HR practitioners who manage the interns in three different store groups, and

In-depth interviews conducted with 11 graduate interns*

*Of the 11 graduates mentioned above, one was in the national offices of a government department in Pretoria. One was in a privately-owned clothes boutique, and nine had or were currently serving their internships within large retail or wholesale stores in Johannesburg and Germiston. Of these nine, four had been promoted to become managers and three are unemployed.

From the programme’s policy documents and implementation tools, as well as from the hour-long interview we held with the programme’s manager and executive director at the W&RSETA’s head office respectively, we have ascertained that this programme plays a very enabling role in transforming graduates from being students to being knowledgeable employees with the relevant minimum or entry-level experience. The aim is that in a transformed W&R sector, these graduates should be able to access jobs easily if they are absorbed by the companies where they were placed and should be mentored and provided with opportunities for upward mobility or career advancement within the many disciplines in the sector over time. Based on the reports they receive from the host companies, the administrators at the head office estimate that the current absorption rate is 60%. Whereas there are contracts and systems in place for this programme to contribute significantly to enhancing transformation in the sector, we noted the following challenges.

5.3.2.1 Challenges Pertaining to the Graduate Placement Programme

- Because participation is voluntary, there are very few participating companies compared to the thousands registered in the SETA’s database. There are currently only 38 hosts in the three provinces.

- Because companies have to recruit students themselves, this might be reducing their participation rate further. Entities are too busy chasing profits in a highly competitive sector to allocate time to looking for students. (From our visits to the sites of Retail Groups A & B below, we observed first-hand how incredibly busy store managers are.)
• Since both the bursary and the graduate placement programmes are managed by the same manager who reports to the same senior executive for both programmes at the W&RSETA’s head office, it is obvious that the human resources deployed to roll-out such a significant programme in the scale that is required for true transformation to occur nationwide across the sector are grossly insufficient.

• Because some of the interns have been able to give the SETA feedback directly, the SETA has been able to terminate those stores that do not treat the graduates well. However, the administrators, because of their heavy workload, have not been able to put proper systems in place to track the intern’s work conditions, their absorption rates, or their career advancement within the sector or elsewhere.

5.3.2.2 Recommendations (based on interacting with the Head Office)

• There are more SMMEs than large retailers. Interns get a wider experience in smaller retailers than large ones, where they are usually afforded fewer responsibilities. The SETA should therefore encourage more SMMEs and black retailers to appoint graduates across the various trade categories. (Only five of the 38 hosts in our survey were black retailers.) The SETA ought to investigate appropriate ways to incentivise SMMEs and black retailers to host and even employ interns.

• The SETA should develop a centralised online system whereby the companies indicate the number and qualifications of graduates they can take for internships and/or permanent employment, and the graduates should be able to apply to those companies directly.

• It is probably unnecessary for the SETA to consider absorption quotas if it identifies and recognises some retailers as training experts and the remainder as benefiting from that training by absorbing the interns after their tenure. Bigger retailers have better training infrastructure than SMMEs. However, if the former are forced to absorb large numbers of interns permanently, over time they will not have space to train graduates.

• While there are monitoring and evaluation systems in place for the bursaries and placement programmes it is not evident that these are used effectively to guide the SETA to manage the programmes optimally. It is recommended that the SETA, retailers, and HEIs investigate mechanisms for self-regulation. Innovative uses of digital reporting and monitoring systems should also be explored in this regard. The establishment of rigorous systems will provide a
better platform for evidence based decision making to strengthen the programmes.

- The SETA should create interactive platforms with which it holds conversations with retailers about exactly what “Transformation in the W&R Sector” should entail and the SETA’s strategies to optimise its contributions thereto. This will also help ensure that interns are absorbed, promoted, and are not used as cheap labour to replace permanent employees.

- The budding expertise of HR, Communications, and Marketing graduates should not be overlooked in this initiative. They know first-hand the kinds of challenges interns face.

- The SETA needs to encourage the use of the Alumni tracking system being developed on the WRLC website. This will help to track what happens to the graduates after their placement, perhaps tracking their career trajectories in the first five to 10 years. It will take another 10 years or so for the results of these transformation programmes to be fully evident.

- There is inadequate instrumentation of the agreements between W&RSETA and the participating organizations on how to maximize opportunities for the employment of qualified previously disadvantaged individuals. The major players in the industry are still managed by white conservatives who need more than the incentives for being BEE compliant to change their attitudes.

- The SETA therefore needs to ensure that the white, mostly male, senior executives in the large retail and wholesale groups are trained in Diversity Management and fully understand the benefits of having a diversified workforce at all levels.

5.3.2.3 Graduate interns’ perspectives – Case Studies
These case studies are based on two focus groups in Germiston (Gauteng). The first group was in a wholesale group, the second in a retail group.

a) Retail Group A
All four interns in this focus group (3 African females and 1 African male) are in the same branch of Wholesale Group A, which is a stable work environment with approximately 2000 employees, only a quarter of whom are permanent. All four had held NSFAS bursaries and are currently placed in departments that are relevant for their qualifications. These interns all work very closely with their managers and have consequently had a very positive workplace
experience. Their internship programme is coordinated by the HR department at the head offices, not where they are placed.

However, despite all the commitment they have shown, none of them is being absorbed by the company. With only a month left before the end of the internship, they are now so desperate that they are applying for any jobs—as security guards, call centre agents, receptionists, or anything, as long as they do not go back home to fold their hands. In other words, for this group of interns, who saw a very bright future for themselves as retail professionals, the biggest challenge has been securing entry-level access to permanent jobs, not only in their host company, but across the sector in general. Not one of them has been called back after any interview thus far. Instead, they are being told that they do not have sufficient work experience, which means after one year of working, they are still not considered good enough. Most companies require at least three years’ work experience. For more senior management positions, they require 10 years’ experience. These interns therefore recommended that the W&RSETA internship be extended to two or three years, thus better positioning them for consideration into permanent posts when it ends.

These interns are also discouraged by the 100% absorption rate of participants in the cadet programme. This is a sister programme whereby Wholesale Group A provides full bursaries for matriculants to study at UNISA while working for the company part-time. As part of their contracts, these cadets are guaranteed permanent employment upon completing their studies. The graduate interns, on the other hand, are only provided with workplace experience and then left to fend for themselves. Their sense of rejection is compounded by the fact that the interview process within the company is often biased. The departmental and HR managers seem to know beforehand whom they prefer for the advertised positions, and so the interns do not really stand a fair chance. When asked what they would like to be doing in five years, one desperately wanted to be an HR manager, and the second wanted to be a senior IT professional within the retail sector or elsewhere. Two of the four interns said they would like to be running their own businesses. One of these two was, in fact, in the process of registering a company to try set up a merchandising agency with his friends, who have worked as merchandisers in other stores.

b) Retail Group B

Here there were initially 50 interns at head office when the current interns started in April 2015. Over the course of the year some had resigned, and others had been offered better job opportunities elsewhere, or placed at the various branches of the company. Only 11 remained at the head office at the time of the focus group discussion. These were the 6 African females,
2 African males, and 3 Coloured males on whose experiences and insights we here report. The researchers learnt that many of the interns who had resigned had either been placed in departments not relevant to their qualification or had not been placed in any department at all. Not only was it a waste of their time to not be placed in any department for almost three months, but they also found it very demeaning to be made to clean toilets meanwhile, whereas their colleagues were performing professional tasks. They were even more disappointed when the officials from the W&RSETA’s head office seemed to condone such treatment, which was a total disregard of the effort and time the interns had exerted to obtain tertiary qualifications relevant to the W&R sector. One of the focus group participants was still in the Finance department filing and photocopying all day, even for other interns, whereas he held a qualification in Transportation Management. While he was not learning anything about Finance, he feared that quitting would not look good on his CV. Of the 11 who remained, only five had had work plans and four of those had been derailed during the course of the year. It is also important to note that five of the 11 interns had had NSFAS bursaries.

The interns in Retail Group B had had a rude awakening when a major company restructuring exercise took place in the middle of their tenure. All the senior managers were retrenched, as the holding company that had taken over Retail Group B had decided that Retail Group B’s executive functions would henceforth be executed from the holding company’s head office. Many interns in the focus group recalled how difficult a transition that was as they lost some of the resourceful mentors who had nurtured them both in the performance of their jobs and in their personal growth. After the retrenchments the interns had to take on much of, if not all, the work load that was left behind, hence their feeling that they were currently overworked and definitely worked much harder than interns should for only R3 500 monthly. The interns had apparently asked Retail Group B to top up their stipends to R5 000 after the retrenchments but that request had been denied, as the company claimed that the retrenchments had been part of a cost cutting plan. Consequently, while many of the focus group participants felt they were acquiring relevant technical and workplace skills, they also felt exploited and somewhat resentful. They were also disappointed to learn how little many of the permanent employees earned despite their hard work and commitment to the company, e.g. some permanent professionals earn R10 000 per month after 10 years on the job.

While the majority of those partaking in the focus group had experienced their internship in Retail Group B as an enriching introduction to the workplace overall, they were discouraged that there were no career paths for them, as there were almost no prospects for career advancement towards senior management positions for black employees. Ironically the
Learning and Development Manager in charge of the interns said none of the interns had become managers, because “They don’t seem to see further than what they are doing.”

In fact, unless a black General Manager is appointed in the near future, nine of the eleven were adamant that there were absolutely no career paths for black professionals within the company. In the Finance department for instance, there were four permanent white employees who had been doing the same job for more than 20 years. This means even if one of them would retire or resign, it would be impossible for a young black employee with less experience to be promoted to be their manager. In fact, while most agreed that their fellow employees treated them fairly, an in-depth interview with one of these interns revealed how he had been persecuted for being appointed as a manager after the previous manager had been retrenched. His fellow employees accused him of securing the job purely because of the preferential treatment espoused in the BEE Codes. They were very vocal in claiming that his appointment was unfair and unethical, even falsely accusing him of knowing the senior manager who appointed him before hand—i.e. before coming to the company as an intern. The promoted intern subsequently had to appear in many union meetings to justify his appointment. Even now some employees do not respect him because he is young. The senior manager who had appointed him did not waver, as the intern not only demonstrated immense potential but was, in fact, the best person for the job, with the right qualification and strong leadership skills. Now managing a team of 25 people after the retrenchment, the promoted intern was even given a salary increase and has been benefitting from the mentoring he is receiving from his senior manager, a woman who continues to nurture and guide his professional and personal growth. Needless to say, this intern feels that with the right attitude, a lot of hard work, and a supportive manager who knows how to develop talent and expedite the advancement of interns, one might be able to successfully explore horizontal career opportunities in Retail Group B’s branches in the short to medium term and gradually work towards senior management positions over time. Nevertheless, he sees himself owning his own manufacturing business in five years’ time. While the other interns may agree that there are opportunities for horizontal movement as administrators in the branches, they are adamant that they cannot see themselves ever being promoted to senior executive or even management positions even after 10 years in the company. This shows the importance of having black managers and senior executives as role models for the interns.

When asked where they saw themselves five years from now, five of the 11 interns expressed a desire to own their own businesses. Presently, with only a month left before the end of their tenure, only three interns were certain they were being absorbed by Retail Group B as
permanent employees. The rest had been going for interviews in other companies but had had no luck as yet.

PLEASE NOTE: Fifteen of the initial 50 interns who were registered by this retailer were eventually absorbed at the end of this internship cycle. This makes for an absorption rate of 30% in this instance.

Despite all these challenges, it is fair to report that while not wishing to remain as interns a day longer that they have to, the focus group participants in Retail Group B appreciated that this opportunity has opened their eyes to how corporates work and has given them a solid stepping stone towards their professional futures. They would not know half of what they know now about the workplace and their own career aspirations if they had not been in the internship. For instance, one mentioned how affirming it was when a manager actually implemented a new strategy the intern had proposed. Some felt valued when a manager paid them individual attention and showed them how to perform a task. Others highlighted how the internship had enabled them to make friends across the racial and gender divides. They now feel ready to join the workforce as capable professionals, not tokens.

5.3.2.4 Lessons from the case studies
The two case studies above demonstrate a number of key issues:

i. How the wide variance in the organisational cultures of two different store groups can make for dissimilar outcomes in the experiences of the interns.

ii. Why it would be effective to have strong internship co-ordinating teams at the SETA’s head and regional offices to ensure a standardised implementation of the programme together with the retailers.

iii. Why it is important for the SETA’s regional offices and retailers to come up with innovative mechanisms for monitoring and verifying the deliverables of the programme, e.g., that there are job descriptions in place, sufficient work for the interns to do, rotations take place, career guidance, job search skills are imparted, and feedback from the interns is considered. The model of appointing independent sector liaison officers would be worth considering.

iv. Why the SETA and its stakeholders must work harder to promote the absorption of interns into permanent jobs. All the interns in one and about 75% in the other store group had not secured job opportunities even though they have only a month left before the end of the internship.

v. Why the SETA must insist on the transformation and diversification of senior executive positions within the sector. Opportunities for senior black managers to act as role
models must be explored. Such exposure for interns to learn and showcase their work will help create a more conducive environment. Those interns in the retail group where there are black managers and senior managers are confident that they could also rise within the ranks of the company and become senior executives. Those in Retail Group B, where there are no senior black managers are almost certain that there are no opportunities for upward career growth for them in that organisation.

### 5.3.2.5 Successes – (Expressed by Interns)

The interns in both focus groups and those who were individually interviewed all agree strongly that the year-long internship opportunity helped them to gain valuable work experience. As they were fresh from their tertiary studies, they only had the theory they had studied in class to obtain their diplomas and degrees and absolutely no practical experience, be that in human resources management, information technology, retail business management, logistics, buying and merchandising, marketing, or accounting. Subsequently, the interns gained confidence from their accurate and timeous execution of the work they were assigned. Where they were rotated to different departments within the organisations that helped them to understand how the different parts work together to make a whole. So, they learnt about managing personnel, procurement, financial systems (e.g. SAP), merchandising, marketing, and what happens in the butchery, deli, front till, etc., depending on the nature of the organisation. As the internship comes to a close, they all agree that they each have a skill set they did not have before, one which they would have probably not gained had they not participated in the W&RSETA graduate internship programme. Overall, during the internships the resourceful managers and supportive colleagues imparted to them the skills and knowledge they have gained over many years of working. That they empowered them in so doing cannot be denied.

One cannot take for granted the significance of the “soft” or work place skills that the interns also learnt in the process. These range from something so culturally inappropriate for young black people with traditional backgrounds as looking managers (mostly white males) in the eye, or even standing next to one, to learning to speak in a crowd or stand up to defend one’s rights, e.g. asking to be paid for working overtime. For example, one IT graduate shared how she would be so scared if her manager stood next to her while she fixed something on his computer that her hands would literally shake. They also learnt telephone etiquette, as exemplified by one HR intern, who for fear of saying the wrong thing would just let the phone ring until it stopped if her supervisor was not in the office. In addition to verbal communication skills the interns
also learnt good written communication skills, such as writing business emails, minutes, announcements, and reports. All the interns agree that they learnt to work under pressure as they have heavy workloads and/or long work hours. Related to that is how they have learnt the importance of time management and good customer service. Other workplace skills that the interns learnt include problem solving skills, working independently (i.e. without supervision), being careful and accountable for spending other people’s money (e.g. when processing payments, salaries, or claims), keeping confidential information safe, and the importance of optimally managing one’s personal budget, e.g. paying one’s own rent, transport costs, or contributing to one’s family’s needs.

Based and the two focus groups and the 11 in-depth individual interviews (four of whom had become managers), the successes of the internships can thus be summarised as follows:

- The internship had been very useful in giving them relevant work experience in their respective disciplines. In fact, they felt they learnt much more in the workplace than they had learnt from the theory provided in class.
- There was proper induction when the placements started, whether it was only for a day or a week.
- In addition, they felt the mentoring provided by their supervisors, who transferred knowledge to them individually or during staff meetings, had been constructive.
- They also learnt tremendously from those co-workers who were supportive when they sought assistance.
- Being rotated and exposed to different departments, forced some interns to perform even those tasks in which they were not trained or interested. For example, one was forced to do a bit of financial work even though she had never studied finance before. Because she was not trained during the internship to do the finance work, she subsequently had to learn to ask others for assistance and figure things out as she was getting along. Thereafter, the same employer gave her a year-long contract in which her main activity is financial management, where she is now receiving proper training in that area of work. Had she not been rotated during the internship, she would not have even considered the financial management contract that followed. Another intern could not be placed in HR, his discipline, and was placed in inventory. While he was very apprehensive about this at first, he ended up enjoying inventory very much and applying for jobs in that field at the end of the internship. Sadly, he did not get any.
- In addition to enhancing their technical skills, the internship established workplace skills such as, self-confidence, time management, telephone etiquette, interview skills,
negotiation skills, decision-making skills, problem-solving skills, interpersonal skills, and customer service skills.

- The most significant outcome of the placement is that it made the participants more employable, as they now have workplace experience, have identified the possible trajectories for their careers, believe that they are capable of having successful and fulfilling professional lives, and are aiming higher than when they arrived not knowing anything about work.

- They feel that they are now in control of their destinies and will only have themselves to blame for not meeting their own potential and fulfilling their own goals, e.g., for not studying further or securing better jobs. Their internal drive and self-determination have improved greatly, as they seem to know what they need to do to get to where they would like to go within the W&R sector or elsewhere.

- Therefore, while not all the interns end up working in the W&R sector, the programme is successful in that it transforms their lives in a manner that enables them to partake in the larger economy as empowered young citizens. For example, after earning R2 500 monthly during the internship, one can now earn R11 000 on a government contract position, which she would most probably been unable to access had she not had any work experience. She now has more buying power and a better quality of life.

- As graduates coming straight from school with no work experience, the internship taught the interns what it takes to be a manager, e.g., starting from the bottom and learning the responsibilities of building trust between the staff and management, being the custodian of the organisational culture, ensuring compliance with all the government regulations and policies, etc. Unlike in other careers, it takes about five years after the internship for retail graduates to become managers.

- Some of the interns have been able to climb up the ranks to managerial positions. While this promotion can occur during the tenure of the internship in exceptional instances, for many it happens gradually in the course of about three to five years after securing permanent employment. For instance, one intern became a store manager of 68 employees after working in that family-owned store for three years. Another who was in the internship programme in 2008 slowly made his way up to being an HR Training Manager after five years. He has recently been promoted to being the HR manager of more than 500 employees in a new wholesale store the chain is opening soon. He now reports directly to the regional manager. All the HR Directors in this wholesale chain are black, which gives him plenty of role models across the country. There are also many black executives in-store. Consequently, he believes that with passion and commitment, many black people can succeed in retail, if only they would
stop thinking that retail is only for whites. His current annual salary package is approximately R420 000 (including annual increments since 2010, a car allowance, car insurance, and subsidised medical and pension insurances).

- Increasing the cohort of interns who become managers can help improve the working conditions of the interns and their overall experience. For example, one of the successful managers above acknowledges that his experience as a W&RSETA intern has helped him to know how to treat the current interns in the stores, e.g. recruiting people with the requisite skills and making sure he does not have too many graduates with the same qualification. He also excuses interns from coming to work on weekends, because he knows that depletes their stipends.

- In those instances where the internship was explicitly an opportunity for the employer to train and assess graduates for management positions, the interns had to demonstrate a true passion for the job, maximise profit, and meet all the expectations of the company. Demonstrating such commitment clarified not only their career choice but also distinguished them from their peers. “The internship helped me make the transition. Unlike at school, in corporate 65% doesn't determine your passing. The company expects 100% output and accuracy all the time, even on Public Holidays,” one of the interns who are successful managers said. The hard work definitely paid off in his case.

### 5.3.2.6 Challenges Expressed by Interns:

- A challenge expressed by most interns is that the workload is too much and the hours too long for the little stipend they earn. While they are contractually supposed to work eight hours per day and half-days on weekends, some in the stores end up working 10 – 12 hours per day and work the full weekend or even during Public Holidays. The intern from the government department also related how the permanent employees gave interns so much work that the permanent employees would end up doing almost nothing. If the interns complained, they were told that they should just be happy to even have the work opportunity. Even the department’s Human Resources unit failed to address this problem when the interns complained.

- In that government department the work load was even worse for female interns. While the male interns could blatantly refuse to do the additional work, the females were often too shy to refuse.

- While the majority of permanent employees were supportive to the interns, there were some who were very unwelcoming and would not even answer questions when interns asked. Such employees feared the interns had come to take their jobs.
• The provision of mentoring is uneven. Some managers generously impart their knowledge and skills. Others could care less about the interns’ development needs, as long as they work them like horses, and then force them to sign the requisite claim forms for the SETA’s stipend even if the store did not comply with its contractual obligations.

• Rotations were not always scheduled. Sometimes interns were kept for too long in one place, especially if the permanent employee had resigned, but were not fairly compensated. Sometimes a certain manager would get too attached to the interns and would not allow them to rotate. Some managers, especially in the smaller stores, barred interns from exposure to the administration or finance office (not trusting them with that aspect of the business). At times interns were made to wash trolleys and grocery baskets for far too long, instead of working with the floor managers.

• Working after 20h00 is a tremendous inconvenience as taxis often stop running at that time. Moreover, it is dangerous for the women who live far from work to be travelling back into the townships by themselves late at night.

• For some it is difficult to aspire for careers in retail when the pay is so little, the hours so long, and the working conditions so poor. They find the sector generally exploitative.

• The W&RSETA officer could not make time to visit some of the sites. In one site she came once towards the end of the 18 months. While the visit was informative for the interns, they felt they could have benefitted much more had they been visited earlier. They also needed the SETA to see their working conditions and monitor their adjustment to the work environment, i.e., to show that it cared about their wellbeing and was not just “throwing money” at them.

• The current interns receive R3 000 per month on average, the same as those who were in the programme eight years ago, i.e. in 2008 before the global recession.

• Another intern who also started his internship in 2008, is currently a Regional HR Manager of a big retail chain with an annual salary package of R460 000 including a 13th check and a performance bonus. Although he swears that he will never leave that organisation, he also believes he will never be promoted to be a Divisional Head, because everybody at the very top in his wholesale group is white. The positions of Divisional Heads are never advertised. White people, many of them Afrikaners, appoint each other, thus making those posts a “white men’s club.” Because whites have been in retail longer than blacks, they always claim black people do not have sufficient experience to be at the top of the food chain, so to speak. Often Indians are preferred over Africans with the same level of experience. So, this black Regional HR
Manager can move laterally to be a Regional Manager of another division within the group, but can never be a Divisional Head. It does not help him that the Divisional Head he reports to is a young white male who will take decades before he retires. His second option is to become a Director or Regional Manager in another retail group. Nevertheless, he asserts that black people who are dedicated, disciplined, and ambitious can have successful and rewarding careers in the W&R sector.

- Another challenge faced by interns is that training and development programmes are often offered to permanent staff only. So, many interns are excluded from such opportunities, which prepare staff for management positions. After the internship some graduates are retained as contract workers, which still prevent them from participating in staff development and management training programmes.

5.3.2.7 Recommendations (based on interactions with interns)

- While more than 70% of the interns heard about the opportunities from word-of-mouth, the W&RSETA should ensure that the internet, notice boards, and other forms of media advertise available internships and placement opportunities, so as not to exclude rural potential participants, for whom such opportunities might be even harder to come by.

- The SETA and its stakeholder must investigate ways to make sure that stores have work plans for each intern before finalising the contract. While cleanliness is important in retail for good hygiene and to attract customers, no graduate intern should be made to clean toilets at all or wash trolleys for too long. Interns found these tasks demeaning and demotivating. They felt a week of such manual labour is sufficient for them to learn how to do it and how to supervise others to do it later. “My heart used to be very sore when I was going to work knowing that I was going to wash trolleys the whole day. There are so many people who didn’t go to school who could do that,” one intern said. Thus the need for the SETA to get feedback about how the internship is going cannot be overemphasised. The end of each cycle needs to be assessed.

- Rotations should be planned and discussed openly with the interns during the induction.

- Employers should inform their permanent staff that the interns are there to learn, not to take their jobs. This might reduce the hostility and lack of cooperation that some of the interns experienced.

- It is critical that human resources offices assign interns to managers who are trained in mentoring skills, or groups of interns are allocated to trained mentors to ensure both their professional and personal growth. Mechanisms for incentivising mentors must be
investigated. Perhaps mentoring activities can be linked to the mentors’ Key Performance Indicators (KPIs).

- The monthly stipend of R3 000 has not increased since 2008. It is, therefore, insufficient and should be increased to keep up with inflation. Much of what the interns currently earn is spent on transport costs and rent, with barely anything left to spend on anything else or to save.
- If interns work longer than the stipulated time, especially during peak times, then they must earn more for the over-time.

There is a need for a sustained provision of career guidance for the interns, so they can be able to network and look for suitable opportunities long before the internship ends. Therefore, the SETA and its stakeholders should facilitate the development of networking opportunities or online platforms linking interns with employers for permanent job opportunities within as well as outside the sector. The SETA has already invested financially by offering NSFAS bursaries to about half the interns, if not more. Letting them go back home to join the ever growing pool of unemployed youth after the SETA’s placement stipends would be a waste of all the investments made thus far.

- The SETA and its stakeholders must ensure that the interns partake in the staff training and management development programmes, especially in the big retail and wholesale stores where the hosts can absorb such costs.

- The SETA must push for blacks to be employed in positions of influence in Operations Management and so on, (not only in HR), where they can make transformative decisions and change the structural racism that is so embedded in the W&R sector. For instance, every time a person retires or resigns, that departmental head must insist on a replacement who is qualified, competent, and black, so as to redress past injustices.

- The SETA should establish a comprehensive programme to develop and nurture the entrepreneurial skills of interns who would like to start their own businesses. About 40% of the interns wished to have their own businesses in five years. This is probably because close observation and active participation in managing retail businesses has given them the “know-how” and confidence to do it for themselves. This means the SETA is missing a big opportunity for increasing the number of skilled retailers by not helping them register their companies with CIPC and SARS, and by not assisting appropriate interns to access capital or incubation programmes that can launch these businesses. In this regard, the SETA should urgently explore synergies with other government agencies, e.g., the Small Enterprise Development Agency (SEDA), the Small Enterprise Funding Agency (SEFA), the National Empowerment Fund (NEF), the
National Skills Fund (NSF), the Independent Development Corporation (IDC), the Development Bank of Southern Africa (DBSA), even with private commercial banks.

- Furthermore, the SETA should explore opportunities for its registered levy-paying stakeholders to include the interns’ businesses in their Enterprise Development or procurements programmes, which are some of the pillars of the BEE Codes meant to transform the economy by encouraging the participation of PDIs.

- The SETA should form close ties with franchise associations to enable entrepreneurial interns to set up their own businesses under such structured enterprises, not only to create wealth for themselves and their families, but also to increase the pool and diversity of black-owned retail and wholesale businesses while reducing unemployment among the youth.

- Some interns, about a fifth of those in this sample, wish to study further and obtain Masters and even Doctoral degrees. Among this group are those who were inspired by their own lecturers, who are generally more theoretically inclined, and one whose late uncle had a doctorate. None of them is aware of any assistance that the SETA can provide for post-graduate studies. Extensive sectoral communication in this regard is critical. This is a cohort of potentially high-level academics that the SETA should nurture to help transform the composition and improve the skills levels of instructors and researchers in the retail faculties throughout the participating higher education institutions.

5.3.2.8 **Best Practices from Learning and Development practitioners:**

Individual interviews were held with three Learning and Development practitioners at their head offices in Gauteng. One is a permanent Education, Training, and Development practitioner in a wholesale chain. The second is a permanent training manager in a retail chain. The third is an independent project manager, who co-ordinates the W&RSETA internship for twelve different family-owned stores that are part of a retail chain. She saw a gap and approached the independent store owners with a proposal to source, manage, and report on the interns on their behalf. She contacts institutions to ask for databases of graduates and also sources some interns from organisations such as Volunteers SA. She also advertises the internships on Facebook. The Learning and Development practitioners, on the other hand, seem to rely on word-of-mouth—which has proved to be a very powerful recruitment tool—and on posters on their notice boards.

Some of the findings are that the Learning and Development practitioners complained that the administration of the programme at the SETA’s head office is poor or lacking. For example, grant claims from April 2015 had still not been paid in March 2016. In addition, the SETA’s
head office takes very long to give feedback. They also felt that despite the feedback they give to the SETA nothing changes. In addition, they also felt strongly that the SETA should increase the stipend, as the companies are not always in a position to top up.

The list of best practices below summarises the lessons the learning and development practitioners have learnt in their implementation and management of the SETA’s internship programme.

i. Each company should have a standardised induction programme, so all the interns get orientated at the same time and at the same venue for each region. This can be a short academy that prepares them for retail work in the various branches of the organisation. That way they will all know what the company expects of them and vice versa.

ii. It is better to rotate the interns to ensure that they are familiarised with as many departments as possible in the organisation or within their discipline.

iii. Interns get bored if not fully engaged, so one must make sure they are always learning new things—on the job and through training.

iv. Allow the interns to partake even in the management development programmes that are usually reserved for levelled/full-time managers, in case they are appointed full time later.

v. The stores must increase the number of their interns gradually or organically as the company expands. No one benefits when there are more interns than there are placement opportunities available.

vi. Some of the stores have high employee turnover or mobility. The Group HR manager in charge of the interns must make sure new line managers and branch HR managers are orientated well, so they can oversee the programme, monitor, and mentor the interns efficiently.

vii. When interns are pro-active and raise issues of concern, these should be acted on immediately as much as possible. This will limit the problem of interns hopping around from one store to another all in one year. Most of the interns are not in it for the money, as the stipend is so little. They want to learn. So, those who can facilitate that must make the interns’ learning experience as memorable and worthwhile as possible.

viii. Group Managers in charge of the interns who are not truly committed to transforming their lives, especially those from previously disadvantaged backgrounds, must look for other jobs. The responsibility of managing interns should only be reserved for people who see themselves as change agents, counsellors, coaches, hence the obligation to engage with the interns on a regular basis. Phone them, if necessary, to find out how
they are doing. Graduates must leave the internship because their tenure is finished or they got better jobs, not because the host company is ineffective.

ix. Some interns are scared to disclose where they are going when they get better jobs, for fear of disappointing their hosts or of seeming ungrateful for the opportunity they were afforded. The W&RSETA must encourage or even incentivise interns to use its newly developed tracking system in order to optimise its functionality. The stores and HR practitioners need to know how many get full employment and where. That way they can better prepare them for those industries that absorb them the most, or set up official links to serve as feeders to such entities.

x. The SETA should consider accepting sound clips or video recording the interns’ experiences. The current quarterly verification tool document does not give a clear experience of what the interns are actually doing. Besides the interns often do not see why it is important, and neither the HR manager nor the interns have time to fill it in.

5.3.2.9 Absorption rates of interns:
Table 5.10 below presents the findings from a quantitative survey conducted in February and March 2016. Emails requesting statistics on the number of graduate interns who had participated and those who had been offered jobs in the same companies were sent out to 38 host employers in the three provinces. These were followed up with multiple telephonic and email reminders over a period of four weeks. Twelve companies responded, thus rendering a response rate of 32%. The numbers below were submitted by the HR, Training and Development, or Talent managers of companies that vary in size, national footprint, ownership, and trade categories. Some companies are huge nationwide wholesalers or retailers, others are nationwide but privately owned. Some companies sell building supplies, others sell clothing, others sell groceries, and some pharmaceuticals. One entity is a government department. The numbers reflect all races and both genders of participants in those companies. The numbers presented below are approximate at best, as some entities reported the total number of interns who had participated (including those who resigned or were dismissed), while others reported only those who completed the internship. Regarding absorption rates, it must be noted that some companies reported only on the number of interns who were actually absorbed by the company, while others reported the total number including those who had been offered but had not accepted the job. The total number of interns who were absorbed or offered jobs also does not distinguish between the types of positions offered, e.g. permanent or short-term contract positions. From the respondents it would appear that 1427 out of 4503 interns were absorbed or offered jobs between 2004 and 2016. This reflects a 32% absorption rate, which is less than the 60% estimate projected by the administrators at the W&RSETA Head Office. Perhaps we can assume that more would be absorbed if they had
obtained workplace experience during their studies. Furthermore, we can also assume that most of the remaining graduates are gradually absorbed in other sectors, as graduates generally have a better chance of securing employment than job seekers with only a matric certificate. We should also bear in mind that some retailers are good at training large numbers of graduates every year, knowing that other businesses that cannot provide work experience will poach them at the end.

Only 10 out of 4503 graduates were clearly promoted to management positions in our survey, but this is probably inaccurate. As mentioned earlier, the retailers do not have templates, dedicated personnel, or tracking mechanisms for capturing the information we needed. This greatly hinders attempts at meaningful data collection, reporting, monitoring, and evaluation.

The major trade categories in which graduates participate and are absorbed are food and groceries as well as clothing and footwear. While the volumes of numbers absorbed by the larger retailers and wholesalers are much more than those of smaller entities, the percentages do not seem to differ across the various categories. In other words, whether a company absorbs a third or half of the graduates depends on each company’s business needs and strategy. One can, however, assume that all the participating companies have identified the diversification or transformation of their workforce as an important factor in their roles as responsible corporate citizens and in the sustainability of their businesses in the future. They reflect an awareness of the need to increase the number of black professionals or better skilled PDI as employees across the sector in all three provinces in particular and across the country in general. That so few companies participate remains a big limitation, especially given the high unemployment rate of youths in this country.
Table 5.10 Sample Participation and Absorption Rates of Graduate interns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Retailer</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Total Interns Participating</th>
<th>Total Interns Absorbed or Offered Jobs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>2012 - 2015</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>2004 - 2015</td>
<td>3,684</td>
<td>1,013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>2012 - 2016</td>
<td>382</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>2012 - 2015</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>2014 - 2016</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>Not Stated</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Not Stated</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>2012 - 2015</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Group A</td>
<td>2010 - 2015</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>2014 - 2014</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>2012 - 2016</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>2014 - 2016</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL 12 Companies</td>
<td>11 years</td>
<td>4,503</td>
<td>1,427 = 32 % absorbed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.3.3 THE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

The National Certificate: W&R Informal Small Business Practice NQF Level 3 Qualification has no age restriction, is open to all aspiring entrepreneurs with a Grade 8, and does not exclude participants who are already in other government programmes, e.g. the Extended Public Works Programme (EPWP), thus making it a vibrant and inclusive programme, which enables the economic participation of a wide range of rural inhabitants.

The findings and recommendations below are based on the following:

- Our in-depth interview with the programme manager at the W&RSETA's head office,
- One focus group discussion in a Royal Kingdom (11 learners in KwaNdebele),
- Four in-depth interviews with rural learners (1 in Witbank and 3 in KwaNdebele),
- One Royal Prince--the programme’s custodian in KwaNdebele
• Two entrepreneurial skills training providers engaged in the implementation,
• Our observations of the operant environment, and
• Our assessment of the programme implementation and assessment tools.

5.3.3.1 Findings (Rural Programme Manager’s Perspective)
• The Qualification offers a high quality of education that the learners can be proud of, that means it is not condescending to the rural poor by offering them a low quality of education. NQF Level 3 is middle level training.
• An overwhelming majority of rural learners are black women, who are by far among the most disadvantaged in the country. Seeing that rural men tend to obtain jobs in the cities and mines, while women are left behind to tend to the children, the elderly, and the sick, the fact that this programme helps advance non-farm entrepreneurial activities to improve the women’s self-sufficiency and, by extension, food security is a good indicator of a successful transformation initiative.
• The Rural Development Unit’s expertise ensures that through this programme, it helps to eliminate the red tape, funding frustrations, barriers to entry levels, lack of awareness, and the lack of skills development. The support and experience of the implementation team aims to demystify the “lonely road for the entrepreneur”.
• The outputs are practical and relevant, as the learners have to open a bank account for them to receive their stipends. They register their businesses with the CIPC and SARS. For many these activities alone create a “mind-shift” and transform their self-worth as they begin to see themselves as owning real business—not just pursuing hobbies, and being on a path to financial freedom.
• Overall, the quality of the participants’ lives improves as they become better able to provide for themselves and their families (buying fridges, apparel for selling, etc.) with their profits.
• To date, 46 Mhlontlo learners are already certificated; 282 of 457 reached 100% credits; 189 from KwaNdebele and Rharhabe Royal Kingdom are prepared for external moderation and others are prepared to complete outputs of the Qualification. Learners were prepared to register their companies with the CIPC by December 2015, meaning that they are now legally trading South Africans. This also demonstrates that the training providers are competent mentors and the sector liaison officers (SLO) employed by the W&RSETA do indeed monitor and verify the existence of learner businesses.
• During pension pay out days in the rural villages, the learners go out and sell their products; this is evidence of knowing their customers and targeted market. These
learners are in all respect true entrepreneurs, regarded as micro traders in their villages and small towns. Previously the bulk of the government grants that are paid out on market days would be spent in big retail stores, thus enriching those who are already wealthy. These rural development initiatives are reversing that pattern, even if in a miniscule scale at present.

- The entrepreneurial skills are spreading indirectly to other members of the families, as they often end up assisting the direct participants. For example, if a learner opens a hair braiding salon, the mother might assist by washing the clients’ hair to prepare it for braiding and a sibling or father might assist by cutting the hair of those clients who prefer short hair with a clipper.

- The programme ensures sustainability by encouraging learners to diversify their businesses. For example, while waiting to sell blankets bought in Durban on market days, one could be selling fat cakes and scones in the meantime. They are also being encouraged to form co-operatives where possible, e.g., a group of hair stylists joining forces to open a larger hair salon instead of individually competing for the same clients.

- The written and oral English skills of the participants have improved, as they are taught in English. As a result, some are now better able to assist their children with homework. These are spin offs which are not financial but have the potential of improving the children’s confidence and of opening up better opportunities in future (higher pass rates at school, better prospects of owning a business later, securing a job, etc.).

- The programme not only provides employment for the W&RSETA Sector Liaison officers to monitor and verify deliverables of the programme; but has helped to galvanise Royal Kingdoms and Traditional Councils into more organized and responsible stakeholders. For example, they must take photos as evidence of work done, ensure the learners are buying stock and selling, and that the businesses are growing.

- By implementing its interventions for rural gainful activities, the programme has not only created sustainable income-generating businesses within the villages, but has also mobilised relevant financial services providers, e.g. SEDA, SARS, and banking institutions, to create legislative awareness and provide non-financial assistance.

5.3.3.2 Challenges Facing the Rural Development Programme (Manager’s Perspective)

- While many gradually improve their English language and comprehension skills during the course of the programme, for some the numeracy components remain an obstacle.
• The national annual target of 500 is too small, thus making the impact of this transformative intervention insignificant. (The manager suggests a target of at least 1 500 participants by 2018 and that other SETAs must join forces).

• The SETA should enable TVET Colleges to offer this qualification as some have compasses in rural areas and also increase the number of accredited training providers to be able to deliver the learnership as far and wide and as fast as possible.

• As the penetration of foreign nationals into rural areas has increased at an exponential pace, indigenous South Africans have to compete with people with international entrepreneurship qualifications, since these were introduced as far back as the 1990s in countries such as Nigeria. In short, foreign nationals have an advantage over locals, who due to the legacy of apartheid’s economic and educational policies are just beginning to learn entrepreneurial skills.

• It was difficult for the W&RSETA to get information about the rural development programmes or interventions implemented before the current manager assumed her position 18 months ago (in 2014), thus indicating a lack of continuity and a loss of institutional memory. It is therefore critical that accessible and user-friendly data capturing and archiving processes be implemented in order to keep proper records and analyses of the transformation to which the SETA contributes.

5.3.3.3 Successes Based on the Rural Beneficiaries’ Perspective
The following successes were elicited from a focus group and in-depth interviews with the rural learners in KwaNdebele and Witbank. For the most part, they concur with much of what the programme manager had shared.

• The majority of the participants are vibrant, young women (mid-20s to mid-30s) with a matric qualification. They are articulate and speak English quite well. Having had access to English medium schools and their proximity to town has helped render them more urbanised than one would expect of learners in traditional royal districts. However, while their oral communication might be good, their written communication is not on par. Therefore, attending the workshops in which manuals are written in English has helped to improve their English writing skills, which is important in a country where English is the language of trade. The learners are very proud of their success in conducting market research and writing their business plans.

• One of the in-depth interviewees found the W&RSETA’s year-long Level 3 NC: W&R Informal Small Business practice NQF Level 3 Qualification learnership even more informative and transformative than the three-year diploma she had obtained in
Business Management from a reputable private college without any experiential learning. She found all the modules useful, even though some of the candidates were challenged by the numeracy component, as they had been out of school for very long. Consequently, she found the learnership to be transformative not just because she could add another qualification to her CV, but because she feels capacitated to successfully own a business.

- It was also transformative for her colleagues who saved their stipends collectively and now own a successful co-op selling “Big Chickens”, which is also the name of the co-op. In fact, the majority of the learners noted that anyone who participated in the learnership with a serious commitment to owning a business at the end—which is main outcome of the Qualification—should be able to do so by the end of the year.

- All the learners agree that the manner in which the modules are taught, the care that the service providers take to explain concepts (even in isiZulu and in Sesotho where necessary), as well as the practical nature of the exercises, all contribute to meeting the educational needs of the learners. This supports the programme manager’s insistence that the SETA’s Level 3 Qualification is of a very high quality. (The skills training providers have shown immense commitment to the programme. Train four different groups in KwaNdebele, for instance, means they are on site every week for four to five days.)

- All the learners own tablets, as they were encouraged to buy these to be better able to access the internet for research purposes, e-banking transactions, and general electronic communication, such as CIPC on-line registration, which saves them from going all the way to Pretoria just to register their companies. Sometimes the skills training providers email additional educational resources to help understand the lesson more thoroughly. For the most part the learners still rely on the isolated internet stores (1 or 2) in the villages for printing, but it is liberating that they can perform most of the functions that require Information Technology from the palms of their hands.

- The stipend had enabled those learners who had been running their businesses on low budget before to “beef up” their facilities and buy more stock. For example, one such learner who has a catering company bought more office equipment—a laptop, printer, and a laminator. This enabled her to diversify her business, as she now types CVs and laminates for clients during the week, since catering is often needed only on weekends. Moreover, she was able to purchase her own material for decorating at evens where she caters, and to better maintain her car, so she can attend briefing sessions for government tenders in the nearby small town. Another learner who was already selling isishebo, snacks, and cool drinks, used her stipend to build a double garage. On one
side she opened a small spaza shop. On the other side she employed someone to run a hair salon. Therefore, the stipend has enabled her to also diversify her business. Although she cannot drive, she also bought an old bakkie (small van) for R2000 and is not able to buy more stock. Her husband now drives her to buy stock, thus getting involved in the business as well.

- Those learners who did not have existing businesses have used their stipends to set up from scratch. The range of small businesses that have been set up is quite diverse. It includes buying and selling traditional Ndebele arts and crafts with the aim of partaking in national expos and exporting to international markets; buying fruit and vegetables from town and selling from a stall; selling airtime from a machine, selling fast food (chips and quarter loaves with relish); and selling cleaning products for cars, domestic use, and pit toilets. Many were able to buy stalls (R1 500 each), put shelves, and hire a van to buy bulk stock from town.

- All in all, the learners now see their businesses as enterprises (not just pastimes), from which they can make a living within rural economy economies. They have learnt to separate their business accounts from their personal savings accounts; to keep records and invoices; manage cash flow; order stock; as well as customer service skills. All of them now have the basic requisite business skills and big goals on how to grow them and create jobs for unemployed youth in their villages.

5.3.3.4 Challenges (Rural Learners’ Perspective)
The learners were overwhelmingly grateful for the programme and therefore did not perceive much to complaints about. Nevertheless, the researchers identified the issues below as needing to be addressed.

- While some of the learners found the intense lessons of benefit, forcing them to work hard under pressure, others felt that the modules had too much information to be absorbed during a four or five-day session. They wished for some of the modules to be spread over two training sessions.

- Some learners found the large geographic area over which the programme was spread to be an inconvenience, as they had to take two taxis to get to the workshops. Switching from one taxi to another can cause long delays at the taxi rank, which sometimes made them late for the workshops.

- Most learners lamented that they did not have mentors who could give them advice when dealing with difficult clients or suppliers. Although they had been taught Conflict Management skills, they sometimes faced challenges that they wished they could
discuss with more experienced business owners who could coach them on how to resolve conflicts with clients or suppliers.

- The absence of practical workplace experience was cause for dissatisfaction for some of the learners. For instance, they desired workplace experience where they could see how the bookkeeping is actually done, instead of relying only on the theory and practical exercises they did in their manuals in class.

5.3.3.5 Recommendations Based on the Beneficiary’s Perspective

- Those learners who are challenged by some of the concepts should be provided with extra support. This might mean encouraging or even incentivising the “fast learners” to tutor them in a peer-to-peer teaching experiment.

- The learners expressed a need for the SETA to follow up with a Business Management learnership. Now that they have set up their small businesses, they want to learn to manage human resources, first-aid to be able to assist employees in an emergency, etc., as the businesses grow. It is very expensive for the learners to register for such courses in the private colleges, which are often far from the villages. Online options or more advanced courses currently among the SETA’s offerings should be made available.

- The participants had impressively big dreams for how they could improve the local economy if given capital and proper guidance. For instance, one wants to learn to do upholstery and manufacture furniture (to compete with the Zimbabweans who monopolise these home industries in their communities). They want to be trained as plumbers, so they can install pipes and taps for rural homeowners. Some wish to manufacture diapers, cleaning products, and hair pieces (weaves). One even wishes to have a fried chicken franchise. Yet another wishes to sell gas and petrol in Zimbabwe, where such commodities are bought from private suppliers instead of petrol stations. The SETA and relevant stakeholders should rise to the challenge and run pilots on how to transform these small and micro traders to big retailers and wholesalers (as they eventually would like to compete with the established local Indian retailers who monopolise such businesses in the rural areas). Otherwise, the young men will be limited to aspiring to own car washes and taverns, while the women are relegated to selling pap and vleis and braiding hair.

- It is, therefore, evident that there is a pressing need for the SETA to implement a very well-structured system for assisting learners to access capital and incubation programmes to help bring their entrepreneurial dreams to life. This will transform the sector by having more entrepreneurs who are actually properly trained to manage and grow their own businesses, instead of being employees in other people’s companies.
Otherwise, while the programme manager sees the programme as raising awareness among funders and policy makers, at present it seems the participants are left to sink or swim on their own after they finish their learnerships.

- To ensure efficient delivery, the SETA’s “access to capital, growth, and markets” funding and incubation programmes can be in-house services hubs tailored to suit those who have completed the different learnerships. Alternatively, the SETA could also explore the possibility of having a dedicated W&RSETA desk in the existing regional offices of the public and private small business development agencies and incubators, e.g. SEDA, SEFA, the National Skills Fund, and the National Empowerment Fund. The learners in the KwaNdebele district reported that the local DTI office had been unable to assist them previously when they had sought assistance. All the more reason why the SETA should develop a structured approach instead of the learners seeking financial help individually.

- Appropriate business mentors would have to be identified. For instance, all the entrepreneurial graduates from the bursaries, placement, disabilities, and rural programmes could participate in the Enterprise Development programmes of the many big retailers and wholesalers that are registered with the SETA. This, of course, would improve the companies’ BEE score cards while also creating truly sustainable small businesses.

5.3.3.6 Observations and Recommendations from the Skills Training Providers

This section captures some of the insights that were provided by the two skills training providers: one trains the learners in the four districts participating in the royal kingdom in KwaNdebele, where the learnership started in April 2015. The other provides skills training in the royal kingdom in Qwa Qwa, where the learnership commenced in March 2015. While the various royal incumbents have approached the W&RSETA for assistance themselves, the skills training providers were appointed by the Royal Kingdoms.

- The skills training providers agree that the learnership is transformative, because capacitating and developing the business skills of the previously disadvantaged to reduce rural poverty and unemployment is beneficial to the participants and their communities. The development of the SMME sector is predicted to be the main factor in reducing unemployment. This programme has the potential to enable the participants to be meaningfully engaged in their municipalities’ local economic growth, in the W&R sector in particular, and in the larger national economy going forward.
To that effect, the learnership definitely meets the training needs of the participants, as they are desperate for skills development and mentoring. The facilitators can see an immediate up take of skills upon commencement of training. It is also worth noting that only 2 out of 120 learners and 1 out of 255 dropped out in Qwa Qwa and KwaNdebele respectively. The two physically disabled learners in Qwa Qwa were accommodated by ensuring that the venue was accessible to them, so they would also participate optimally.

The facilitators see the drafting of the business plan as the most successful initiative, as in one document it gave the learners confidence in their ideas, motivates them on the way forward, and also shows the learners how far they have progressed during this programme.

The Maths module is always enjoyed the least. It has compulsory unit standards including three dimension and a few other intense maths strategies that the learners need to learn. As a result, the facilitators are considering implementing more user friendly examples to assist learners.

Going forward the skills training providers will focus more on the SARS and CIPC registration from the outset, as learners need a lot of assistance with this process.

The skills training provider have found the programme manager at the head office to be exceptionally helpful during the delivery of the learnership. She assists with queries and guides them where relevant. She implements relevant suggestions immediately. For example, while all learners needed SARS and CIPC registration, these agencies did not have offices in the rural areas. The programme manager kindly directed the providers to the assistance of SEDA and FNB.

5.3.3.7 Recommendations made by the Skills Development Providers:

The lack of funding opportunities for learners to grow their businesses is the biggest challenge. There needs to be a lot more structural and economic development in these areas so learners have a higher probability of successfully establishing long-standing business.

The SETA should consider offering a further year of mentorship to the students, as the theoretical lessons and portfolios of evidence alone are not sufficient for entrepreneurial development.

Training in rural areas must continue. However, earners must be given more assistance upon completion of the programme, e.g. links to study further and more funding opportunities to grow their businesses to the next level.
5.3.3.8 Observations by the Royal Custodian

The Royal Prince in KwaNdebele is very active in encouraging his subjects. He makes sure the learners attend classes and even persevere through the Mathematics in the numeracy modules. It seems some of the learners did not take Mathematics at school and others had been out of school for long and initially thought they were just going to get money, not realising that they would have to work so hard for it. The role of the Prince as an enlightened traditional leader and custodian of the programme primarily is to ensure the proper implementation of the programme at the local level, i.e., to hold all the stakeholders responsible for their deliverables—the SETA, the training providers, and the learners—accountable. The royal incumbent has to call community meetings to publicise the programme; ensure candidates who meet the set criteria are appointed; monitor that all payments are made on time, that learners use their stipends to buy stock and grow their business, etc. The prince sees the programme as having the potential to alter the economic landscape of their villages. He observes that since the programme started in 2015, there is an increased level of economic activity, enthusiasm, and focus, which was not there before among the educated but previously unemployed youth. The learners are taking their businesses seriously, because the W&RSETA has also taken them seriously.

5.3.3.9 Recommendations made by the Royal Custodian:

- While R2 000 per month might suffice for those learners who were already owning businesses, it is insufficient for those starting from scratch. They need a bigger stipend.

- Currently the W&RSETA is focusing only on small and micro businesses in the rural areas. Even these cannot grow fast enough if the majority of villagers are unemployed and therefore cannot support them. The SETA needs to work closely with the traditional councils to plan opportunities for the newly established businesses to thrive. The prince is very keen to ensure the long-term sustainability of this rural development programme, and so recommend that they be assisted by the W&RSETA in planning to keep it sustainable. This should not be a short-lived success story for any of the stakeholders. “Learners must not be in class today and be hobos the next day,” the Prince warned.

- To ensure sustainability the W&RSETA needs to collaborate with the AgriSETA, the manufacturing SETA (merSETA), and so on, to go beyond small and micro businesses to actually establishing medium and large capital intensive industries. For instance, in fertile soil such as that found in Mpumalanga, huge vegetable gardens can employ many people while supplying big retailers. This means more people will have money to
support the small businesses that are springing up in the village. Such vegetable gardens would also ensure food security. The local Arcelor Mittal steel factory had closed down in the Witbank area, thus leaving many people in KwaNdebele unemployed and despondent. There are fewer males in the learnership as most males seem to prefer agriculture to any other training. It also seems that some of the males did not believe that this learnership programme would kick off or would be a success. Therefore, more attention needs to be paid to changing their attitude to developmental programmes.

- The Prince also recommended that the W&RSETA provide him with running costs to ensure the smooth administration of the project. This would not be money for making profit but rather to make sure he, as an administrator, does not have to use their own personal funds or resources from other traditional councils' activities to subsidise this entrepreneurship programme.

5.3.4 FINDINGS ON THE DISABILITIES PROGRAMME

The following findings are based only on the in-depth interview held with the manager who administered the programme while it was still active from 2008 to 2010.

- The majority of learners were black women, who are among the most disadvantaged due to their race, gender, class, and disabilities.

- The programme was successful, as the pass rate was more than 80%, and the absorption rate was 60%. About 70% of those who were absorbed into permanent employment were offered mainstream jobs.

- The SETA was able to negotiate with the stores to take even PWDs with no matric, provided the SETA conducted a two-week work readiness intervention with them.

- As in the Graduate Placement Programme, the participants had rotation which exposed them to different floor managers or supervisors. Thus they were not only mentored, albeit informally, but were also exposed to diverse management styles in the various sections, e.g., as front line tellers, in receiving, or in merchandising.

- At present each of the SETA’s 10 regions (Gauteng has two) has PWDs placed in the stores, but there is no central database in which they are registered as such. They are being mainstreamed and are there almost by chance, with no special accommodations, support, or work readiness training provided for them by the SETA.

PLEASE NOTE: In March and April 2016 the researchers tried unsuccessfully to interview and get statistics from the managers in charge of PWDs in some of the
largest nationwide retailers. This roll out, managed by the regional offices has hundreds of current participants, but we were not able to engage with them.

5.3.4.1 Challenges Facing the Disabilities Programme

- Some of the learners were so used to feeling sorry for themselves that they would take long to adjust to the fast-paced, time-bound, and profit-driven environment of retail stores.
- Some employers did not have any empathy or were impatient, as some human resources managers had not made them sensitive to the accommodations some learners needed.
- At R3 000 monthly, the learnership paid more than the Disability Grant of R2 000, but it was difficult to get a Disability Grant again after being in the learnership if one remained unemployed. This somewhat discouraged potential participants from applying for the learnership. It also led some learners to become fraudulent by trying to get both the Grant and the learnership or by going from one learnership to another if they could not get work at the end of the W&RSETA’s learnership.
- Sometimes it took long to get the learners paid through the store from the money for the learnership, because the employers took long to get them on board. Some employers delayed the process, because they were busy with their own schedules or did not like the learner assigned to them.
- When the employers were allowed to participate in the interviews, so they could appoint the learners themselves, they delayed the process by not showing up as a result of their busy schedules. Such behaviour showed some measure of disregard for the learners.
- With regards to the head office challenges, the W&RSETA’s programme administrators are frustrated by the lack of interest that the Department of Social Development (DSD) has demonstrated by not finalizing the MoU that would enable the two entities to partner in providing support for PWDs. While the SETA approved a budget of R20m three years ago, nothing has been done to move the process forward, as this does not seem to be a priority programme for the DSD.
- Another implementation challenge is that there are limited training providers with experience to assist PWDs. The programme came to a halt in 2010 when the auditors declared that the tender could not be given to the same service provider anymore, notwithstanding the fact that the South African Disability Development Trust (SADDT) was the only entity that could carry out the work at that time.
5.3.4.2 Recommendations for the Disabilities Programme

- The SETA needs to actively engage PWDs and bring them on board if it seeks to contribute further to the transformation of the W&R sector by having them on board.
- The SETA also needs to engage the relevant stakeholders to increase the pool of training service providers who can assist PWDs.
- The SETA and participating retailers should keep an accurate database of the PWDs currently in the stores.
- The SETA should trace the career progression of those learners who participated between 2008 and 2010 to learn how the intervention contributed to their transformation in the long term. What lessons can be learnt and how can those be used to improve the programme in future?
- The SETA’s finance office should confirm if the R20m is still available and efforts must be made to find out what or who exactly is causing the delay from the DSD’s side. Perhaps signing the MoU and ensuring the rolling out of the Disabilities Programme according to the MoU should be a KPI whose lack of implementation carries material consequences.
- While the government is correct in encouraging collaboration between different departments and agencies, perhaps the DSD is not the correct partner. It might be worthwhile to explore alternatives and to think more creatively about other entities that might want to assist and how.
- The SETA should make a strong effort to communicate and raise awareness about its contribution to transforming the sector by empowering PWDs. This will encourage more PWDs and companies to participate, thus improving the quality of the lives of PWDs, their participation in the sector, as well as their overall activism as economically active citizens.

5.3.4.3 Successes Based on the Beneficiaries’ Perspective

Three PWDs were interviewed: one’s leg was injured in a car accident (currently employed in another sector after completing the W&RSETA learnership); one had suffered a stroke which affected her right hand and leg (currently unemployed and was not in any learnership); and the third suffers from depression (currently unemployed after completing an in-house learnership implemented by the retail store). One of the ladies had been in the original Disabilities programme that was rolled out from the head office. The other two were in the programmes that are implemented by the regional offices, where they did not get any specific support for PWDs. They were just there on their own.
The interviewee who had been in the structured programme, felt that the W&RSETA orientation and learnership programme had transformed her life by enabling her to get a certificate that qualifies her to hold a supervisory role, thus potentially opening up management opportunities for her. She was subsequently absorbed and employed by her host company for three years. On the other hand, she was disappointed because her daily responsibilities at the till were not supervisory, and so she was not practising what she was learning from the theory provided in class during the supervisory skills learnership.

Nevertheless, as these PWDs had had no retail work experience since leaving the basic education system, such exposure in a formal employment environment was beneficial. It taught them new technical/industry-relevant skills, such as, till operation, business management, and computer skills.

General workplace or “soft” skills learnt include telephone etiquette, customer-service, negotiation, and interpersonal skills, as the participants were in retail environments in which they assist many customers and in which co-workers were often unaware of or not accommodative of their disabilities.

The interviewees emphasised that another positive outcome of working is that they are forced to get out of the house, to work under pressure, to socialise at work and in their communities (e.g. joining savings or burial societies), and to stop feeling sorry for themselves.

In addition, the learnership stipend or income they earn when permanently employed enables them to get off the disability grant, thus giving them a sense that they are able to take care of themselves and can even contribute more fully towards improving the quality of life of their families. As a result, they have more self-confidence and are able to set goals for the future.

5.3.4.4 Challenges Based on the Beneficiaries’ Perspective

The biggest challenge is that while some had completed the learnership, they do not have a matric. This makes it difficult for the company to put one in a position where she can supervise people who have matric, even if she has completed the Level 3 learnership for supervisors. For that reason, the participant was only exposed to the credit department for three days and was then returned to the till, because she did not have a matric.

While there might be a co-worker who is sympathetic and helpful, it appears that the majority of co-workers are generally not informed of the concessions that the PWDs need.
Even the physical working conditions are also not accommodative of the PWDs. For instance, they are sometimes expected to lift heavy machinery, climb steep ladders to get materials from very high shelves in the store room, wear heavy metal-reinforced safety boots. Sometimes the passage ways are too narrow for them to walk through, or they are expected to sit down for too long until their legs swell. Sometimes the elevators in the stores are not in working condition, thus affecting not only the disabled employees but the disabled customers as well.

Because of the sense of independence and the improved business management skills the interviewees gained in the workplace, two of the three expressed a very strong desire to own their own businesses: one as a caterer, the other as a dressmaker since she had made ends meet by making clothes for others before the learnership. Their biggest challenge in this regard is the lack of capital.

5.3.4.5 Recommendations Based on the Beneficiaries’ Perspective

- The HR department should sensitize the co-workers to the needs of the PWDs in their midst, even before the PWDs arrive if possible.
- If the intention is to “mainstream” the PWDs, i.e., to treat them the same as all other employees, the PWDs should be properly briefed, so they know what to expect and not feel they are treated unfairly or greatly compromised by the employers.
- The SETA should, together with retailers, investigate appropriate monitoring mechanisms, e.g., to find out how the PWDs are handling their jobs and how the employers can better accommodate them.
- As both the original head office and current regional office disabilities programmes are able to negotiate that the employers take the PWDs even when they have no matric, it is imperative that the W&RSETA ensures that those who qualify register in the SETA’s learnerships which are equivalent to a matric or register for a proper matric, even if online. It is obvious that the learnership and exposure to the workplace alone do not suffice for them to progress as much as they would if they had a matric certificate. They may never be promoted to become managers.
- The SETA and its stakeholders should assist entrepreneurial PWDs to access capital and to partake in small business incubation programmes that will truly transform their lives by making them independent business owners, who can partake meaningfully in the economy as they pursue financial freedom. This will also enable them to create work environments that suit their disabilities while reducing unemployment.
• It is imperative that the head office and regional SETA offices communicate with all the beneficiaries in a co-ordinated manner about the wide range of transformative skills development opportunities the SETA provides.

• Another issue that transpired in the interviews is that those PWD who are capable of driving have registered for learner’s licenses but these often expire before they have money to pay for driving lessons. The SETA should therefore explore the possibility of assisting those who show real resolve by acquiring their learner driver’s licenses with funds to complete their driving lessons, as this improves their ability to participate further in the W&R or in the economy at large.

5.3.4.6 The W&RSETA’s financial Investment on the Four Interventions
Table 5.11 shows the amount of money that the SETA has investment in the four programmes over the past six years in all the provinces. Partnering with relevant entities, increasing the number of participants, and augmenting the amounts of the stipends will lead to more successful transformation in each intervention.

Table 5.11 Financial Investments made by W&RSETA in the four interventions between 2009/10 and 2014/15 (Provided by the Head Office in March 2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programs</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2009/10</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W&amp;RSETA Bursary programme</td>
<td>36,494</td>
<td>41,332</td>
<td>139,441</td>
<td>73,135</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>290,402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate placement</td>
<td>44,171</td>
<td>6,544</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2,769</td>
<td>53,484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural development</td>
<td>23,074</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5,757</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabilities</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>4,036</td>
<td>18,575</td>
<td>710</td>
<td>8,189</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>31,625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>103,854</td>
<td>51,912</td>
<td>158,016</td>
<td>73,845</td>
<td>8,189</td>
<td>2,769</td>
<td>381,268</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The budget for the Bursary Programme is determined by the number of students to be funded according to targets set by the Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET). For the Graduate Placement Programme the amount is determined by the number of graduates that participating companies take. The budget and number of participants for Disabilities learnerships depends on the targets set by the Sector Skills Planning Unit and approvals by the SETA’s Board. These targets also take into account the availability of funds and recommendations for DHET.

Our findings are that while the SETA’s financial investment is sufficient for bursaries, it is insufficient for the remaining three programmes. Stipends for graduate interns need to be increased as suggested above. The stipend for rural learners might suffice, even if barely, for
those who already have micro-businesses when they embark on the learnership. However, for those who must set up their businesses from scratch, it is too little. In addition, the local/royal administrators need to be provided with an adequate budget to fulfil their duties optimally. Moreover, for the Disabilities Programme, while the stipend in 2010 might have been slightly more than what the Department of Social Services was providing PWDs, it is still insufficient considering the special needs they have regarding transportation and assistive devices. Skills training should not be seen as an end in itself. Skills training is only a means to an end, and the SETA needs to invest a lot more resources to achieve true transformation over time. Financial resources and partnerships must be developed to increase the number of sustainable entrepreneurs resulting from these interventions. Graduates must be promoted to managerial and senior executive positions in a fair and transparent manner to speed up efforts to redress past imbalances. The SETA needs to investigate efficient ways to make that happen. The SETA also needs to strengthen partnerships to raise public and sectoral awareness about the last three interventions, especially the Disabilities Programme. Finally, more innovative solutions will be required to sufficiently capacitate the human and IT (data capturing and analysis) resources allocated to these interventions at the regional offices.

5.4 TRANSFORMATION IN OTHER INTERVENTIONS

The following section is a brief overview of how the transformation agenda is being implemented in some of the other major W&RSETA programmes. It is based on a review of some of the most recent impact assessment reports that were commissioned by the SETA in 2015.

5.4.1 THE RETAIL MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME (RMDP)

The RMDP seeks to impart and improve the skills managers need to be more effective in meeting the organisational goals of excellence within the W & R Sector. In terms of the Sector Skills Plan, the development of retail managers has been identified as a key requirement in driving the transformation of the sector in a proactive and innovative approach. The substantial shortage of skilled middle managers and the lack of retail relevant qualifications at this level determined the need for a management development programme. In 2014/15, 350 students, of which 150 were women, were enrolled in this programme. There were 304 who successfully completed the 2014 RMDP and graduated in March or April 2015 (W&RSETA 2014/15 Annual Report, p. 53).
A recent study commissioned by the W&RSEeta on the second group to undertake the RMDP found this intervention to be successful (RMDP Impact Assessment Research Report, 2016). RMDP II had 207 registered learners for this retail-customised MDP Level 6 NQF qualification in 2013. Of the 56% who responded to the survey, 43% were promoted after completing the course. All the respondents and their line managers agreed that the RMDP had been relevant and had a very positive impact on the participants’ abilities to analyse data and convert it into business intelligence. Most notably, the improvement in management skills was evident in dealing with poor performing subordinates, understanding consumer behaviour, and implementing the business strategy.

While the study specifies that 67% (78 out of 116) of the respondents were male, thus highlighting the dominance of males in the middle management sector, unfortunately it does not specify the racial demographics of the managers in the programme. Neither does it specify the racial and gender demographics of the 43% that were promoted after completing the course. It is obvious that there needs to be a concerted effort to recruit more women in line with the Department of Education’s target of 54%, which mirrors their prevalence in the national population. Furthermore, an understanding of the race and gender of those who were promoted would help us ascertain the extent to which upgrading one’s management skill through the RMDP contributes to the equity targets and transformation of the W & R sector. In addition, from this impact assessment it transpires that while the participants learnt the importance of the people side of the business (human resources and leadership), they felt that this aspect of the course was not allocated sufficient time. The course emphasised the business elements more. Consequently, one of the recommendations of the study is that the course designers and the organisers should include a section that specifically addresses transformation within the sector.

All in all, the course was very relevant for the purposes of improving the business and managerial skills of the participants and their organisations. Subsequently, many of the participants attributed their recent personal and professional growth to it. However, as most of the respondents said when we interviewed them in Cape Town and Durban in July 2015, even as middle managers they often do not know their organisation’s transformation agenda and targets. This means, back in the workplace, their enhanced HR management and leadership skills will not necessarily drive the transformation agenda in so far as that relates to advancing and empowering PDIs. Secondly, one of the black women store managers who had completed the course expressed her disappointment at the lack of opportunities for her to give feedback or share what she had learnt with senior management, the overwhelming majority of whom are while males. Back in the organisation, it was not always easy to implement or
practice what she had learnt in the classroom. She also feared that the store, whose profits she had grown successfully for three years, would be given to a white manager after its physical and infrastructural expansions were completed, despite the fact that she had undergone and completed the RMDP. This means for her the racial and gender considerations were still very challenging even though she had improved her managerial skills through the course. It is worth mentioning that out of the nine participants we met in Cape Town and Durban, there was only one black and one coloured female manager.

5.4.2 THE INTERNATIONAL LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME (ILDP)
The ILDP, which was in its 7th year in 2015, is one of the SETA’s flagship programmes. As an NQF Level 8 qualification for people who hold Bachelors degrees or have 10 years of experience as managers in the W & R sector, it seeks to increase the talent pipeline of highly promotable historically disadvantaged leaders, who have been earmarked for senior or executive positions in their companies. There were 49 candidates selected for the 2014/15 ILDP, and 43 successfully completed the programme (W&RSETA 2014/15 Annual Report, p. 52).

The findings of the recent impact assessment of the ILDP (2016), whose participants travelled to the USA, Canada, India, and China, showed that the programme improved some of the skills sets required by the participants to obtain excellence in their fields. For example, they developed strategies and competencies for continuous learning, including reflective thinking, self-awareness, and developmental relationships. They also experienced personal changes in the way they thought about problems, in their behaviours, or in the way they felt. Compared to how they would have without the programme, they also accomplished projects more successfully. Furthermore, they got exposure to international best practices in supply chain management, improved their understanding of financials in the W & R sector, gained a better appreciation of factors that drive entrepreneurship (in India, in particular), and learnt how to apply research findings in decision making, among other lessons that were of benefit.

Regarding the transformation of the SETA as it addresses the advancement of PDIs in particular, it seems some aspects of that goal were also accomplished. Many participants (not specified how many or what race and gender) were, indeed, promoted to roles of bigger responsibilities after completing the programme. Some were even poached by other companies. While there were more men than women participants, the quality and number of women was significant. Indians were more represented than other black people, meaning that Indians were perceived to be more empowered through this programme. This reflects that Indians are currently more represented in higher management positions than other black
groups. Another observation pertaining to the need for transformational thinking and planning was that some of the socio-cultural and business practices in some cases made the acquired knowledge irrelevant in the South African context. In this regard, it was concerning that Nigeria, which is the largest African market as well as the largest host of South African businesses outside South Africa, was not identified as one of the programme’s sites for experiential learning. Nigeria is a relevant market, which the participants need to understand better. Another observation was that there is no established modality or strategy for domesticating acquired international knowledge and experience, to the benefit of the W & R sector, not even to address transformation or diversity management.

It is obvious that in addition to new and very relevant managerial and business skills that the managers and executives acquire in the RMDP and the ILDP programmes, there is still a need to increase the number of qualifying black African and Coloured managers of both genders. Their increased participation will address the transformation mandate by keeping issues of diversity management in the centre, thus encouraging senior decision makers to not only examine and practice them, but to also bring them into the mainstream of excellence within the W & R sector. Our research has clearly established that younger black and women retail professionals gain more confidence and become more enabled when they have older black and women managers and senior executives as role models to retain them in the sector.

5.4.3 THE SOUTH AFRICAN DISABILITY DEVELOPMENT TRUST (SADDT)

The SADDT project, also funded by the W&RSETA, was developed to provide people living with disability an opportunity to undergo a two-year NQF Level 2 learnership in Wholesale and Retail Operations from 2011 to 2013. An impact evaluation of the SADDT project found that the objectives were met for the most part. A total of 404 learners were registered across six SETA regional centres, and the target of qualifying at least 60% of them was met. In fact, 69% of the learners qualified. Experiential training in the W & R environment had a positive impact on the self-confidence of the learners. Seventy-four percent of the learners scored the theoretical teaching as very relevant to the workplace practical learning and exposure. Seventy-seven percent of the beneficiaries also rated the overall training programme as very useful and relevant for entry into the wholesale and retail industry, as they gained knowledge, skills, and experience. However, 113 learners dropped out, mostly citing difficulties in transportation. In addition, only 44% secured employment, which fell short of the target of 60%.

As the evaluator suggested, the difficulty of securing employment reflects the persistent challenges that people with disabilities face, as they are still discriminated against. Many employers still limit them to certain jobs that they deem fit for PWDs, e.g. till and switchboard
Another disadvantage was that the NQF Level 2 learnership was rather basic, thus not enabling participants to qualify for managerial or bigger responsibilities. Furthermore, inefficiencies in selection of the candidates and in the management of the project, which was outsourced to a private service provider, further compounded the low employment rate. For example, some of the training facilities were not accessible to the learners (no lifts); some of the training providers were incompetent, thus making the provision of training inconsistent across the different regions; and some learners were promised assistive devices which they never received.

The study also found that the exposure to retail operations gave some of the learners the impetus to start their own businesses. This concurred with the evaluator’s findings from the literature reviewed from Malawi and Zambia. Consequently, one of the recommendations was that the SETA needs to secure access to credit facilities to enable PWDs to establish their own micro-enterprises. As was already highlighted in the interviews conducted with PWDs in our own study, the inability to access funding to start their own businesses has led the beneficiaries to focus on finding work rather than on creating their own retail outlets upon completing the learnership. The urgent need to provide qualified learners with financial assistance and other value-adding support to start their own businesses cannot be overemphasised.

From the above findings, it is indisputable that the SADDT project was transformative, as it gave all the participants exposure to the retail workplace, and almost half of those who completed the course access to permanent jobs they might not have gained otherwise. The training and development opportunity produced a combination of tangible and intangible benefits, including increased financial independence and self-confidence. Nevertheless, it is obvious that one of the SETA’s responsibilities as the retail sector’s umbrella body is to help improve physical infrastructure to enable PWDs better access to the retail environment, e.g. lifts, computers with Braille, etc. Possibilities of partnering with the Department of Transport, corporate bodies, NGOs, and other organisations to improve transport facilities for PWDs should be explored. Perhaps establishing sectoral awards for companies that demonstrate a more proactive approach to engaging and enabling PWDs will help galvanise such initiatives.

Moreover, information workshops or forums that increase the managers’ and co-workers’ sensitivity to the needs of PWDs need to be held frequently and on an ongoing basis. These should not be once off interventions only at the beginning of the project. Enabling PWDs to share their experiences in such forums will help improve the general appreciation of their capabilities and the strength of the human capital they can bring to the retail environment.
To ensure the sustainability of such a project, it is necessary, as the evaluator recommended, to offer PWDs a higher qualification, e.g. an NQF Level 3 or higher. This will enable learners to acquire higher competencies and additional skills that would retain them in the sector. In other words, the SETA should also demonstrate more confidence in their capabilities.

5.4.4 CONCLUSION
To conclude this section, it is obvious from the RMDP, the ILPD, and the SADDT projects that the need to incorporate and emphasise the SETA’s transformation agenda is pressing. The SETA must actively communicate and promote its vision of a transformed sector in all its interventions. It must ensure that all stakeholders share this vision and that it permeates all the planning and implementation activities as much as possible. Effective transformation takes time to achieve, but the SETA’s role is to continuously and emphatically make the obtainment thereof a priority. Having said that, it is evident that all three projects above have indeed enabled a more meaningful participation of PDIs at the entry, middle, and senior professional levels of the W & R sector. They are gradually transforming the sector by steadily increasing the number of highly trained black, women, and PWDs with sector-specific qualifications that enable their upward mobility within the industry.
CHAPTER 6
CONCLUSION

Our research sought to:

- Provide a profile of the transformation over the past 10 years in the W&R sector by focussing on the contribution of four entry-level SETA programmes: Without a doubt, the sector is transforming steadily. It might take another decade or so to see truly radical change, but all indications are that both the SETA and the retailers have implemented numerous interventions to eventually make professionals in the sector more representative of the South African population’s demographics. All four programmes take people who would probably have remained unskilled and/or unemployed and give them opportunities to obtain qualifications, job, or business opportunities in the W & R sector. This obviously improves the quality of their lives by making them more meaningful participants in the South African economy. Although the number of companies currently participating in the four identified interventions leaves much to be desired, the various trade categories were represented in the companies in which graduates held internships. They were also represented in the companies in which the PWDs held their learnerships. By far the most active trade categories are food and groceries as well as clothing and footwear. It is imperative that all the trade categories get a lot more involved in all the interventions.

- Provide measurements (quantitative or qualitative) for each of the four identified interventions’ impact on transformation: The detailed findings on each intervention, based on the literature we reviewed, the documents provided by the administrators, annual reports, and on the data we collated from focus groups, interviews, and the survey show that all four programmes have been successful in promoting transformation. However, what has been achieved thus far should only be seen as the beginning. A lot more work needs to be done to ensure that the end results of all the skills development and training are achieved. These include more managers, senior executives, retailers, and industry leaders who are black, women, rural and disabled. Another end result of the SETA’s interventions and financial investments should be more public and sectoral awareness about the SETA’s transformation agenda.
Identify, describe and justify the factors that have influenced and led to successful transformation for each of the interventions: In the tables and figures presented throughout the report we have highlighted the fact that having blacks, women, rural, and people living with disabilities as the largest participants in all the interventions plays a significant role towards transformation. Beyond the racial demographics, we have also shown the geographic distribution between urban and rural municipalities, as well as between Gauteng, KZN, and the Western Cape provinces as much as possible. Overall, access to adequate bursary funding for students, obtaining work experience in the retail environment for graduate interns and for PWDs, and learning how to set up a small business for rural participants have, in the main, all been successful factors.

Identify, describe and justify the factors that have hindered each intervention and have prevented or limited successful transformation. It is obvious that the number of participants has to increase exponentially; mentoring is critical across the board; access to finance, incubation, and best practices in entrepreneurship development is crucial to reduce unemployment and increase the number of successful black retailers; developing innovative mechanisms for self-monitoring or partnerships for verifying the deliverables of the programmes is critical; maximising innovative uses of digital media and IT resources to improve implementation, data analysis, and stakeholder engagement is imperative.

Suggest ways to have a greater impact on transformation over the next 10 years: The recommendations summarised for each intervention in this conclusion (and detailed in Chapter 5) suggest ways for the SETA to improve the efficiency of its implementation strategies, so as to strengthen its role in transforming the sector over the next 10 years.

In order to provide useful and implementable recommendations, our research focused on the four programmes below. This allowed us to be specific in identifying, describing, and justifying the factors that have influenced or hindered successful transformation. Focusing on the four programmes to measure the role and achievements obtained by the W&RSETA in transforming the sector also helped to obtain a deeper understanding of its performance in entry-level programmes in particular.
The Bursary Programme for retail students in public tertiary institutions.
- The Placement Programme for retail graduates
- The Rural Development Programme for unemployed rural learners with Grade 8 as a minimum qualification, and
- The Disabilities Programme for matriculants with disabilities

The study intended to assess the factors that contribute to the successes or constraints of the achievements by conducting a review of relevant literature, policy, and programme framework documents. Our review of international literature indicated that successful transformation results from carefully designed and interconnected interventions at different levels. The literature review also demonstrated how policy legislation cannot overcome the entrenched racial boundaries and some achievements could only be realised when the companies accepted and agreed to the objectives of transformation. Transformation is therefore best achieved where organisations create an enabling environment, potentiate the individual through education and raised self-esteem, and also create opportunities for the individual to succeed.

In order for the researchers to understand how key issues were manifested in the identified programmes, thereafter the researchers interacted with the beneficiaries, facilitators, well as with the programme managers and senior executives at the SETA's head office.

Below is a summary of our findings and recommendations for the SETA and retailers for each of the programmes, as relevant.

### 6.1 THE BURSARY PROGRAMME

#### 6.1.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS:
- The provision of bursaries plays an important role in helping to transform the sector. The students, the majority of whom were black females from financially disadvantaged backgrounds, greatly welcomed the bursaries, as almost all of them agreed they would not have been able to pursue tertiary studies otherwise. The SETA is thus playing a strong role in transforming the sector by creating an ever increasing cohort of future skilled employees and potential managers, who will gradually assume empowering roles in the sector.
• Many had no vacation job and no workplace experience at all but believed their qualifications will help them advance in the workplace in the different trade categories.
• They had not thought about transformation in the sector.
• They were very unhappy that their payments were late, as this caused them great inconvenience academically and socially (failing tests and exams, squatting with friends for accommodation closer to campus, etc.)
• They barely knew a thing about the SETA’s other programmes,

6.1.2 RECOMMENDATIONS:

• Students must be encouraged to secure vacation jobs from their first year of study. This will help them apply the classroom theory in a practical environment to improve their class marks, while helping them accumulate the number of years required as work experience to obtain full employment after graduation.
• There is a need for more workplace experience models between W&RSETA and HEIs, (e.g., retail shops and simulation centres) to give learners workplace experience during their studies.
• The SETA must in conjunction with academic institutions design a curriculum that clearly articulates and teaches students what transformation of the sector means or should entail.
• The SETA and all stakeholders should create interactive platforms, e.g. digital chat groups, executive forums, workshops, and conferences for discussing the benefits of a transformed sector and how to implement effective and sustainable changes.
• Not paying attention to the entrepreneurial potential of students has hindered their participation in the sector as independent retailers, thus forcing all of them to be job seekers. The SETA, HEIs, and retailers must work together to identify, train, and mentor entrepreneurial students, so they can get relevant business operating experience, incubation, and capital to set up their own businesses after graduation.
• Insufficient human resources capacity at the SETA’s head office has compromised the optimal implementation of the bursaries programme, as it was not possible to entertain any additional value-adding interventions or monitoring. The SETA needs to review its policy of paying actual costs for students and rather contribute to the cost of study by giving the Higher Education Institutions mandate to disburse and manage the funds on its behalf. The current policy has resulted in centralised micro management and immense pressure on the SETA’s human resources.
• The SETA’s head and regional offices need to be capacitated to keep accurate statistics on beneficiaries current and past, as well as on financial investments made on them.

6.2 THE GRADUATE PLACEMENT PROGRAMME

6.2.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

• The provision of workplace experience helps to transform the sector, as the majority of participants are PDIs, who many not have had access to the work environment otherwise.
• Employer participation is voluntary, and employers must search for their own candidates. Currently less than 40 companies participate in the placement programme in Gauteng, KZN, and WC provinces, which are the three most economically active in the country.
• Many employers have no job descriptions or qualification relevant work for the graduates, as a result some interns are delegated to menial and demeaning tasks such as cleaning toilets or washing shopping trolleys.
• Many mentors are not trained to help guide the personal and career development of the interns.
• The stipend has not changed in at least eight years.
• The SETA does not visit enough to monitor the progress of the interns and their working conditions, or to engage the store managers on what true transformation entails.
• Seeing successful senior black managers is encouraging for the interns. Such role models help interns understand what it takes to get to the top, i.e., the length of time, the enabling mechanisms, the requisite personal attributes, etc.
• At least 30% of interns would like to have their own businesses five years from now.
• There are also interns who wish to study further towards Masters and even Doctoral degrees.

6.2.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

The small stipend impedes the retention of graduate talent within the sector. The SETA must increase the stipend to keep up with inflation and to motivate interns to further their careers in retail, as they are often discouraged by the low wages in this sector.
• The SETA must engage SMMEs and all trade categories more rigorously and articulate its transformation agenda clearly and widely to increase participation.

• The SETA must encourage more SMMEs and black retailers to participate. It must investigate mechanisms for incentivising them. Since there are a larger number of smaller rather than big retailers, this will open up a lot more opportunities for training and/or employing graduate.

• The SETA must investigate how best to incentivise retailers and also facilitate the development of online and other networks for advertising internship and job opportunities. Please see this UK fashion retailers’ job link as an example http://www.fashionworkie.com/jobs-apprenticeships.

• The lack of training for mentors limits their potential as enablers. Mentors need to be trained appropriately to help provide career guidance, define career paths, ensure interns job shadow floor managers, and generally maximize personal growth and on-the-job management development opportunities for the interns.

• The SETA needs to identify and acknowledge those retailers who have exceptional capacity to train graduates for the rest of the sector. The rest of the retailers can then be encouraged to absorb them.

• The SETA also needs to work closely with retailers to hold industry job expos, information sharing workshops on best practices, and other networking opportunities for interns to learn from previous participants who have risen to management positions.

• The lack of efficient tracking mechanisms and tracer studies makes the SETA unable to monitor and evaluate the role it plays in transformation through this intervention. It takes about five years on average for interns to advance to management positions. The SETA must take advantage of advances in information technology to monitor this using electronic template, video clips. The sector needs a well-structured (log book approach) workplace experience system. The SETA therefore needs to consider how it can liaise with retailers, HEIs, sector liaison officers, and other stakeholders to improve the implementation and monitoring of this transformation programme. This way the SETA can monitor the interns’ working conditions, protect them from exploitation, disseminate information about other SETA programs, and continuously engage retailers in general, not only HR managers, on the its vision for a transformed sector. In two focus group discussions with managers who had graduated from the W&RSETA’s Retail Management Development Programme in Cape Town and in Durban we found that diversity management and the transformation of the sector had not been taught in the entire duration of that course, even though there had been an HR module.
• Taking into account how unemployed interns who have completed their tenure can participate in those mechanisms would help to retain them within the sector.

• The absence of proactive interventions for advancing entrepreneurial graduates after they complete the internship relegates them to unemployment or to be disillusioned job seekers instead of empowered job creators. The SETA, retailers, incubation, funding, and development agencies must collaborate on how to accelerate the participation of entrepreneurial interns in the economy as independent business owners, who can eventually establish successful large enterprises. Franchise organisations, government’s small business development agencies, Enterprise Development practitioners, and experienced industrialists must all be engaged to realize this as a critical and tangible end result of the monies spent by the SETA on bursaries and stipends. Creating more sustainable black businesses needs hand-holding, financial and emotional support, as well as unwavering commitment from well-established white retailers.

• The absence of active graduate recruitment for doctoral studies is regrettable. Participating HEIs must identify and enable suitable graduates to pursue post-graduate studies here and abroad, so as to develop a cohort of locally relevant but globally astute academics and knowledge generators for the retail sector. More black role models in this discipline will also encourage research and more considered strategies of how retail careers can enable the higher-level participation of PDIs and break historical racial and structural barriers in retail professions.

6.3 THE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

6.3.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

• The rural development programmes adds immense value to the SETA’s transformation plans, as it focuses on the rural poor, especially women. Most learners are young people, who would otherwise be unemployed, as there is no farming or commercial activities in their villages. These communities are often left out as many development initiatives tend to focus on urban and peri-urban communities.

• The rural learnership is of a high quality and has practical outcomes, e.g. market research, business plans, bank accounts, and the registration of the new micro-enterprises with the CIPC, SARS, and ultimately with the SETA as non-levy-paying entities.
• The curriculum has the added benefit of improving the English language, numeracy skills, and technological connectivity of the learners (They use tablets for research, banking transactions, and general electronic communication). The improved language skills and use of ICT equipment also benefits the children of the learners.

• The learners have learnt to save money, to buy stock and equipment, diversify their offerings, and get other family members involved, so as to change their hobbies into real businesses.

• It transforms the rural economy without pushing rural people into towns and cities, thus possible creating jobs and livelihoods for the rural poor in their own communities.

• It is facilitated by very committed skills training providers.

6.3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

• The amount of the monthly stipend (R2 000) is an impediment, as it restricts the learners’ abilities to establish and grow their businesses. They desperately need sufficient start-up capital to buy stock and expand in a manner that will make their businesses truly viable and able to compete with the foreign nationals whose businesses are much better capitalized.

• The learners need mentoring and practical exposure in bigger businesses for perhaps three to 12 months to be able to apply much of the theory they learn in class, e.g. bookkeeping, inventory, etc.

• The learners need assistance accessing wider markets (international or local expos, arts and craft shows), capital, incubation, Enterprise Development programmes, etc., to grow their businesses and create more jobs.

• Other SETAs (e.g. AgriSETA which can help establish big gardens), development banks, and other relevant entrepreneurship enabling agencies of the state need to be engaged to maximize the sustainability of the rural micro-enterprises.

• The learners have identified other kinds of businesses that are needed in the villages. These are capital intensive, but if implemented well, they have the potential to change the landscape of rural economies from lifestyle enterprises to high-growth industries. These include factories for manufacturing furniture, diapers, cleaning products, hair extensions (weaves), etc., all of which are needed even in the villages these days. It is recommended that these business opportunities be explored.
• The SETA must work with the traditional royal councils to increase the participation of men and change their negative attitudes towards such developmental interventions. The more men earn incomes the larger the potential market for the new businesses in the villages.

• The national annual target of 500 is too small, thus making the impact of this transformative intervention insignificant. (The manager suggests a target of at least 1 500 participants by 2018 and that other SETAs must join forces). The number of participants must be increased remarkably.

• The SETA should enable TVET colleges to offer this qualification as some have compasses in rural areas and also increase the number of accredited training providers to be able to deliver the learnership as far and wide and as fast as possible.

• Now that the micro-businesses have been set up, it is important to follow up with a learnership on business management to keep the momentum going and impart higher level business skills to enable the sustainability of these enterprises.

• It is necessary to track how the businesses fare after the learnership, i.e., how revenue grows, number of employees, etc., and how to optimize success.

PLEASE NOTE: In 2016 the W&RSETA’s Executive Manager for Small & Micro Enterprises (SME) Support has been working with the W&RSETA’s Regional Managers to hold a series of road shows to revive rural SMMEs across the country. By February 2016, 696 SMMEs had attended the road show, which has a very packed schedule, in six provinces. The road show engages and provides information to SMMEs by involving representatives from the following organizations:

• NYDA (National Youth Development Agency),
• CIPC (Companies and Intellectual Property Commission)
• The Department of Labour
• SEDA (Small Enterprise Development Agency), and
• SEFA (Small Enterprise Finance Agency)

The success of this intervention in engaging rural SMMEs needs to be evaluated and monitored to ensure effectiveness and sustainability.
6.4 THE DISABILITIES PROGRAMME

6.4.1 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

- The SETA’s head office has not facilitated this learnership since 2010. PWDs who are in the stores are apparently without any targeted support, even though they might be getting stipends from the SETA’s regional offices.
- The PWDs who participated in this learnership found it transformative, because it is often difficult for them to compete with able-bodied employees. As they had no previous exposure to corporate employment, they appreciated learning both technical (using teller machines, etc.) and soft skills (customer service, workplace etiquette, time management, etc.).
- They also enjoyed the sense of independence that comes with going to work and being able to contribute to the livelihood of one’s family.
- Overall they found their co-workers to not be sensitized to the needs of PWDs, subsequently some of their co-workers and departmental managers were not accommodative. For example, some PWD were made to sit or stand for so long that their legs would swell.
- For those who participated in the learnership without a matric certificate, it became difficult to be promoted to supervisory positions after the learnership.
- There are very few service providers who facilitate learning and development for PWDs.

6.4.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

- The lack of communication and public awareness about the SETA’s Disabilities Programmes is a limitation to their development and mainstreaming within the sector. The SETA must find proactive and innovative means to engage its stakeholders, and even the general public, in this regard in order to garner support for the Disabilities programmes currently implemented by the regional offices.
- As this is obviously an important intervention, the SETA must actively keep accurate records of the PWD whose stipends it pays through the regional offices. For example, how many are absorbed?
- The regional offices must engage organisations for PWDs to chart a way forward. What can the SETA do to assist them currently?
- As in the case of the student and graduate interns, the SETA must assist entrepreneurial PWDs to access the relevant skills training, mentoring, and incubation to be able to manage and grow their own businesses. Whether this includes assisting
with the provision of driving lessons, transport, or distribution outlets would differ from case to case. What is obvious is that PWDs will probably need more specialized support than their average counterparts.

- The SETA must help increase the number of accredited service providers who can facilitate the support that PWDs need to thrive and to participate in the economy as capacitated agents of transformation.

6.5 CONCLUSION

In closing, the W&RSETA’s intervention of awarding bursaries, stipends, and learnerships to educate beneficiaries contributes tremendously to increased levels of education. These interventions are transformative, because they increase numbers of qualified participants and attempts to level the playing field. However, it is currently not possible to provide accurate statistics in terms of the employment rates of the graduates. Neither is it possible to gauge the long term sustainability of the newly-established rural micro-enterprises.

Secondly, because all four programmes have been running for less than eight years, it might be unrealistic at present to expect large cohorts of black personnel at the top echelons, when it takes about 10 years to have a fully-fledged and experienced executive director, who can make truly influential decisions within the organisation. Nevertheless, the W&RSETA should insist that retailers create realistic enabling mechanisms targets that maximize opportunities for designated candidates, who demonstrate potential, to become middle managers and senior executives in the near future. It is evident from our findings that where there are successful black senior executives, retail graduates can realistically aspire to fully-fledged, sustainable, and fulfilling careers in the retail sector. This confirms the evidence from our literature review that tangible changes in the organisation’s management culture have a much more meaningful impact on the organization than skills development training and policies alone.

Similarly, the small businesses that the SETA has helped to establish can only thrive if retailers are willing to assist. For example, white exhibitors can help more rural entrepreneurs display at their expos and actively encourage sales by helping them with e-marketing and online sales. Bigger retailers can put them in their supplier chain and procure from them, so they can have secure target markets. More established local retailers can take them for experiential learning and mentoring. Industries can build factories and firms in rural communities and link the local small enterprises to their Enterprise Development programmes. All these interventions would need immense stakeholder engagement and a fair amount of co-ordination. This can only be achieved if the SETA consults widely, gets commitment from key stakeholders, and develops a
comprehensive communication strategy for its vision of transformation. There is also a need to share lessons learnt from the co-operatives has the SETA has established.

Significant areas that demand urgent attention, therefore, are (i) better co-ordination between the SETA’s head and regional offices, so as to decentralise the management of programmes in a manner that simplifies yet improves the efficiency of implementation; (ii) its ability to communicate its transformation agenda with all its stakeholders; (iii) exponentially increasing the number of participants in the Graduate Placement, Rural Development, and Disabilities programmes; and (iv) collaborating with other entities to ensure that qualifying participants who complete SETA-sponsored skills development qualifications do indeed become retailers. This will help them create jobs while retaining them and ensuring their optimal participation within the sector. The W & R sector needs to systematically increase the number of high-growth businesses that are owned by those who were previously excluded from meaningful economic activity (i.e. blacks, women, rural communities, and people with disabilities. Comprehensive strategies need to be developed for all the above to maximise the SETA’s role in transformation going forward.

In addition, the fifth area demanding urgent attention is monitoring and evaluation. Strengthening the implementation of the various W&RSETA programmes through strategic partnerships and the establishment of appropriate results-based monitoring and evaluation logical frames will increase efficiency and contribute a lot more robustly to the process of transformation.

Finally, to link all this to our research questions, it is clear that the role of the W&RSETA in transformation has been significant. Perceptions of the interviewed respondents show evidence that the thousands of persons trained in the various skills development programmes have been capacitated to achieve a job status that they would not otherwise have an opportunity to obtain. The difficulties with obtaining direct evidence of the significance of the role of the W&RSETA in transformation for now is that the programmes have not fully matured and sustainable transformation requires more than skills development to be achieved. Transformation requires the creation of an enabling socio-economic and political environment in addition to enabling education and skills development.

It is therefore imperative that the W&RSETA undertakes to engage the sector on how to transform cultural mindsets that are currently delaying change. In other words, the SETA must develop strategies in consultation with the relevant stakeholders on how best to make white males appreciate the benefits of a workforce that is truly diversified. Industry leaders must be challenged to come up with creative but implementable solutions and to commit to change the
playing fields if the programmes are to succeed. Clear career paths for black managers and diversity management training for white managers and senior executives are critical. Such training must ask the tough questions and deal with those race, privilege, and empowerment issues that are awkward and uncomfortable to confront. This means the facilitators need to be not only experienced and results-driven but also sensitive to the structural challenges while implementing the required change management processes. White male executives must not be rewarded for maintaining the status quo. We can no longer afford to have business as usual, yet expect a transformed retail sector.

Our desktop research found that the majority of corporate Boards have no women or black people in this sector. The few that had any only had one or two, which is far from being representative of the pool of suitable professional candidates. There is a fairly substantial cohort of highly qualified, experienced, and competent black and women chartered accountants, financial analyst, business strategists, lawyers, entrepreneurs, community builders, academics, human resources, and other practitioners who can add immense value to the transformation agenda if invited to these Boards. They can help monitor and evaluate from the top what progress the retail companies are making in developing and retaining a pool of qualified, talented, and passionate professionals or senior black executives in the sector.

The retail unions should also actively assist in monitoring the inclusion of PDIs on the retail corporate Boards. This is one of the important pillars of the BEE Codes on which retail corporates are intentionally refusing to entertain the national transformation agenda. Perhaps that is because many retailers, especially in the clothing and footwear category, do not need government tenders to succeed, and so are not strictly monitored for compliance. That is because many of the white-owned retail companies are so well-established and the barrier to entry into this market often so high, that their companies are guaranteed of sales from PDIs, even if they implement no changes. In light of the success that the recent student protests have had on forcing government and HEIs to review tertiary student funding, their management structures, and their labour broking practices, South African consumers might do well to follow suit, thus assisting the unions and the SETA to force the sector to transform. Organised peaceful stay-aways and protest marches must focus not only on salary increases for the masses of underpaid retail workers but also on demanding the implementation of concrete diversity enhancing plans and representativeness in senior management and executive structures.

Nevertheless, based on our findings, we can conclude that the W&RSETA has made, and continues to make, a contribution to the process of transformation in the wholesale and retail
trade. This contribution can be even more significant going forward if the impediments are removed, the limitations minimized, and the efforts doubled in all four programmes we have investigated. Skills Development and Training must be seen as the means to an end and not the end in itself.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


South Africa. 1997 The Integrated National Disability Strategy


APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

GRADUATE INTERN QUALITATIVE QUESTIONNAIRE

Working definition: Transformation here means giving those who were previously disadvantaged opportunities to improve the quality of their lives by participating meaningfully in the economy through the W&R sector (esp. women, blacks, disabled, and rural people).

1. How long were you in the W&RSETA’s graduate placement programme?

2. How did you find out about the placement opportunity?

3. What were your specific roles and responsibilities at work, and were they relevant to your qualification?

4. Did you have a mentor at work—this could be your supervisor or manager? If so, how often did you meet and how would you rate the assistance you got from your mentor regarding personal and/or career growth?

5. How did participating in the placement programme transform your life?

6. What was most rewarding about being an intern?

7. What was most challenging about being an intern?

8. What additional support can the SETA provide to overcome these challenges?

9. What do you think should be done to accelerate transformation in the W&R sector in general?

10. Where do you see yourself 5 years from now?
QUALITATIVE QUESTIONNAIRE for RURAL SKILLS TRAINING PROVIDERS

Working definition: Transformation here means giving those who were previously disadvantaged opportunities to improve the quality of their lives by participating meaningfully in the economy through the W&R sector (esp. women, blacks, disabled, and rural people).

1. How long have you been implementing the WRSETA’s Rural Development learnership?

2. Where did you see the tender advertised?

3. What are your specific roles and responsibilities with regards to transformation in/through this programme?

4. What are the common issues expressed by the rural learners during orientation?

5. Which of your programme’s initiatives have been MOST successful? How so?

6. Which have been LEAST successful? Why? What should be done to turn these around?

7. What do you consider the biggest challenges facing the rural development programme? Why?

8. What additional support can the SETA provide to overcome these challenges?

9. What are the main reasons for the reported rural learners’ drop-out?

10. Are there any disabled participants? If so, what are their disability and how has the programme accommodated them?

11. What changes have you implemented as a direct result of the feedback you received from the rural participants?

12. What changes have you implemented as a direct result of the feedback you received after submitting progress reports to the Rural Development manager at head office?

13. In your opinion, does the rural learnership programme adequately contribute to the training or educational needs of the individuals interested in participating in the retail sector?

14. In your opinion, has the rural development programme contributed significantly to the transformation of the participants and their ability to participate in the retail sector?

15. What is the way forward?
APPENDIX C

ETHICS CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE

Office of the Chairperson
Research Ethics Committee

Faculty: BUSINESS

At a meeting of the Research Ethics Committee on 25 March 2015, Ethics Approval was granted to Dr Sipokazi Koyana for research activities Related to the: WRLC(Wholesale & Retail Leadership Chair) within the RETAIL BUSINESS MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT, Business Faculty at the Cape Peninsula University of Technology.

Title of Project: Transformation: Evaluation of the role of W&RSETA in the last 10 years & the way forward

Supervisor: Prof RB Mason

Comments:

Decision: APPROVED

Signed: Chairperson Research Ethics Committee

25 March 2015

Clearance Certificate No. 2015 FBREC 260
APPENDIX D

LETTER OF INFORMATION AND INFORMED CONSENT

804 Sandton Emperor
8 West Road South
Sandton 2196

LETTER OF INFORMATION AND INFORMED CONSENT

The Role of the W&RSETA in Transformation

I am currently undertaking a research project on behalf of the Wholesale & Retail Leadership Chair at Cape Peninsula University of Technology. The study aims to

- Identify what impact W&RSETA interventions have had on transformation in the wholesale and retail sector in the past 10 years
- Evaluate the impact on transformation in terms of the success, or otherwise, of the interventions, in the W&R sector
- Suggest steps the W&RSETA needs to take to achieve an acceptable impact on transformation in the W&R sector.

Would you with other responses and only the overall or average information will be used. Your identity and individual answers will be kept totally confidential. If any quotations are used, these will remain anonymous. Should you wish to discuss this further please feel free to contact me on the number below, or the W&R Leadership Chair, Professor Roger Mason, on masonr@cput.ac.za or 031 460 3040.

By completing the questionnaire or being interviewed (whichever is relevant) you are confirming that the study has been adequately explained to you, that you understand that you may withdraw from it at any time without giving reasons, and that you are taking part voluntarily.

Your assistance will be much appreciated,

Yours faithfully,

Siphokazi Koyana

Cell: 072 6755 764
Siyazithanda.sk@gmail.com